IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

ELIEZER WILLIAMS, et al.,)			
Plaintiffs,)			
VS.)	No.	312	236
STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DELAINE EASTIN, State Superintendent Of Public Instruction, STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION, STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION,))))			
Defendants.)			
STATE OF CALIFORNIA,)			
Cross-Complainant,)			
vs.)			
SAN FRANCISCO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT, et al.,)			
Cross-Defendants.) _)			

DEPOSITION OF STEVEN V. MUZINICH San Francisco, California Monday, June 18, 2001

Reported by:
PATRICIA C. STEPHENS
CSR No. 10058
JOB No. 26294

IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO ELIEZER WILLIAMS, et al., Plaintiffs, No. 312 236 STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DELAINE EASTIN, State Superintendent DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION, STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION, Defendants. Cross-Complainant, 12 Cross-Complainant, SAN FRANCISCO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT, et al., Cross-Defendants. Deposition of STEVEN V. MUZINICH, taken on behalf of Defendant/Cross-Complainant Deginning at 9:51 a.m. and ending at 3:00 p.m., before PATRICIA C. STEPHENS, Certified Shorthand Reporter No. 10058.	Page 2 1 APPEARANCES (Cont'd.): 2 3 For West Contra Costa Unified School District: 4 ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO BY: MARLEEN L. SACKS 5 Attorney at Law The Atrium, Suite 200 6 5776 Stoneridge Mall Road Pleasanton, California 94588 7 510-227-9200 8 Also Present: 9 ANNE HUNTER HELENE SILVERBERG 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25
1 APPEARANCES: 2 For Plaintiffs Eliezer Williams, et al.: 4 MORRISON & FOERSTER, LLP BY: MATTHEW KREEGER 5 Attorney at Law 425 Market Street 6 San Francisco, California 94105 415-268-6621 7 For Plaintiffs Eliezer Williams, et al.: 8 AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERITIES UNION 9 BY: CATHERINE E. LHAMON Attorney at Law 10 1616 Beverly Boulevard Los Angeles, California 90026 11 213-977-9500 (No appearance.) 12 For Defendant/Cross-Complainant: 13 O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP 14 BY: JENNIFER VANSE Attorney at Law 15 400 South Hope Street Los Angeles, California 90071 16 213-430-6000 17 For Defendants Delaine Eastin, State Superintendent of Public Instruction; State Department of Education; State 18 Board of Education: 19 OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE 20 BY: THOMAS YANGER Attorney at Law 21 1300 1 Street, Suite 125 Sacramento, California 95814 22 916-324-2500 (No appearance.)	Page 3 1

Page 6 Page 8 1 San Francisco, California, Monday, June 18, 2001 1 A Yes. 2 2 Q When did you receive your master's? 9:51 a.m. - 3:00 p.m. 3 3 A I don't remember. 4 STEVEN V. MUZINICH. 4 O Okav. 5 having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified 5 A I did it at night. 1985, somewhere in there. 6 as follows: 6 Q When was your first job working as an educator? 7 7 A It was September of 1985. 8 8 **EXAMINATION** Q What was that job? 9 9 BY MR. KREEGER: A I was a teacher. 10 10 Q Good morning, Mr. Muzinich. Q Where were you a teacher? A West Contra Costa Unified School District. 11 A Good morning. 11 12 Q Could you state and spell your full name for the 12 O What did you teach? A Wood shop and math. 13 record. 13 14 14 Q At what grade level or levels? A First name is Steve, S-t-e-v-e, my middle name 15 is Vincent, V-i-n-c-e-n-t, and the last name is Muzinich, 15 A High school. 16 M-u-z-i-n-i-c-h. 16 Q How long did you hold that job? 17 Q Although we met off the record, my name is 17 A Five years. 18 Matthew Kreeger. I'm an attorney with Morrison 18 O What was your next job? 19 Forrester. I represent the plaintiffs in this case. 19 A High school teacher, suspension alternative 20 And you're here for the deposition. Have you 20 class. 21 ever given a deposition before? 21 Q Was that also at the high school in 22 A Yes. 22 West Contra Costa? 23 23 Q I'm going to just go over the ground rules A Yes. 24 briefly. I'm going to ask you a series of questions, and 24 Q By the way, which high school were you working you're to answer the questions. It's important that you at in '85? Page 7 Page 9 respond audibly because the court reporter here has A Gompers Continuation High School. 2 Q Was that also true in 1990, were you also at 2 difficulty transcribing gestures or grunts. 3 If at any time I ask a question that is unclear, 3 Gompers? A No -- yeah, 1985 through 1999. Then I started 4 please let me know, and I'll do my best to rephrase it. 4 5 At the end of the process there will be a 5 at Kennedy High School. 6 transcript prepared of what transpired here today, and 6 Q Okay. 7 A As a SAC teacher. 7 you have a chance to look over and ensure that it was 8 8 Q SAC being? 9 A Suspension alternative class. 9 Do you have any questions about what we're doing 10 10 Q Is that a class for kids with discipline today? 11 A No. 11 problems? 12 Q If at any point during the day you need a break, 12 A Yes. Q How long did you teach the suspension 13 please let me know, and we'll stop. 13 alternative class? 14 Are you ill or under medication or any other 15 reason that you can't give accurate testimony today? 15 A One year. 16 A No. 16 Q What did you do after that? 17 17 A I was a math and science teacher at North Campus O Okay. Can you briefly describe your educational background beginning with college. Continuation High School. 18 18 19 Q Is that also part of the West Contra Costa --19 A I graduated from U.C. Berkeley, and then I went 20 20 on to Hayward State to get my master's. A Um-hum, yes. Q When did you graduate from U.C. Berkeley? 21 21 Q Mr. Muzinich, if you could just let me finish 22 A August 1984. 22 the questions before you begin your answer, it will make 23 the record a lot cleaner. 23 Q What's your undergraduate degree? 24 24 The North Campus Continuation High School is A Sociology. 25 Q Is it a Master's of Education? 25 part of the West Contra Costa District?

Page 10 Page 12 1 A Yes. 1 Q And what aspects would you identify? 2 A Roofing, the glass block, painting, heating, 2 Q And how long did you teach at that school? skylights, roofing tiles, the field. 3 3 A One year. Q Is that the complete list that you can remember 4 O What about after that? 4 5 A I moved to DeAnza High School as a dean. 5 right now? 6 Q That was roughly 1992? A Yes. 6 7 A Um-hum, yes. 7 Q Again, at the time you took over as principal, 8 Q Is that -- is DeAnza also part of the 8 what were the issues surrounding roofing? 9 West Contra Costa? 9 10 10 Q Did the roof leak in more than one location at A Yes. the school? Q What are the job responsibilities of a dean? 11 11 12 A Student activities and discipline. 12 A Yes. 13 13 Q Approximately how many different locations were Q How long did you hold that job? 14 A Three years. 14 you experiencing leaking? 15 Q So up to roughly 1995? A Probably about six. 15 16 A Um-hum, that's correct. 16 MS. VANCE: Counsel, could I just clarify what 17 roofs are we talking about here? Are -- is there more 17 Q What job did you take in 1995? 18 A Vice principal of Helms Middle School. 18 than one roof at Helms? 19 19 THE WITNESS: Yes. Q Did you have a particular area of 20 responsibility? 20 BY MR. KREEGER: 21 21 Q What do you mean when you say there's more than A Yes. 22 22 Q What was that? one roof? 23 23 A Well, there's several buildings on the site. A Master scheduling, testing, student activities, 24 24 There's the main building, the gymnasium. There's some teacher evaluations. 25 portables. Q How long were you the vice principal at Helms? Page 11 Page 13 1 A Three and a quarter years. Q Were the leaks located in one, just one of those 1 2 Q So it was during the middle of the school year 2 buildings? 3 A The leaks were located in the gymnasium, the 400 that you changed jobs? 3 A November. 4 4 building, which is a separate building, and in the main 5 O Of 1998? 5 building. A Yes. 6 6 Q Is the 400 building a portable? 7 Q That's when you became the principal? 7 A No. 8 8 What functions are housed in the 400 building? 9 Q And you've held that position ever since? 9 A Art classes and our suspension alternative 10 10 class. 11 Q Who was the principal before you took on that 11 Q So you weren't experiencing leaking in any of 12 job? 12 the portables? 13 A Linda Lanere. 13 A Yes. Two of them. 14 Q How long had she been principal? 14 Q Which two portables experienced leaking? 15 A Approximately five years. 15 A 604 and 605. 16 Q At the time that you became principal of Helms 16 Q So is this a complete list of the leaking Middle School, how would you describe the state of the 17 buildings: The gymnasium, the main building, the 400 17 18 facilities at the school? 18 building and classroom 604 and 605? 19 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. 19 A That I recall. 20 MR. KREEGER: Well, I can rephrase the question. 20 Q And this is as of the time that you took over as 21 BY MR. KREEGER: 21 vice principal? 22 Q Do you -- at the time that you became principal 22

A Yes.

throughout?

O Was there a particular area within the main

building where the leaking occurred, or was it

23

24

25

at Helms Middle School, were there aspects of the

school's facilities that needed improvements?

24

25

A Yes.

Page 14 Page 16

- 1 A It was the office area, upstairs and a couple of 2 the hallways and a few classrooms.
- 3 Q When you refer to upstairs, what sort of functions were housed upstairs?
 - A Regular classrooms.
- 6 Q So when you said there were leaks upstairs, you 7 mean there were leaks in classrooms?
 - A In the hallways and in classrooms.
- 9 Q At the time that you came in as principal in
- 10 1998, was there a plan in place to address the issue of leaking, roof leaking? 11
- 12 A No.

5

8

- 13 Q Did you take any actions since you became
- 14 principal to try to address the problem of leaking roofs?
- 15 A Well, we have to refer that to the district's 16 maintenance and operations department, so that's
- 17 basically what I've done.
- 18 Q You informed the district of the problem?
- 19 A Um-hum.
- 20 Q Has any corrective action taken place since
- 21 you've became principal?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q What's happened?
- 24 A Umm, there's a new roof and skylights on the
- 25 gymnasium, and on the 400 building.

- 1 Q I'm referring to -- let me -- I'll start again.
- 2 Have any of the leaky roofs in the time that you
- 3 have been principal affected your school's ability to
- provide education to the students? 4
 - A No.

5

- 6 Q Why not?
- A Well, for example, the gymnasium, when the
- skylights were leaking, the district maintenance
- 9 operation came out and put a blue tarp over the
- 10 skylights, so that was a temporary fix. We did have some
- puddles in the gymnasium. We had tarps on the floor that 11
- 12 kids just worked around it. Most of the leaking in the
- 13 classroom came down like an interior wall.
- Q In your experience working as a teacher before 14
- 15 Helms, before you started working at Helms Middle School,
- 16 did you ever experience problem with leaking roofs at any
- 17 of the other schools?
- A Not that I recall. 18
- 19 Q You mentioned an issue, a facilities issue with
- 20 glass block?
- 21 A Yes.

25

- 22 Q First of all, what do you mean by glass block?
- 23 A Well, I'm not sure I described -- glass block,
- 24 little 4x4 glass squares.
 - Q How are they used at your school?

Page 15

- MR. KREEGER: I'm sorry, could you read the
- 2 answer back.
- 3 (Record read.)
- 4 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 5 Q And when was that new roof put in place?
- 6 A Approximately December of 2000. And then those
 - two -- the two portables, 604 and 605, also received a
- 8 new roof.

7

- 9 Q When did that take place?
- 10 A I'm not sure.
- 11 Q Has any corrective action taken place with
- respect to the leaks in the main building since you
- 13 became principal?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q Does the main building still leak?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q From the time that you've been principal at
- Helms, has the leaking roof affected your school's 18
- 19 ability to provide education to the students?
- 20 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. Also haven't
- 21 established which roof we're talking about.
- 22 MR. KREEGER: You can answer.
- 23 MS. SACKS: If you understand the question.
- 24 THE WITNESS: Which roofs are you referring to?
- 25 BY MR. KREEGER:

- A They're used in the hallways and in the -- in
- some classrooms. 2
- 3 Q They form a wall?
- 4 A A part of a wall. It would be enclosed like
- this window here and in part of a wall.
- 6 Q And what was the facility issue associated with the glass blocks? 7
- 8 A It was my understanding that the water leaks
 - into the glass block and then runs down the wall and then
- leaks onto the floors. Mainly in the hallways on the 10
- 11 first floor. And then on the second floor it was leaking
- 12 down into the -- on into the classrooms down the wall.
- 13 Q Has this issue with leaking in the glass blocks
- 14 been true for all the time that you have been there at
- 15 Helms?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Do you have a plan to deal with the issue of
- 18 leaky glass blocks?
- 19 A I report it to maintenance and operations. It
- 20 is my understanding now they received a critical hardship
- 21 grant from the State and that the funding is supposed to
- 22 be awarded in August of this year. It's my understanding
- 23 they're going to try to fix the roof and the glass block
- 24 with that grant.
- 25 Q Are the glass blocks only located in the main

Page 18 Page 20

- building? 1
- 2 A Yes.
- 3 Q So the hardship grant will allow the district to 4 fix both the glass blocks and the roof at the main
- 5 building?
- 6 A That's my understanding.
- 7 O What funding is it that you're waiting for
- 8 that's supposed to come in in August?
- 9 A Critical hardship case.
- 10 Q That's funding from the State?
- 11 A Yes.
- Q Does the school or the district have to provide 12
- funding as part of that? 13
- 14 A I believe they have to match it.
- Q Do you have any understanding about whether the 15
- 16 district is going to match the hardship funding from the
- 17 State?
- 18 A I believe they are.
- 19 Q Has there been any issue with mold or mildew at
- the school?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q And what issue is that?
- 23 A There's some mold and mildew in the classrooms.
- 24 Q How many classrooms are suffering from mold or
- 25 mildew?

- 1 A No.
- 2 Q Is there any plan in place to paint the
- classrooms?
- 4 A I believe they're going to do some painting this 5 summer.
- Q They being the district? 6
- 7 A Um-hum.
- 8 O When was the last time that the classrooms at
- 9 Helms Middle School were painted?
- 10 A The school was renovated in -- or most of it was
- renovated in, about 12 years ago, I believe, and so most 11 of the classrooms were painted then. And we did some 12
- painting this last April in the upstairs hall as part of 13
- our cleanup day, and we did some painting last April as
- part of the cleanup day, and I think the April before
- 16 that as part of the cleanup day.
- 17 Some classrooms have not -- were not renovated
- 18 in the renovations, and they haven't been painted in I'm 19 not sure how long.
- 20 Q Aside from painting what other work went into
- 21 the renovation 12 years ago?
- 22 A New drop ceilings in the classrooms, new heating
- 23 system. The chalkboards were removed and we have white
- 24 boards in most of the classrooms. Let's see, what else
- did they do now. I believe they put new floors in the

Page 19

- A I'm not sure. 1
- 2 Q How is it that this issue came to your 3 attention?
- 4 A I was notified by the teachers.
- 5 Q And what, if anything, has been done in response
- 6 to the teachers' concerns about mold or mildew?
- 7 A I reported it to maintenance and operations. I 8 believe they sent an outside contractor in to evaluate
- 9 the air samples.
- 10 Q What was the result of that evaluation?
- 11 A You would have to check with maintenance and operations. 12
- 13 Q You're not sure what they found?
- 14 A No.
- 15 Q Are you aware of any corrective action that's
- 16 been taken to address the issue of mold or mildew?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q Do you know what caused the mold or mildew?
- A I would venture to guess the leaking glass 19
- 20 block, roof.

21

- Q You mentioned painting is another facilities
- issue. What were you referring to? 22
- 23 A Well, the classrooms needed to be repainted when
- 24 we had the water damage.
- 25 Q Has that taken place?

1 classrooms.

2

5

- Q Is that all that you can remember?
- 3 A Well, I wasn't there at the time they did it.
- 4 Q Fair enough. You mentioned that when you took
 - over as principal there were issues with heating. What
- issues were those?
- 7 A Part of the building was renovated and we got the new heating system. And parts of the building are
- still on the old boiler system, so occasionally we would
- 10 have difficulty with those boilers.
- 11 Q Which classrooms -- first of all, start again.
- 12 Are there any classrooms that make use of the
- 13 old boiler system?
- 14 A The gymnasium is on the older boiler system.
- 15 The 400 building is on the old boiler system. The
- library and the offices are on the old boiler system.
- The cafeteria is on the old boiler system. And about 17
- 18 four other additional classrooms are on the boiler
- 19 system -- pardon me one minute.
- 20 The bathrooms were also renovated during that 21 time.
- 22 Q This is back 12 years ago?
- 23 A Yeah, approximately.
- 24 Q What sort of problems do you experience
- 25 involving the old boiler system?

Page 22 Page 24

- 1 A Sometimes they don't start up in the morning so
- 2 you don't have heat.
- 3 Q Are there occasions when the lack of heat
- 4 persists for the whole day?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q And the boilers don't start up and there's no
- heat. Does that affect all of those classrooms and areas
- that you mentioned that make use of the old boiler
- 9 system?
- 10 A There's two separate boiler systems. I believe
- one does the gymnasium and the 400 building, and then the 11
- 12 other one does the rest of the classrooms and the office
- 13 and the library.
- Q So it could be the case that one boiler system 14
- is working and the other is not? 15
- 16 A That's correct.
- Q Is there any plan in place to try and improve 17
- 18 the boiler system?
- 19 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 20 O How cold does it get in -- start again.
- 21 How cold can it get in the classrooms that don't
- 22 have access to heat?
- 23 A I'm not sure.
- 24 Q Have you reported to the district maintenance
- the problem with your heating?

- 1 O Where do those leak?
- 2 A In the hallways.
- 3 Q You mentioned a problem with tiles. I think you
- 4 said roofing tiles. Did you mean roof? 5
 - A Interior ceiling tiles.
- Q What are the problems with ceiling tiles? 6
- 7 A Some of them are missing, loose or broken.
 - Q How many tiles are missing, loose or broken?
- 9 A Oh, I don't know.
 - Q Are they throughout the school?
- 11 A I don't believe so. Mainly in the hallways that
- 12 weren't renovated.
- 13 Q These are the areas of the school that didn't 14 get the renovation 12 years ago?
 - A Correct.
- 16 Q That included some classrooms, did it not?
- 17 A Yes.

8

10

15

20

25

2

14

- 18 Q Are there missing, loose or broken ceiling tiles
- 19 in those classrooms that didn't get renovated?
 - A Yes.
- 21 Q Is there any plan in place to try to deal with
- 22 the issue of ceiling tiles?
- 23 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 24 O Have you had a problem with ceiling tiles
 - falling while the students are in class?

Page 23

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q What do you do on a day when the boiler isn't 3 working?
- 4 A I report it to the district's maintenance and 5 operations department.
- 6 Q Does the district send someone to help?
 - A Yes.
- 8 Q And sometimes they're able to get the boiler
- 9 started?

7

- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q I take it sometimes they're not?
- 12 A Yes.
- 13 Q You mentioned a problem with the skylights. Is
- 14 that also a problem of leaks occurring?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 O Where are the skylights that leak?
- 17 A Now there's just -- I believe they're just in
- 18 the main building now.
- 19 Q They used to be leaking, skylights in the 400
- 20 building?
- A In the gym and the 400 building. 21
- 22 Q And that got fixed last year?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q How many skylights in the main building leak?
- 25 A Maybe two.

- A Not that I'm aware of. 1
 - Q You said there were facilities issues associated
- 3 with the field. You mean the grass field where children
- 4 play? 5
 - A That's correct.
- 6 Q What issue or issues faced you with respect to 7 the field?
- 8 A Irrigation.
- 9 Q What do you mean?
- 10 A Lack of irrigation.
- 11 Q And did you take any action to deal with the
- problem with the field while you were principal? 12
- 13 A Yes.
 - Q What did you do?
- 15 A I've met with the City of San Pablo, and they
- 16 were going to renovate the field, provided they had
- access to it after school hours for soccer and things of 17
- 18 that nature.
- 19 Q And did that happen?
- 20 A It's -- well, I met with them a few months ago,
- 21 so I'm not exactly sure where it is in the process.
- 22 Q You're going to continue to try to get the City
- 23 to renovate the field?
- 24 A Yes.
- 25 Q But I take it as of now they haven't made any

Page 26 Page 28

- commitment to do so?
- 2 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 3 Q Have you had any problems with the bathrooms at 4 the school?
- 5 A In terms of what?
- 6 Q How many bathrooms are at the school?
- 7 A Well, let's see. There's a boys' and the girls'
- 8 downstairs in the first floor, a boys' and the girls'
- upstairs on the second floor. There's one in each of the 9
- locker rooms. There's one outside the cafeteria, one of
- each outside the cafeteria. Those are the major 11
- functioning ones I believe. There's some more bathrooms 12
- on the campus, but they haven't been used. 13
- 14 MR. KREEGER: I'm sorry, I lost track. Can you
- 15 read the answer back, please.
- 16 (Record read.)
- 17 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 18 Q If I counted right, you have four boys' and four
- girls' bathrooms that are functioning? 19
- 20 A Yeah, that's correct.
- 21 Q And you said there were others that are not
- 22 functioning?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q And how many bathrooms are there on campus that
- are not functioning?

- frequently does that take place?
- 2 A It varies.
- 3 O When a bathroom is locked for a reason of that 4 sort, how long does it stay locked?
- 5 A It depends on the nature of the problem. When
- 6 we had a fire, you know, maybe a couple of days. If the
- 7 kids flood the rest room, maybe a couple of hours. It
- 8 just depends upon what the nature of the problem is and
- 9 how long it takes to rectify that problem. 10
 - Q How regularly are the bathrooms cleaned?
- 11 A Every day, every night.
 - O Are there other occasions when you or someone at
- the school receives a complaint about the state of a 13
- 14 bathroom?

12

25

2

3

4

12

16

23

- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q And what is the procedure for that?
- 17 A Well, depending on the nature of the complaint,
- I take the appropriate action to rectify the problem. 18
- 19 Q How often would you say that you receive
- 20 complaints about the bathrooms?
- 21 A Maybe one or two a month.
- 22 Q Are they written down; are they recorded in some
- 23 way, the fact that there's been a complaint?
- 24 A No, they're not usually written.
 - Q Do you, yourself, visit the bathrooms that are

Page 27

- MS. VANCE: I'm going to object as vague as to 1
- 2 functioning. I don't think that's been described yet as 3 to what that means.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Well, they haven't been in use 5
- since I've been there. 6 BY MR. KREEGER:
 - Q And how many fall into that category?
- 8 A I think there's one of each additional.
- 9 Q And why is it that those particular bathrooms
- 10 have not been used?
- 11 A I don't know.
- 12 Q Are they locked so that the students can't gain
- entry? 13

7

- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q But you don't know why?
- 16 A I don't know why.
- O As to the four boys' and four girls' bathrooms 17
- 18 that are functioning, are they ever locked at any time?
- 19 A Sometimes.
- 20 Q And why are they locked?
- 21 A We've had a fire in the bathroom or a problem
- 22 with the toilets or kids flooding them or something of
- 23 that nature.
- 24 Q How frequently do those sorts of problems with
- 25 the bathrooms that require them to be locked, how

- used by the children?
 - A Occasionally.
 - Q Have you found them to be clean and sanitary?
 - A Most of the time.
- 5 Q When you do have issues with the bathrooms
- needing repair, how quickly are you able to repair the 7 issue?
- 8 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague as to issues.
- 9 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 10 Q I take it you said before the length of time it
- 11 takes to repair depends on the issue?
 - A That's correct.
- 13 Q Have you had complaints about the lack of
- 14 toilet paper in the bathrooms?
- 15 A Sometimes.
 - Q How often do you get those kinds of complaints?
- 17 A Umm, maybe once every two or three weeks.
- 18 Q What other kind of complaints do you receive
- 19 about the bathrooms?
- 20 A No soap, no paper towels, they're dirty.
- 21 Q Have people complained about the floors being
- 22 wet in the bathrooms?
 - A Not that I recall.
- 24 O Graffiti, has that been an issue in the
- 25 bathrooms?

Page 30 Page 32 1 A They are graffitied. 1 A I'm not -- I'm not sure. Maybe about 80. 2 Q By that you mean the walls are covered with 2 Q And is the covered snack bar area yet a third 3 3 graffiti? area? 4 A No -- well, usually if they're graffitied, we 4 A Yes, third area. 5 try to paint it out within 24 hours. 5 O And where is that located? 6 Q Have you had reports of liquor bottles being A It's located just outside the cafeteria. 6 7 7

found in bathrooms?

8 A Maybe one.

9 Q What about condoms?

10 A Not in the rest room.

11 Q Have you had problems with condoms elsewhere in

12 the school?

13 A I think I found two unused condoms in the six 14 years I've been there.

Q Those are ones you personally found? 15

16 A Yes.

Q Let me ask you about the cafeteria. How many 17 18 students can fit -- start again.

19 Does the cafeteria have seats where the students

20 can sit to eat?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And how many students can sit in the cafeteria?

23 A Approximately 225.

24 Q And I'm not clear how your master scheduling

works. How many students are eating lunch at one point

Q And roughly how many kids can sit down there?

A Probably about 60.

9 Q Is there anywhere elsewhere the kids can eat

10 lunch?

11 A There's places for them to sit outside on the

12 yard.

8

17

13 Q Do you have a problem with students waiting to -- have to wait a long time in line to get food in the 14

cafeteria? 15

16 A Yes, in the beginning of the year.

Q And how long might a student have to wait in

18 line at the beginning of the year in order to get food?

19 A Half an hour.

20 Q How long is the lunch period for students?

21 A Forty minutes.

22 Q Why is the problem worse at the beginning of the

23 year?

24 A Most of my students are free and reduced lunch,

so they have a number and they're assigned a number, and

Page 31

in time? 1

2

7

14

A About half the school.

3 Q And how big is your school?

4 A It's about 1,300 now.

5 Q So roughly 650 students are eating lunch at one

6 time?

A Correct.

8 Q So there's not space for everybody to sit in the

9 cafeteria?

10 A Not in the cafeteria. We have other locations.

11 Q Where else can students eat their lunch?

12 A There's a covered snack bar area outside the 13 cafeteria, and there's a covered lunch area outside.

Q What do you mean by covered lunch area?

A Well, there's a -- the main building is here 15

(indicating), and then there's -- the cafeteria starts 16

17 here. And the space in between those two buildings is

18 covered.

19 Q Is there anywhere to sit in the covered lunch

20 area?

21 A Yes.

22 Q Are there benches?

23 A Benches and tables, yes.

24 Q How many kids could sit down in the covered

25 lunch area?

they have to give that number to the cafeteria worker in 2 order to get their lunch.

3 So most students have not memorized that number 4 at the beginning of the year. So when they go through

the line, they have to look it up, pull it out of their 5

back pack and give it to the cashier, so they can enter

7 it. So once they memorize that number, then the line 8 moves more quickly. 9

Q And how -- after the school year is well

10 underway, how long might a student have to wait in line in order to get food? 11

12 A Twenty minutes.

13 Q Have you looked into whether the line could be 14 sped up somehow?

15 A Yes.

16 Q And what's the outcome of that?

17 A We would need an additional worker and an

18 additional computer to operate.

Q You have not been able to get that?

20 A No.

19

21 Q And why not?

22 A I'm not sure. You would have to check with the

23 district office.

24 O You asked the district for that additional

25 resource?

Page 34 Page 36 1 A I've inquired about it. 1 A Yes, I believe so. 2 Q What response have you gotten back? 2 O Is there a computer lab at Helms? 3 A Not possible. 3 A There's several of them. 4 Q Have you received any complaints from students 4 Q How many computer labs are there? 5 about not having a place to sit? 5 A Four. 6 6 Q Where are they located? A No. 7 7 O Have you received any complaints about the A One downstairs and three up. 8 physical condition of the cafeteria? 8 O When do the students use the computer labs? 9 A No. 9 A They go in with their teachers during class 10 10 Q Are there issues with the physical condition of time. Sometimes they're used before and after school or the cafeteria that you think need to be improved? 11 tutoring program. 11 O Are the computer labs otherwise locked when 12 A Maybe some new tables and chairs. 12 Q Is there something wrong with the existing 13 13 they're not being used by a specific class or for a 14 tables and chairs? 14 specific tutoring program? A Yes. A They're just old. 15 15 16 Q Let's talk a little about the library. Does 16 Q And they're locked because there's no adult 17 Helms Middle School have a library? supervision available? 17 18 A Yes. 18 A That's correct. 19 Q Does Helms Middle School share that library with 19 Q Have you considered making the computer labs another school? 20 accessible for greater periods of time? 21 21 A No. A No. 22 Q Why not? Q Is the library open only some days during the 22 23 week? 23 A Well, they're open before school, they're open 24 A Yes. 24 after school. They're available all day for student use. 25 Q Which days is it open? I'm not sure when else I would make them available. Page 35 Page 37 A It's open like two days the first semester and Q Maybe I misunderstood your answer. Are they 1 2 always available after school? 2 three days the next semester. 3 Q When the library is not open, is it locked and 3 A They are available when -- there's a tutoring 4 inaccessible to the students? 4 program that runs in one. There's what we call Webheads. 5 A It is locked. I'm not sure how you mean It's part of the after school program that students will 6 inaccessible to students. go in there and work on the Internet. 7 7 So if there's a specific program that involves Q When the library is closed, can the students get 8 8 the computers, they are available for students. in? 9 Q Are these before school and after school A If they're with their teacher, they can get in. 10 10 Walking in by themselves like at lunchtime, no. programs always going on, or is there a limited time? 11 Q Why is it that it's, the library is open only 11 A I'm not sure what you mean by limited time. 12 They have certain hours that they are in session. 12 some of the days? 13

13

A We only have a half-time librarian.

Q Have you looked into the possibility of obtaining a full-time librarian?

15

16 A That's something the district has looked into 17 for the last several years.

18 Q And what response have you gotten back from the 19 district?

20 A Well, it's been a case of funding.

O There's not enough funds for it?

22 A That's correct.

14

21

23 O So there's been a half-time librarian at Helms

24 as long as you have been there either as a vice principal

25 or principal; is that true? Q Is it every day?

14 A No. The Webheads I think is two days a week, 15 and then before school tutoring program is like four days 16 a week.

17 Q When those programs are taking place, can any 18 student come and make use of the computer?

A If they've signed up ahead of time. It's open 19 to all students, but they have to sign up prior to going 20 21 in.

22 Q Can students sign up for one day or do they have

23 to sign up for the whole program? 24 A Well, generally they would enroll in the

program, and then how long they elected to stay in the 25

Page 38 Page 40 program would be up to them. 1 parents? 2 MR. KREEGER: We've been going about an hour. 2 A I don't remember. 3 Do you want to take a five-minute break? 3 Q When people express concerns about safety in 4 MS. SACKS: That's fine. 4 rest rooms, what specifically are they concerned about? 5 (Brief break.) 5 A Their son or daughter's safety in the rest room. BY MR. KREEGER: 6 O Have there been instances where students have 6 7 7 Q You mentioned that you had leaks in the been harmed in the rest room? 8 gymnasium. Did you ever have leaks in the locker room? 8 A Yes, we've had altercations in the rest room. 9 A I don't remember. 9 Q What do you mean by altercations? 10 10 Q Do you ever remember any issue with water A Fight. 11 leaking into the students' lockers? 11 Q Do you have any security guards at the school? 12 A I don't remember. 12 A Yes. 13 Q Was there ever a situation where gym classes had 13 Q How many security guards are employed by the to be cancelled because of leaking roofs? 14 14 school? 15 A I'm not sure what you mean by cancelled. They 15 A I believe now there's four and a half. 16 might have had to, you know, adjust their playing area or 16 O That means at one time there's at least four maybe change a game that they were going to be playing. 17 security guards? 17 18 I'm not sure if they were cancelled. 18 A Um-hum. 19 Q And by adjust the area or change the game, that 19 Q Have you increased the number of security guards would be because certain areas of the gym were not usable 20 in your tenure as principal? 21 21 because they were wet? A No. 22 A Correct. 22 Q Do students report that they're afraid for 23 Q Had students ever been injured due to wet 23 their safety at school? 24 floors? 24 A Sometimes. 25 A I'm not sure. 25 Q Is there gang activity at Helms? Page 39 Page 41 Q Have you received complaints or concerns from A No, not very much. Very little. 1 parents or students about safety at Helms Middle School? 2 2 Q When there's an instance of students fighting, 3 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. 3 is a record kept of that activity? MR. KREEGER: You can answer. 4 4 A Yes. 5 MS. SACKS: Do you understand the question? 5 Q And how is that recorded? 6 THE WITNESS: Yes. 6 A Normally by the counselors, into the computer. 7 Yes. 7 Q Is that part of the disciplinary process or is 8 BY MR. KREEGER: 8 it reported in some other way? 9 Q What sorts of complaints or concerns have you 9 A No, it's part of the disciplinary process. 10 10 heard about safety? Q How frequently do you have incidences of 11 A Well, they would be concerned sometimes about 11 fighting at Helms Middle School? 12 safety in the rest rooms, students fighting, gangs. 12 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague as to what kind of 13 13

Q Roughly how many complaints have you received in your tenure as principal about safety issues?

A I'm not sure. 15

16 O A lot?

25

17 A No, not a lot. A few.

18 Q Less than ten complaints about safety issues?

19 A Well, it depends. Complaint, are you talking a

20 written complaint, are you talking a verbal complaint?

21 Are you talking from parents, from students?

22 Q Let's divide it up. How many written complaints

23 have you received from anybody regarding safety issues? 24

A Probably only a few, four or five probably.

Q What about verbal complaints or concerns from

fights, physical, verbal.

BY MR. KREEGER:

15 O How often are those instances of fighting that 16 you referred to that got reported on the computer, how

17 often are those entries made?

A I'm not sure. I don't make the entries.

19 O Fair enough.

Last year you had this rape incident at the

school; is that correct?

A Yes.

23 Q Read about that in the newspaper. 24

Did that incident take place during school

25 hours?

18

20

21

22

Page 42 Page 44 1 A No. 1 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. 2 Q It was after school? 2 MR. KREEGER: If you understand, you can 3 A After school. 3 answer. 4 Q But it took place at the school? 4 THE WITNESS: Sure. We have the floor site 5 A No. 5 supervisors, the vice principal and myself who go out on 6 Q Nearby the school? supervision. We have four counselors. They are the main 7 A Nearby the school. disciplinarians. They work with students in school 8 Q Helms students were involved in some way in the 8 safety. Teachers provide supervision outside of their 9 incident? 9 doors. 10 10 A Yes. We have some outside agencies that come on 11 Q Did you take any action after the rape to 11 campus, you know, to talk with students that may be 12 address security issues associated with that rape? 12 having difficulty with other students. 13 A Yes. BY MR. KREEGER: 13 14 Q What did you do? Q Just so we're clear, we've referred to security 14 A The district cleared the area. The incident 15 15 guards. Is that the same as site --16 happened at a creek behind Helms so that area was cleared 16 A Site supervisors, we call them. for greater visibility. Foliage in that area was cleared 17 O And you mentioned four counselors that also 17 18 for greater visibility. 18 patrol the school; is that right? 19 19 There was some holes in the fence that divided A They patrol occasionally, yes. 20 the school from this creek area. Those were also 20 O That isn't their only responsibility, obviously? 21 21 repaired. A No, no. 22 22 I also requested that one of the site Q How often are the counselors on patrol? supervisors to, you know, periodically walk that fenced 23 A They each probably go out like for one -- for 24 area to make sure that there were no other further holes 24 some part of the day. in the creek. And occasionally I will walk that area, as 25 Q And the site supervisors, are they always on Page 43 Page 45 well, to check for any holes or any broken locks or patrol? 2 anything of that sort, you know, that are in that fenced 2 A Um-hum, yes. 3 area. 3 MR. KREEGER: Can you mark this as Exhibit 1. 4 4 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit Number 1 Q How did the hole in the fence relate to this 5 5 was marked for identification incident in any way, or why do you connect it to the 6 incident? 6 by the court reporter.) BY MR. KREEGER: 7 A Well, the students were walking out in the 7 field, and then they saw this hole in the fence. And 8 Q I've -- Mr. Muzinich, I've handed to you a copy then they cut through that hole into the creek, and of what's been marked as Exhibit Number 1 and ask you to review the document and tell me if you recognize it. 10 10 that's where the incident occurred. 11 Q So, by plugging the hole, you expect to prevent 11 A Yes, I recognize it. 12 the students from walking from the school yard into the 12 O What is the document? 13 A It looks like it was the results of the air 13 creek? 14 A That's correct. There's also signs that are samples they had taken in -- the outside contractor had 15 15 taken in a number of classrooms. posted there, no trespassing signs, as well. 16 Q You're trying to keep students out of the creek 16 O This was the deal with the mold and mildew 17 17 issue? area? 18 A That's correct. 18 A Yes, yes. It's an unauthorized -- students know 19 Q And this indicates that they found levels of that they are not supposed to be in the creek area and 20 spores that may cause allergies? I'm reading from the 20 the creek. There are signs posted that it's against the law to trespass in that area, as well as they have been 21 bottom of the first page. 22 MS. VANCE: I'm going to object also to the 22 informed by the school that this creek is an unauthorized 23 extent the document states that and it will speak for 23

24

25

24

25

Q In general, what is the -- is there a system in

place to help protect students from violence at Helms?

itself. You can ask what the witness knows.

THE WITNESS: Yes, that's correct.

Page 46 Page 48 1 BY MR. KREEGER: 1 THE WITNESS: No. O Does that jive with your memory of what they 2 2 BY MR. KREEGER: 3 3 Q It's the same, roughly? found? A It depends on what school you're comparing it 4 A Yes. 4 5 Q And this particular classroom was in the main 5 to. Q Is there any of the schools that you worked at 6 building, right? 6 7 that you thought were in worse physical condition than A Yes. You're speaking of 225? 7 8 Q Right. That's where they took the samples, 8 Helms? 9 right? 9 MS. SACKS: Objection as to time, vague as to 10 10 time. A Yes. Q Is this the only instance in which air samples 11 THE WITNESS: Possibly Gompers. 11 12 have been screened at Helms Middle School to look for 12 BY MR. KREEGER: Q What about the other schools you worked at, did 13 mold? 13 you consider them, generally speaking, to be in better 14 A That I'm aware of. 14 15 Q Has anything been done do address this 15 condition? 16 particular issue in classroom 225? 16 MS. VANCE: Objection, compound. He's worked at A I've referred this -- this document has gone to 17 17 several schools. 18 the district maintenance and operations, so they're in 18 MS. SACKS: If you understand the question, you 19 charge of the corrective process. 19 can answer it. 20 Q And sitting here today, has any corrective 20 THE WITNESS: Yes. process taken place with respect to room 225? 21 21 BY MR. KREEGER: 22 22 A Not that I'm aware of. Q So you thought that Kennedy High School was in, 23 23 generally speaking, better physical condition than Helms? MS. SACKS: Can I take a break for just a 24 24 second? 25 25 Q And same with the North Campus Continuation High MR. KREEGER: Absolutely. Off the record. Page 47 Page 49

(Brief break.) BY MR. KREEGER: 2 3 Back on. 4 Q Did you have something you wanted to correct? 5 A I wanted to clarify. I haven't been in room 225 in the last several months, so I don't know what 6 corrective action the district has taken. 7 8 Q You mentioned earlier the issue with the glass 9 blocks. Are some of the glass blocks broken? 10 A Yes, a few. 11 Q Are there any sharp edges exposed on those 12 broken glass blocks? 13 A There could be, yes. 14 Q Have you had any complaints about dangerous 15 glass blocks? 16 A No. 17 Q You've worked at a few schools in the West

Contra Costa School district, right? 18 19 A Yes.

20 Q Would you say that Helms Middle School is in 21 worse physical shape than the other schools you worked 22 at?

23 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague.

24 MS. VANCE: Also calls for speculation.

25 MR. KREEGER: If you understand you can answer. School, better condition than Helms?

2 A Yes.

3 Q What about DeAnza High School, did you consider 4 that to be, generally speaking, in better physical

condition than Helms?

6 A I'm not sure.

Q You mentioned the grant that you're hoping will 7 improve the roof of the remaining buildings as part of

the Helms Middle School. Are there other initiatives

10 that you have in mind to improve the physical condition

11 at Helms Middle School?

12 A No.

13 There is some money, something they call MRAD money, that's being utilized to address some issues at 15 Helms that is not going to be the roof. It's going to be lighting, drinking fountains, things of that nature,

17 MRAD.

18

O And what is MRAD?

19 A I forget what the acronym stands for.

Q Generally speaking, what is it, what is --20

what's its function? 21

22 A I believe it was a bond issue to improve the 23 facilities. And those were, I believe, facilities having

24 to do with student use, like fields, drinking fountains,

things of that nature.

Page 50

Page 52

3

- 1 Q And how much money is Helms going to see from 2 the MRAD?
- 3 A I believe this year it's about \$33,000. I'm not
- 4 sure what the overall -- I don't remember what the
- 5 overall total is.
- 6 Q And that money has to be used on outdoor playing 7 fields and --
- 8 A I think so.
- Q -- things of that sort? 9
- 10 A Um-hum.
- O That's a restriction on the use of the funds 11
- 12 from the bond?
- 13 A I think so.
- Q Is there anything else, any other initiatives 14
- 15 that you are aware of to improve the physical condition
- 16 at Helms Middle School?
- 17 A That's all I can think of.
- 18 Q Okay. I think I read something in the newspaper
- about Measure M. Was that related at all to Helms Middle 19
- 20 School?
- 21 MS. VANCE: Objection, lacks foundation.
- 22 THE WITNESS: I believe the first go-round was
- 23 targeted towards the elementary schools.
- 24 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 25 Q As far as you know, Measure M funds aren't going

- 1 Q Is there some process to compare that physical
- 2 inventory to what's going to be needed?
 - A Yes.
- 4 Q And do you order additional textbooks if you're
- 5 going to need more textbooks than are present in the
- inventory? 6
- A Yes. 7
- 8 Q Have you run into a situation where you had,
- 9 despite of ordering additional textbooks, you still
- lacked all the textbooks that you need to achieve the 10 educational -- let me start again. 11
- Have you ever not had enough textbooks to 12
- accomplish your objectives? 13
- 14 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Depends how you define not enough 16 textbooks.
- 17 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 18 Q Well, I think you mentioned that there was a
- process of comparing what you had on hand to what you
- needed, right?
- 21 A Correct.
- 22 Q And how did you determine what you needed?
- 23 A Well, we usually determine what our losses were
- 24 from the years prior, so if kids lost textbooks, damaged
- them, didn't replace, we have looked and, say we had 200,

Page 51

- to find their way to Helms Middle School? 1
- 2 MS. VANCE: Objection, we still haven't
- 3 established that there is a Measure M.
- 4 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 5 Q Are you aware of something called Measure M?
- 6 A Yes.

7

- Q What is it?
- 8 A From my understanding I think it was another
- 9 bond passed for elementary schools.
- 10 Q As far as you know, it doesn't have any impact
- 11 on Helms Middle School?
- 12 A Not directly, no.
- 13 (Discussion off the record.)
- 14 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 15 Q In the time that you have been principal at
- 16 Helms, have you undertaken any effort to assess whether
- there have been adequate textbooks or instruction 17
- materials for students? 18
- 19 A Yes.
- Q What do you do in that regard? 20
- 21 A We have a textbook inventory that we take at the
- 22 end of every year.
- 23 Q That's all, basically, a physical count of all
- 24 the textbooks that you have available?
- 25 A That's correct.

- we lost 100, so we have to order another 100, too.
- 2 Q Well, so that will bring you up to the same
- 3 state each year that you were the previous year, correct? 4
 - A That's our first goal, yes.
- 5 Q Well, let's -- this year, for example, were
- there any teachers who felt they didn't have adequate 7
 - textbooks to accomplish their objectives for their classes?
- 9 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague, calls for 10 speculation as to what the teachers thought.
- 11 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 12 Q Did any of the teachers tell you that they
- 13 thought that they didn't have enough textbooks? 14
 - A No.

8

17

- 15 O You never got a complaint about lack of
- 16 textbooks from a teacher in your years at Helms?
 - A I'm not sure from teachers.
- 18 Q Had you received complaints about lack of
- 19 textbooks from other sources?
- 20 A Yes.
- 21 O From whom?
- 22 A Parents have complained about the lack of
- 23
- 24 Q And what have been the nature of the parent
- 25 complaints?

Page 54

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

3

4

5

7

8

9

14

20

Page 56

- 1 A Well, there's not a textbook for every kid to 2 take home.
- 3 Q Is that true, there isn't enough textbooks for 4 every kid to take one home?
 - A That's correct.
- 6 Q And why is it that there aren't enough textbooks 7 for every kid to take home?
 - A Lack of funds.
- 9 Q If you had the funds, would you purchase enough 10 textbooks so that every kid would be able to take one 11 home?
- 12 A Sure.

5

8

- 13 Q And how many classes is it true that there aren't enough textbooks for every student to take one 14 15 home?
- 16 A Probably most of the classes.
- 17 Q Are there any classes in which there aren't enough textbooks for every student to have one in class? 18
- 19 A I don't believe so.
- 20 Q You think that it's always true that there's
- 21 enough textbooks for every kid to have one in class,
- 22 right?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q You mentioned that if you had the funds you
- would purchase enough textbooks that, so every kid can

- those textbooks. And, two, these State standards are 2 relatively new. Our district has just adopted the 3 standards within the last year or so.
 - Q Were there previous standards that were in effect at the district level before these standards that came into effect last year?
 - A I wouldn't say they were standards, no.
 - Q There were State standards, though, before last year, right?
 - A Yeah, there were State standards, yes.
- 11 O Does the Helms textbooks -- start again.

Were the Helms textbooks aligned to the State standards as of last year?

- A Well, the State standards, the new ones have been in -- have been evolving for the last couple of years. So no, they would not be aligned from last year either.
- 18 Q Do you have a plan in place to bring the 19 textbooks so that they're -- start again.

20 Do you have a plan in place to purchase new 21 textbooks and instructional material so that they will be aligned to the district and State standard? 22

23 A Yes. The district is -- my understanding is the 24 district is adopting textbooks in math, science and social studies. It will be math, grades six through 25

Page 55

take one home. Why is that?

A I think it's beneficial for a student's 2 3 education to have access to the textbook at home as well 4 as at school.

5 Q Have you made any effort to analyze whether the 6 textbooks that Helms has meet the content standards that you think ought to be taught? 7

8 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. I don't know what you're referring to with content standards. 9

10 THE WITNESS: Are you talking about State 11 standards?

12 MR. KREEGER: It's a poor question. I'm not trying to get into the standards. 13

14 BY MR. KREEGER:

15 Q Have you undertaken any efforts to make sure 16 that textbooks have the content that should be taught for 17 the classes?

18 A Well, there are State standards. There are the 19 district's standards and benchmarks that we're all 20 supposed to be teaching to. Are the books aligned to

- 21 those standards?
- 22 Q Yes.
- A No. 23
- 24 Q And why not?
- 25 A One is insufficient funds so far to purchase

eight; science, grades six through -- no. Math -- I'm 1 2 sorry.

Math, grades six and seven, because they're really supposed to take algebra, and science, six through eight, and I believe social studies, six through eight. So they will be purchasing textbooks that would be aligned to State and district standards in those areas.

- Q And when will that purchasing take place?
- 10 A It's my understanding it's going to happen this summer, so they will be in place for next year. 11
- 12 Q And will Helms have new textbooks for all of its 13 students by the beginning of next year?
 - A That's my understanding.
- 15 Q At that point will you have enough textbooks so 16 every student can have one in class and take one home?
- 17 A That's my understanding.
- 18 Q And these new textbooks are going to be 19 purchased by the district?
 - A Yes.
- 21 Q Previously when you had to purchase new

22 textbooks, was that also done by the district?

23 MS. VANCE: Objection. What time frame are we 24 speaking of when you say previously?

BY MR. KREEGER:

Page 58 Page 60

1 Q Well, you mentioned that every year you would do 2 an inventory and purchase additional textbooks, correct?

A Well, textbooks are purchased two ways. The site is given a limited amount of funds to purchase textbooks, in my case mainly for replacement, as I indicated earlier.

And the district will purchase like an adoption, If they're adopting, like they will next year, science books for grade six through eight, they will go through an adoption process and purchase those books for the whole district.

Q Now, your understanding is that this new district purchase is going to be in math, science and social studies?

A That's correct. 15

16 Q Do you have other courses that require textbooks 17 at Helms?

18 A Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

19 Q I guess language arts would be an obvious one, 20 right?

21 A Yes and ESL.

22 Q And your understanding is the district isn't 23 going to be purchasing any additional books in those

24 areas?

4

6

7

8

9

12

19

25

25 A No, they are not. you were meeting with?

2 A Carolyn Slayter.

3 O Was the subject of the meeting to talk about 4 textbooks, or was there more to the meeting than just 5 that?

6

7

A There was more to the meeting than just that.

Q What else was on the agenda for that meeting?

A The parents had made a complaint to the school board; some parents filed a complaint to the school

9 10

board, so we were addressing those issues.

11 Q What else had the parents raised besides 12 textbooks?

13 A Textbooks was an issue. Whether the principal was qualified or not. I think bathrooms came up. There 15 was a number of issues that they raised.

16 Q Does the district have any policy about 17 availability of textbooks for students?

18 A I'm not sure.

19 Q Have any teachers or other school employees spent their own money, to your knowledge, to purchase 21 textbooks for kids?

22 A No.

23 Q Do you know how much Helms Middle School spends

24 per pupil on classroom supplies, including textbooks? 25

A No, not off the top of my head.

Page 59

2

4

5

6

7

9

18

21

Q At that point the Helms textbooks will be -- you will continue to use the textbooks you're using now in 2 3 those subjects?

A Yes. And I will -- my plan is to utilize the 5 site funds that I have, since I'm not going to be using those site funds to replace science, math and history textbooks, to then supplement the English textbooks or language arts textbooks.

Q Have your teachers had to limit the kind of 10 homework assignments they can give because the students 11 don't have textbooks to bring home?

A I'm not sure.

13 Q Have you made any complaints to the district 14 or -- well, start there.

15 Have you made any complaints to the district 16 about inadequate textbooks at Helms Middle School?

17 A The district is aware of the insufficient 18 textbooks.

Q And how do you know they're aware?

20 A I just had a meeting with my regional

21 superintendent on, with some several parents from Helms,

22 and she indicated at that meeting that there were

insufficient textbooks, not just at Helms but at other 23

24 schools in the district.

Q And who was this regional superintendent that

Q Okay. Fair enough.

You mentioned that in most classes there aren't enough textbooks for students to use one in class and take one home. Has this been true throughout your tenure at Helms?

A I'm sorry, could you restate what you said. MR. KREEGER: Why don't you just read it back.

8 (Record read.)

THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 BY MR. KREEGER:

11 Q Are there extra copies of the textbooks

12 available in the school library?

13

14 Q At this meeting where the parents and you were 15 present and the regional superintendent was present, what specifically did the parents -- what was their concern

17 about textbooks?

A There wasn't one for every kid to take home.

19 MS. VANCE: If I could just interject, when was 20 this meeting?

THE WITNESS: It was about a week ago.

22 MS. VANCE: Okay.

23 BY MR. KREEGER:

24 Q What was the response of the regional

25 superintendent, if any?

Page 62 Page 64

- 1 A As I recall, that we would be ordering, as I've 2 indicated earlier.
- 3 Q She responded that there was going to be 4 district ordering of new textbooks; is that right?
 - A Yes, I believe so.
- O Do you know how the district is funding the 6 7 purchase of those additional textbooks?
 - A No, I do not.
- 9 Q Okay. I want to change topics and talk a bit 10 about teacher credentialling. Some of the teachers at Helms are on emergency teaching credentials? 11
- 12 A That is correct.
- 13 Q That means they haven't yet qualified for a
- credential; is that right? 14
- A Yes. 15

5

8

- 16 Q How many of the Helms teachers are on emergency 17
- 18 A I'm not sure how many are on this year.
- 19 Q Are there also instances where the teacher is
 - not fully credentialled for the class that they are
- 21 teaching?
- 22 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. I don't know
- 23 exactly what we're referring to when you speak of
- 24 credential.

25

5

6

15

MR. KREEGER: Do you understand the question?

- 1 A Well, I think that the fully credentialled 2 teacher did necessary training and that makes him a more 3 qualified teacher for our students.
 - Q Why is it that you have had difficulty filling all of the positions at Helms?
- 6 MS. SACKS: To the extent that you know.
- 7 THE WITNESS: Lack of fully credentialled 8 teachers.

9 BY MR. KREEGER:

4

5

- 10 Q And do you know why you've had difficulty attracting fully credentialled teachers to take the 11 12 positions at Helms?
- MS. VANCE: Objection that I think that 13 mischaracterizes his testimony. 14 15
 - MR. KREEGER: If you understand the question.
- 16 THE WITNESS: The district is in charge of 17 teacher recruitment. The personnel office does all of
- the recruiting and then sends us, you know, the 18
- 19 applicants. So I'm not -- I'm not sure exactly why
- they're having difficulty recruiting qualified
- 21 applicants. It's not under my direct jurisdiction.
- BY MR. KREEGER: 22
- 23 Q Does the school have a say as to which
- 24 applicants are given the positions at the school, or is
 - that decision made by the district?

Page 63

- THE WITNESS: Are you talking about subject 1 2 matter competency?
- 3 MR. KREEGER: Yes. I guess so, yes. 4 BY MR. KREEGER:
 - Q What do you mean by subject matter competency?
 - A Well, the teaching credentials are issued by subject matter, science, math, social studies. In order
- 7 to qualify for an emergency credential, you have to show
- so many units in that area in order to, you know, to
- 10 teach in a long term in that particular area. I believe 11 that's the way it's done.
- 12 O Well, are there instances at Helms where a 13 teacher may have subject matter competency to one area 14 but yet is teaching in a different area?
 - A No. Not to my knowledge.
- 16 Q If a fully credentialled teacher was available, 17 would you prefer to use a fully credentialled teacher
- 18 than an emergency credentialled teacher?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 Q So the reason you don't have every position staffed by a fully credentialled teacher is that you
- 22 couldn't find somebody to fill the position?
- 23 A That is correct.
- 24 Q Why is it that you prefer to employ a fully
- 25 credentialled teacher?

- A No, it's made by the school and the district, I guess I should say. 2
- 3 Q The district provides you with a group of 4 applicants and you can just say yes or no?
 - A That's correct, in most instances.
- 6 Q And they just haven't been providing you with enough applicants to fill the positions; is that correct? 7
- 8

5

23

- Q And you're not sure why they've -- why that's 10 so?
- 11 A Well, I could only speculate.
- 12 O Has anybody at the district given you any
- explanation about why they're unable to provide you with 13 14 applicants?
- 15 A Well, there are some shortages in California of 16 certain credentialled teachers in certain areas. Our
- district is not particularly high-paying, so I would 17
- imagine those two things are a big, a big contributing 18
- 19 factor to why we're short applicants.
- Q Do you know whether Helms has a greater or 20 21 lessor shortage of qualified teachers than the other
- 22 schools in the district?
 - A I think our need is a little greater.
- 24 Q And do you have any sense about why Helms faces
- 25 a greater need than the other schools in the district?

Page 66 Page 68

- 1 A Probably because of its location in the inner
- 2 city or drawing students from the inner city.
- 3 Q And why would that give you -- cause Helms to 4 have a greater need for --
- 5 A I think some teachers are afraid of teaching in 6 a larger inner city environment, so they opt to move to 7 the more suburban schools in the district, so to speak.
- 8 Q When a teacher is temporarily absent from school, do you have a process for obtaining a substitute 9 teacher for that class? 10
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 O And how does that work?
- 13 A The teachers are supposed to call in to a
- central computerized sub finder and post their absence,
- and then the sub finder either finds a substitute or it 15
- 16 does not.
- 17 Q What happens if the computerized system finds a 18 substitute?
- 19 A Then they come to the school and substitute in 20
- 21 Q And what happens if the computer system does not
- 22 find a substitute?
- 23 A Then we cover it internally.
- 24 Q How do you cover it internally?
- 25 A Each teacher has a prep period or conference

- subject matter capability to be able to teach the class 2 effectively?
- 3 MS. VANCE: Objection, are we talking about a 4 long-term situation or a daily substitute basis?
- 5 MR. KREEGER: If you understand the question you 6 can answer.
 - THE WITNESS: Well, it depends upon what the situation is. You know, if a day-to-day sub -- you know,
- 9 they're qualified to be a substitute, I'm not sure if
- 10 they have the competency in the particular subject area.
- If it's a longer term situation, then we get 11
- 12 someone like an emergency credentialled sub who would in
- most cases, who would be qualified in that subject area. 13
- BY MR. KREEGER: 14
- 15 Q You mentioned that you took on the role of 16 principal in November of 1998, and that was in the middle 17 of the school year, right?
- 18 A I wouldn't say the middle. I would say the
- 19 beginning of the school year.
- 20 O But it wasn't the transition between school
- 21 years?

2

8

9

16

21

7

8

- 22 A Correct.
- 23 Q Do you know why it was that the previous
- 24 principal left?
- 25 A She was promoted.

Page 67

- period. So what we will do in that case is there's,
- 2 what, six teaching periods in the day. So we'll just
- find teachers that are off first period, second period,
- 4 third period, and use one of those teachers each period 5 to cover the class.
 - Q And how often does this occur that you have to use -- cover absences internally as you described?
- 8 A Probably three or four days a week. Actually, 9 maybe like four or five days a week.
- 10 Q Have you had instances where a teacher has left 11 in the middle of the school year and then been absent for the rest of year? 12
- 13 A Yes.

6

7

- Q What do you do in those instances? 14
- 15 A Umm, we try to find either a long-term sub to 16 take over the class or in some instances that's not
- possible, we will have one of our regular teachers take 17
- 18 that class during their conference period for the rest of 19 the year.
- 20 Q Have you had instances where there were a string 21 of temporary substitutes that took the place of a teacher 22 who left in the middle of the year?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q When you use substitutes to fill the spot of a
- 25 teacher who is absent, does the substitute also have the

- Q What was her new job? 1
 - A Area director.
- 3 Q And do you know why that happened during the 4 school year?
- 5 A I guess the other area director -- I can't
- recall if they left the district -- I can't recall who it 7
 - is now, if they left the district themselves or whatever.
 - Q How many vice principals are at Helms?
 - A One.
- 10 Q During the time that you have been the
- principal, how many teachers have left Helms? 11
- 12 A It varies from year to year. I've lost as many 13 as 20, you know, this year probably maybe around ten.
- 14 Q And how many teacher positions are there at 15 Helms?
 - A Approximately 60.
- O How did the turnover rate at Helms -- start 17 18 again.
- 19 How does the turnover rate at Helms compare to 20 the turnover rate at other schools?
 - MS. SACKS: To the extent that you know.
- 22 THE WITNESS: I don't know what the turnover
- 23 rate is at the other schools so I can't really answer
- 24 that question.
- BY MR. KREEGER:

Page 70 Page 72

- 1 Q Do you consider the turnover rate at Helms to be 2 high?
- 3 A Yes.
- 4 Q Have you done any analysis to try to figure out 5 why the turnover rate is high?
- A Umm, most of my teachers at Helms do not transfer to other schools in the district. They go outside the, of the district for a variety of reasons.
- 9 It could be change of job, marriage, change of districts, 10 you know, a whole host of reasons.
- 11 Q Would you prefer that the turnover rate were 12 lower?
- 13 A Yes.
- 14 Q Why is that?
- 15 A I think consistency helps in building a school
- 16 team, and if you're, you know, constantly changing staff,
- 17 you're constantly having to, you know, go back and
- 18 revisit your school level plan and goals, all that. So I
- 19 think if there was consistency in the staff, it would
- definitely help us achieve our goals of educating kids.
- Q Does the turnover rate affect the students?
- MS. VANCE: Objection, calls for speculation.
- THE WITNESS: Well, students change teachers
- 24 every year anyway, so I'm not sure what impact that would
- 25 have on them.

- 1 A Well, the -- basically, what I stated to you
- 2 earlier. You know, I did textbook inventory. You know,
- I mean most of those issues I was aware of, so it's
- 4 nothing new that the roofs were leaking, we were short
- 5 textbooks or anything of that nature, so I didn't.
- 6 Q The allegations didn't come as a surprise to 7 you?
- A Some of them did. You know, some of them did not. The fact that the rest rooms were regularly strewed
- 9 not. The fact that the rest rooms were regularly strewed 0 with condoms and liquor bottles came as a surprise to me,
- with condoms and riquor bottles came as a surprise to me,
- 11 yes. The fact that our roof leaks, no, that did not come
- 12 as a surprise to me.
- Q Other than the issue of the liquor bottles and condoms in the bathroom, is there anything else in the
- 15 Complaint that you were hearing about for the first time?
- MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. He doesn't have
- 17 the Complaint in front of him, and I think that's a
- 18 difficult question to answer.
- 19 MR. KREEGER: That's fair. I can show you the
- 20 Complaint after the next break.
- 21 BY MR. KREEGER:
 - Q The Complaint mentions particular students, for
- 23 example, Moisses Canel. Do you know Moisses?
 - A I know who he is.
- O He's a student at Helms?

Page 71

1 BY MR. KREEGER:

- Q How did you first hear about this lawsuit?
- 3 A I don't remember.
- 4 Q At some point it came to your attention?
- 5 A Yes.

2

- 6 Q What did you do when you -- well, start again.
- What -- did you take any action when you learned about the existence of this lawsuit?
- 9 A I'm sure that I would have called the district 10 office and referred it to our legal counsel.
- 11 Q Have you looked over any of the documents 12 associated with this lawsuit?
- 13 A Some of them.
- 14 Q What have you looked at?
- 15 A The complaints that were related to Helms about 16 the bathrooms, textbooks, things of that nature.
- Q Did you undertake any investigation about the complaints that related to Helms that were mentioned in
- the lawsuit?A I'm not sure what you mean by that.
- Q Did you try to figure out if the complaints that
- 22 were mentioned in the lawsuit that related to Helms were
- 23 true?
- 24 A Yes, I investigated.
- Q What did you find out?

1 A Yes.

22

24

2

14

21

- Q What about Eduardo Solano?
- 3 A I can't remember the rest of them. Some of
- 4 those students have moved on. I had -- I had written it
- 5 up one day who was who and where they were, but I can't
- 6 recall off the of top of my head about the rest of them.
- 7 Sorry.
- 8 Q That's fair. As far as you remember, were the
- 9 students that were mentioned in the Complaint, were they 10 actually Helms --
- 11 A They were actual Helms students. They may not
- 12 be there this year, but they were actually Helms
- 13 students, yes.
 - Q Have you seen a statement by June Tolbert?
- 15 A In regards to?
- 16 Q Helms, a statement associated with this lawsuit.
- 17 A I don't think so.
- 18 O Is Ms. Tolbert a teacher --
- 19 A She's a teacher there. I would have to see the
- 20 statement to answer that question.
 - Q All right. I won't ask.
- What about Randy Row, is he a teacher of yours?
- A Yeah, he's a teacher there.
- Q Do you know Sata Canel? I guess she's --
- 25 A Sarah Canel? Yes, I know her.

Page 74 Page 76 1 Q Moisses' mother? 1 Q What sort of discussions have you had? 2 2 A Just that we're -- I'm involved in this, you A Yes. 3 Q Is she an active parent at Helms? 3 know, lawsuit and, you know, that this is the case and 4 A Yes. 4 that's it. 5 Q And what about Julio Canel? That's Moisses' 5 Q Have you had any communications with any State 6 father? official in connection with this lawsuit? 6 7 A No. 7 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague as to State 8 8 O You don't know him? official. 9 A I know of him. I've met him a couple of times. 9 BY MR. KREEGER: I mainly deal with his wife, Sarah. 10 10 Q Anybody -- do you know -- can you answer the O Does she volunteer at Helms at times? 11 11 question? 12 A She comes to our what we call a coffee club. 12 A I'm not sure who you're speaking of. 13 It's like a parent meeting on Tuesday mornings. She Q Okay. Anybody associated with the State Board 13 comes to that. And she is paid to do some translating at 14 of Education? our school site counselor meetings, and she does some 15 A No. 15 16 translating of some letters from English to Spanish. 16 Q Or the State superintendent? 17 Q You mentioned one way in which you interact with 17 18 the district is that you refer facilities issues to the 18 Q Have you discussed this case with anyone, any district maintenance organization? 19 19 attorney representing the State? 20 A Um-hum. 20 A Yes. 21 21 Q Is there any other way in which the district O Who is that? 22 monitors or has responsibility over the facilities at 22 A Her name was -- I don't remember her name. 23 Helms? 23 Q And what did you discuss? 24 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. 24 MS. VANCE: Objection. 25 THE WITNESS: I'm not understanding the 25 THE WITNESS: That was a confidential summary Page 77 Page 75 question. that we had. 1 BY MR. KREEGER: 2 MR. KREEGER: Are you instructing? 2 3 MS. VANCE: I don't believe I can instruct. 3 Q Okay. Let me try a more specific question. 4 Other than reports that you provide to the 4 MS. SACKS: Well, it was -- I'll object. It was 5 district maintenance office, is there any other way in 5 a confidential settlement discussion. 6 which the district learns about the facilities conditions 6 THE WITNESS: There you go. 7 at Helms? 7 MR. KREEGER: Are you instructing the witness 8 8 not to answer? A I'm not sure. 9 9 The head custodian also makes out most of the MS. SACKS: Yes. 10 10 BY MR. KREEGER: work orders, so they could get -- they would -- but it's 11 the same process, so I'm not sure if that's any different 11 Q When did this meeting take place? 12 A Maybe a month or so ago. whether I make out the work order or he makes out the 13 Q And who was present? 13 work order. The district will still get that via 14 telephone call or via memo. 14 A Myself, the state attorney and Marlene. So I'm not sure if that clarifies that or not, 15 Q And how long did that meeting take place? 15 16 but they could get information that way. 16 MS. SACKS: Objection, relevance. Q That's all right. Thanks. 17 MR. KREEGER: You can answer. 17 A But it still comes from the site, so. 18 MS. SACKS: Objection, it was a confidential 18 settlement discussion. Instruct the witness not to 19 Q Does the district ever make any inspections 19 20 or -- start with just that. As far as you know, does the 20 answer. 21 21 district come and inspect the facility? MR. KREEGER: You're not going to let him say 22 22 how long the meeting was? A I'm not sure. 23 MS. SACKS: What's the relevance? 23 Q Have you had any discussions with teachers or other staff members about this lawsuit? 24 MR. KREEGER: Are you going to continue with the 24 25 A Not in depth. 25 instruction?

Page 78 Page 80

1 MS. SACKS: I'll continue unless you can explain 2 why that's a relevant question.

3 BY MR. KREEGER:

4 Q Okay. Have you given any signed statement to 5 anybody about -- in connection with this lawsuit?

A No.

6

7

8

15

Q Have you gathered any documents associated with the allegations in this lawsuit?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And to whom did you give those documents?

A Our law offices. 11

Q The district offices? 12

A No, where Marlene works. And the district 13

14 office, as well, got a copy.

MR. KREEGER: Off the record for a minute.

16 (Lunch break.)

17 BY MR. KREEGER:

18 O Good afternoon, Mr. Muzinich.

19 A Good afternoon.

20 MR. KREEGER: Let me try a couple documents

21 here.

5

6

7

8

9

15

22 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit Number 2

23 was marked for identification

24 by the court reporter.)

BY MR. KREEGER:

1 A Yes.

2 O Again, that's an issue that has been present at 3 Helms as long as you've been there, right?

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

18

19

4

Q So again, the allegations in paragraph 99 did not surprise you?

A Did not surprise me, no.

Q What about paragraph 100? There's some issues there with respect to the bathrooms.

A The -- well, the fact that the toilets often do not work in the school bathrooms, that surprised me.

12 The fact that the bathrooms are regularly 13 strewed with used condoms, cigarette butts and empty liquor bottles surprised me. 14

Most of the stalls in the boys' bathrooms are missing doors, that surprised me.

The fact that the bathrooms only rarely have soap, toilet paper, paper towels, well, there are some issues there.

20 O Let's take these one at a time. Is it true that 21 toilets often do not work in the school bathrooms at

22 Helms?

23 A No, not unless the students have plugged them up 24 with toilet paper or paper towels or something of that

25 nature.

Page 79

Q I've shown you what's been marked as Exhibit 2. 1 2

And the parties have stipulated that this voluminous

3 exhibit need not be attached to the transcript. That is 4 a copy of the First Amended Complaint in this action.

I would like to direct your attention to page 30 beginning at paragraph 98. There's four paragraphs that relate to Helms Middle School.

A Yes.

Q Do you see those?

10 A Um-hum.

11 Q We discussed earlier today your becoming aware

of the lawsuit and reviewing the allegations that have

13 been raised with respect to Helms. Are these the 14

allegations that you remember looking at?

A Not exactly, but similar.

16 Q And paragraph 98 involves the issue of

textbooks. And I take it that before -- the issue of 17

18 inadequate textbooks was something that you were well

19 aware of before this lawsuit was filed?

20

21 Q So these particular allegations in paragraph 98

22 did not surprise you, did they?

A No. 23

24 Q Paragraph 99 talks about ceiling tiles and roof 25

leakage.

Q Did that often happen that students plug up the 2 toilets?

3 A Sometimes, yes.

Q I take it you don't agree that the bathrooms

regularly are strewn with these items?

A No, no, not at all.

Q What about the missing doors, is it true that 7

8 most of the stalls in the boys' bathrooms are missing doors?

10 A No. Most the times the stalls are there. You

11 know, occasionally a door may, you know, may come off or

be torn off the hinges, but then we put in an order to

the district maintenance and operations department. 13

Usually it's probably a week or something to get that

fixed. But that's not a regular occurrence, nor is it

that most of the stalls in the boys' bathrooms are

17 missing doors.

18 Q What about having soap, toilet paper or paper 19 towels, is it --

20 A Well, soap, we've hung soap dispensers. They

have been regularly torn off. So a few months ago I 21

22 instructed the janitorial supervisors to use those small 23 airline soaps in the bathrooms because, one, they could

24 not be used to plug the toilets or flushed or something

of that nature. So we've gone to that to deal with the

Page 82 Page 84

1 soap issue.

8

9

11

17

2 As far as paper towels, there are hand dryers 3 installed in the main building rest rooms, so we don't put paper towels in those rest rooms because the kids use 4 5 it to back up the sinks and/or the toilets. You know, 6 they clog the drain with a paper towel, then turn the 7 water on to flood the sink and flood the rest room. So

Toilet paper, it could well be that they have 10 run out from time to time, although I've asked the custodial supervisor to check the rest rooms, you know, a couple of times during the day for soap and, you know,

12 toilet paper. But that's not to say that, you know, the 13 kids could have taken the toilet paper or the -- or the soap out or whatever the case may be. 15 16

that's why we have hand dryers in there.

Q Paragraph 101 deals with credentialling of teachers at Helms?

18 A Yes.

19 Q I take it from memory you don't know if these numbers are correct; is that correct?

21 A That is correct.

22 Q Are they approximately correct?

23 A I'm not even sure what area they are speaking

24 of. This is going to vary year to year, as well,

25 because, you know, we do a lot of hiring, as I indicated BY MR. KREEGER:

2 Q Mr. Muzinich, I've put in front of you a 3 document that's been marked as Exhibit 3. It contains 4 documents that were produced to us from the school

5 district --

6

7

8

20

22

25

2

4

A Um-hum.

O -- bearing Bates numbers at -- the little number in the corner there --

9 A Yes.

10 Q -- DTWC 464 through 509.

MS. VANCE: Counsel, would you also like to 11 stipulate as to not attaching a copy of these to the 12 extent that all parties have copies of what the district 13 14 has produced?

15 MR. KREEGER: This one I want to go ahead and 16 use because it's particular to Helms. I appreciate the 17 sentiment.

18 MS. VANCE: That's fine.

19 BY MR. KREEGER:

O Are you familiar with this document?

21 A Yes.

O What is it?

23 A This looks like the work orders that were

24 generated from Helms to the district office.

MS. VANCE: Are we just referring to the first

Page 83

earlier. So I really couldn't answer that question,

2 honestly.

3 Q Fair enough. Is it true that, of the

4 credentialled teachers, that most of them fewer than four

5 years' teaching experience? I take that back. That

6 isn't quite right. This statement is that of the 41

credentialled teachers, at one point in time 15 had fewer 7

than four years' experience. 8

A I really can't remember.

10 Q Again, the fact that Helms had a large number of 11 emergency credentialled teachers was something you were

aware of before the filing of this lawsuit?

13 A Yes.

9

14 MS. VANCE: Objection, mischaracterizes his 15 testimony. I don't think he testified of a large number of emergency credentialled teachers, you know.

17 BY MR. KREEGER:

18 Q This allegation in paragraph 101 didn't surprise you, did it? 19

20 A No.

21 MR. KREEGER: Okay. Let me ask you to mark one 22 more document, please.

23 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit Number 3

24 was marked for identification

25 by the court reporter.) document, the 464 numeric --

MS. SACKS: Pages --

3 MR. KREEGER: Let's actually break it down.

MS. SACKS: It looks like there's a series of

documents.

6 MR. KREEGER: I think there's some interspersed.

Let's take it a chunk at a time. 7

8 BY MR. KREEGER:

Q So if you look at 464 through 478, they appear 10 to be continuous documents that span page 1 through page 11 15; is that a report with which you're familiar?

A Well, I haven't seen it exactly, I don't 12

13 believe, in this form. But I'm familiar with the report,

14 ves.

18

19

21

15 Q And that document, pages 464 through 478, 16 consist of work orders that were generated from Helms?

17 A 464, I'm not sure where you're referring to.

MS. SACKS: The Bates stamped numbers on the side.

THE WITNESS: 464 to what? 20

MR. KREEGER: 478.

22 THE WITNESS: This looks like all -- these look

23 like work orders.

24 MS. SACKS: But have you ever seen this

25 computer-generated document before?

Page 86 Page 88 1 THE WITNESS: I've seen one of them. I'm not 1 MS. SACKS: 504? 2 2 sure if it's this exact one. I have seen a MR. KREEGER: Please. 3 3 THE WITNESS: Yes. computer-generated document from the District Office. I'm not sure if it's this exact one. BY MR. KREEGER: 5 BY MR. KREEGER: 5 Q Let me just ask you about how one reads this 6 Q But it had this same format? report, if you know. The top entry looks like -- the 7 task description is "water leaks in middle of gym"? A Similar to this, yes. 8 8 Q And these particular work orders relate to A Yes. Q "Boys' locker room in two spots, third hall, 9 Helms, at least appear to relate to Helms; is that right? 9 10 main building"? 10 A They appear to, yes. Q And then if you look at page 479, which is the 11 A That's correct. 11 12 12 next one --MS. VANCE: Objection. Have you asked the deponent whether or not he's actually seen this document? 13 A Yes. 13 14 BY MR. KREEGER: 14 Q -- it looks to be a single-page document that 15 Q Well, have you? again looks to be a work order associated with Helms. 15 Are you familiar with that document? 16 A I've seen one similar to this. I'm not sure if 16 A No. 17 I have seen this exact one. 17 18 O Okay. 18 Q But you're familiar with the format of the 19 A It wasn't put in by me. 19 report? 20 Q Have you seen this type, this form of document 20 A Yes. 21 21 before, the one that appears on 479? Q So in the task description, is that a 22 description of the work that needs to be performed? 22 A No. 23 O Same with 480? 23 A Right. 24 A That's true. 24 Q And then there's an entered date, due date or 25 date completion, I guess. I guess it's the third column; Q You're not familiar with that? Page 87 Page 89 A I haven't seen this in this particular form, no. do you see that? 1 2 2 A Yes. Q Okay. And then there starts a multi-page 3 document of -- looks to be the same form as the first one 3 O And there's a date of 2/16/00. Does that mean 4 we looked at? 4 that that's the date that this particular problem was 5 5 reported to the district? A Correct. Q 482 through 499? 6 A I'm not sure how they set that up. This obviously came out of the district office, so I'm not 7 A Correct. 7 exactly sure what those dates refer to. 8 Q Is that right? 8 9 A Up to 498. Q Okay. And I take it you're also not aware of Q It looks like 499. what the March 20th date refers to or do you know? 10 A Okay. 11 A No, I don't know.

6

10

11

12 Q And then I guess 500 is another form of document

13 that we have looked at. Are you familiar with that

14 document?

15

21

A I've seen the bottom.

16 Q What's the bottom?

17 A The work order request, I've seen that before.

18 I mean I've seen, you know, that document before.

19 Q Is that the kind of document you or someone at

20 Helms fills out in order to request work?

A Yes. Or it could be called in if it's an

22 emergency.

23 Q Let me direct your attention to page 504, which

24 looks to be another computer printout of work requests.

25 A Where is it?

O You mentioned earlier that there were times when 12 13 maintenance workers would put up temporary fixes to deal

with problems of roof leakage. 14

15 A Yes.

16 Q Did it sometimes take weeks to, for someone to

17 put up a temporary fix to solve the problem of a

particular leak? 18

23

19 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague. I'm not sure what

20 problems you're referring to.

21 THE WITNESS: Are you referring to the gym or --

22 BY MR. KREEGER:

Q I wasn't trying to limit it to one particular

24 area. I'm trying to get a sense of how long it would

take to have these temporary fixes put in place whenever

Page 90 Page 92

- you reported a leak issue that was present at Helms.
- 2 A Well, the tarping was on the gym skylights, so I 3 don't remember exactly how long it took them to do that.
- 4 Q Were there other kinds of temporary fixes that 5 were put in place besides that tarp over the gym?
- 6 A No, I think -- I think that's the only one that 7 had the temporary fix.
- 8 Q What about the leakage that occurred in the 9 classrooms or other areas in the main building? Were those leaks just, unrepaired and --10
- 11 A Well, like some of that was due to like the 12 glass block leaking, so.
 - Q So there was nothing you could do?
- A Nothing they could do about that. 14
- Q Okay. And other skylights that were leaking, 15
- was there any solution to those problems? 16
- 17 A No.

13

- 18 O Okay.
- 19 A Not that I'm aware of.
- 20 O Were there instances in which broken windows at
- 21 Helms were replaced with boards?
- 22 A Oh, yes.
- 23 MS. VANCE: Objection to the fact that we
- 24 haven't established there were any broken windows at
- 25 Helms.

- 1 MS. VANCE: Objection, calls for speculation.
- 2 BY MR. KREEGER:
 - Q -- repair?

3

7

10

- 4 A It was my understanding that the funding is
- 5 going to be coming through in August of this year.
- Q What's the basis of that understanding? 6
 - A I've spoken to the assistant superintendent
- 8 who's in charge of operations and maintenance.
- 9 O Who's that?
 - A Vince Kilmartin.
- Q When did speak to Mr. Kilmartin? 11
- 12 A I spoke to him a day or two ago.
- 13 Q At that point he told you that the money was
- 14 coming through?
- 15 A It was his understanding that the money was 16 coming through in August.
- 17 Q Has something happened recently to persuade him
- 18 that the money was going to be coming through? 19 MS. VANCE: Objection, vague and calls for
- 20 speculation.
- 21 MR. KREEGER: If you know.
- 22 THE WITNESS: It's my understanding that we were
- 23 applying for the critical hardship case and that the
- 24 funding was going to be released in August. 25
 - MR. KREEGER: Mark this one, please.

Page 91

2

7

20

BY MR. KREEGER:

- O And how often would there be broken windows that 2 3 were replaced with boards at Helms?
- 4 A Most of the time.
- 5 Q And why were boards used?
- 6 A It was my understanding that the glaze has
- asbestos in it so that the district -- the district 7
- 8 maintenance, district glaziers are unable to take out the
- 9 glazes because they need abatement removal.
- 10 Q And there wasn't sufficient funds for abatement?
- 11 A That I don't know.
- 12 Q How many of -- sitting here today, how many of
- Helms' windows are boarded up? 13
- 14 A I'm not sure, but there's quite a few.
- 15 Q Would you say more than 20?
- 16 A Probably in that neighborhood, I'm guessing. I
- haven't walked the school and counted the boarded 17
- windows, but there are -- there are, you know, a fair 18
- 19 number of them.
- 20 Q You mentioned about the roof that there had been
- 21 approval of a critical hardship fund to help rebuild the
- 22 roof?
- 23 A Um-hum.
- 24 Q Do you know whether or not the State is going to
- 25 come through with that funding for that --

- 1 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit Number 4
 - was marked for identification
- 3 by the court reporter.)
- 4 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 5 Q Are you familiar with the document that's been
- 6 marked as Exhibit 4?
 - A Vaguely.
- 8 MS. SACKS: Have you ever seen this document
- before, to your knowledge?
- 10 THE WITNESS: I think I've just seen it once.
- 11 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 12 Q Do you know who Gale Associates is?
- 13 A I believe it was, I think, an architectural firm
- 14 that did a study at Helms.
- 15 Q You mentioned that one of the projects that you
- 16 hope -- start again.
- 17 You mentioned one of the projects that was in
- the works was to repair the water fountains. Are the 18
- 19 water fountains currently not functioning?
 - A I think most of them are functioning now.
- 21 Q You talked about complaints about the bathrooms
- 22 that you've received over time. Have you ever heard from
- 23 students who told you that they, that they choose to hold
- 24 it in and not use the bathroom because of -- the whole
- school day because they're dissatisfied with the

Page 94 Page 96

- 1 bathrooms?
- 2 A I've heard that a time or two, yes.
- Q Did you -- you may have mentioned this. The
 parents that met with you and the regional
- superintendent, did they raise bathrooms as an issue withrespect to --
- A I was -- it was a four-hour conversation. I think they did.
- 9 Q Okay. And the other subjects we talked about 10 that they raised with the regional superintendent 11 included textbooks and facilities issues?
- 12 A Yes
- Q I think you mentioned something that I wanted to follow up on which had to do with the qualifications for the principal?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q They raised a separate question about your 18 qualifications?
- 19 A Yes.
- Q What was their concern?
- 21 A They questioned whether I was qualified to be a
- 22 principal.
- Q And what was the -- what was the source? Why were they questioning that?
- 25 A I don't know.

- 1 Q Hi.
- 2 A Hi.
- Q I'm Jennifer Vance. I represent the State of
 California from O'Melveny and Myers. And I have just a
- 5 few questions to follow up with what you talked about
- 6 this morning. And to the extent that I'm off on
- 7 something you may have testified to, please feel free to 8 correct me.
- 9 I think you mentioned earlier about there were 10 some problems with leaking on the roofs in various 11 buildings at Helms?
 - A Yes.

12

24

- 13 Q How often did leaking occur?
- 14 A Oh, probably almost every time we had a good 15 rain.
- 16 Q And how often is that?
- 17 A Oh, I don't know, I'm not sure. I mean some 18 winters we didn't have much rain, we had a drought. And
- 19 some winters it poured. But pretty much every time we
- 20 had a, you know, a fair -- you know, if it sprinkled or
- 21 showered, it may not necessarily leak. But if we had a
 - 2 good rain, in most instances we would have leaks, yes.
- Q Was it limited to the winter season?
 - A Yes. We don't get much rain outside of the
 - 5 winter season.

Page 95

- Q Okay. Did you have a response?
- 2 A Yes.

1

- 3 Q What was your response?
- 4 A That I have a master's degree in education and a
- valid California administrative credential that allows meto be an administrator in any K-12 school.
- 7 MR. KREEGER: Off the record a minute.
- 8 (Brief break.)
- 9 BY MR. KREEGER:
- Back on the record.
- 11 Q You mentioned Mr. Kilmartin at the district.
- 12 Did you know that he gave a presentation to some parents
- 13 at Helms a couple weeks ago?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q At that presentation he expressed skepticism
- about whether this money was going to come through for the roof repair, didn't he?
- 18 A I was not at that meeting. I cannot answer that
- 19 question.
- MR. KREEGER: That's all I have. Thank you for your time.
- THE WITNESS: Sure. 23
- 24 EXAMINATION
- 25 BY MS. VANCE:

- 1 Q And what was the extent of the leaking in the
- 2 gym? Was that -- was the gym the worse building for
- 3 leaks?
 - A Not necessarily, no.
 - Q Were there any of the buildings that had what
- you would characterize as a greater problem with leaking
- 7 than others?
- 8 A Well, the glass block leaking probably created 9 one of the greatest hazards because it was leaking onto
- one of the greatest hazards because it was leaking onto
 the hallway floors. The water would, I believe, run down
- $11\ \ \,$ the glass block and then run down the hallway floors.
- 12 That did not happen every time it rained. That
- 13 would happen, depending on which direction the rain was
- 14 coming from and the wind. But when that happened, yes,
- 15 there would be water in a number of the hallway floors.
- 16 Q So say, for example, this past winter, how many 17 times were the hallways affected by the rain with
- 18 leaking?
- 19 A I couldn't -- I don't know. I couldn't -- I
- 20 couldn't tell you.
- 21 Q That's fair. Did leaking ever disrupt classes?
- MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague.
- MS. VANCE: Do you understand what I mean by
- 24 that?
- THE WITNESS: Yes.

Page 98 Page 100

1 MS. VANCE: Okay.

2 THE WITNESS: Most of the leaking that occurred 3 in the classroom, as I said, ran down the walls. There 4 was some leaking in the SAC classroom that, you know, 5 leaked on, you know, more into the classroom per se.

There was leaking in the halls. There was some leaking 7 like in the faculty room and in the counselors' office 8 and things of that nature.

9 MS. SACKS: Listen to her question. Her 10 question was did it ever disrupt classes? 11

THE WITNESS: I don't know. The SAC class, I would say no, not that I'm aware of.

BY MS. VANCE: 13

12

14 Q Did it ever disrupt a gym class? Was there ever a time a gym class could not happen or occur because of 15 16 leaking?

17 A Well, there were leaks in the gym. I'm not exactly sure how the instructors compensated for that. I know they would have to compensate for that, but I'm not 19 20 sure exactly how they did that.

21 Q I think you testified earlier that you thought 22 that sometimes they might modify their schedules?

23

24 Q For the SAC classroom what kind of disruption 25 occurred there?

at Helms?

9

10

14

17

2

4

9

2 A Yes, it is in certain areas.

3 Q And is this something that you were concerned of before the study that I think we mentioned earlier 4 5 occurred?

6 A Yes, I was aware that some teachers were 7 suffering from -- a few teachers were suffering from 8 allergies.

Q And how were those issues addressed? MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague, go ahead.

THE WITNESS: Well, I think that's what brought 11 12 about the study at the school.

BY MS. VANCE: 13

Q Do you know if that study was something the district did on its own, or was there someone at Helms 15 16 who approached the district to conduct that study or have that study done?

18 MS. SACKS: Objection, compound, but you can 19 answer.

20 THE WITNESS: I think one of the teachers 21 complained and that's sort of what sparked the study. BY MS. VANCE: 22

23 Q Okay. The parts of Helms that are still heated 24 by the old boilers, how often would you say you have

problems with those?

Page 99

A Well, they would have to move the kids out of 1 2 the area that was -- that had -- that was affected by the 3 leak.

Q Were there other areas where they could move at the school site?

A Well, the SAC class, they could move internally, depending on the number of students in the class, or we could move them to another room.

Q Was there ever an occasion that you're aware of that there was not another room available to move them into?

A No.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

18

19

20

21

25

Q And I think you testified that when you became principal there was no plan in place to address the leaks that occurred at Helms; is that correct?

16 A Well, there was no plan that I put into place. The district office might have had a plan. 17

Q While you were vice principal at Helms, how -did you observe how the principal before you dealt with leaking problems or with roofing problems?

A Pretty much the same way that I dealt with them.

22 Q Okay. Do you know if she ever spoke to the

23 district about forming a plan to address the problems? 24

A That I don't know.

Q Do you consider mold and mildew to be a problem

A It varies.

Q Do you have an estimate?

3 A Umm, no, not really.

Q And is this something that the school reports to

the district?

6 A Yes.

7 Q Do you know about how many times the district is not able to repair it within that same day? 8

10 Q You talked about the field and that there's a lack of irrigation. What exactly does that problem --11 12 what exactly -- let me just rephrase that.

13 What kind of problems does that cause for the 14 field?

15 A We have a dry field.

Q Does that hinder the students from using it? 16

17

18 Q Do you know what additional uses you could make 19 of the field if it was irrigated?

20

21 Q Any other problems with the field besides the

22 lack of irrigation? 23

A They have a problem with gophers and holes.

Q Is that something that the district fixes or 24

25 addresses?

Page 102 Page 104

- 1 A Yeah, that would be the district office.
- 2 Q When students eat lunch, are there ever any 3 students who are not able to sit down and eat their

4 lunch?

5

- A No, I don't think so.
- 6 Q Have you ever heard any other -- had anyone 7 complain, any students complain that they couldn't sit

8 down and eat their lunch?

- 9 A They complain that like at the beginning of the 10 year that they may be late getting to class because the 11 line is so long. They still are able to sit and eat.
- 12 Q And the long lines, those occur during the beginning of the semester? 13
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q About how long I guess does it usually take
- 16 students to memorize their numbers and have the line start going faster? 17
- 18 A Probably a good three weeks, three to four weeks 19 probably.
- 20 O You mentioned that the computer labs are used
- 21 for tutoring programs and then a program called Webheads?
- 22
- 23 Q Anything else that they're used for?
- 24 A Well, they're used throughout the day by
- 25 teachers.

use the computer lab?

- 2 A We have -- we've had a -- I think we've had
- 3 English in the past, but not this year.
 - Q And what are the Webheads?
 - A That's a group of students who meet after school
- as part of the after-school program. And they work on 6
- like Internet -- not Internet, what do you call that?
- 8 What do you call when you make like a web page? They
- 9 make -- like we have our Helms web page, they design

10 that.

4

5

- 11 Q I think that's what it's called, web page.
- 12 A Web page design, yes.
- Q So this is something extracurricular that they 13
- 14 went to be a part of?
 - A Yes.
- 16 Q Have you ever had any complaint from students that they couldn't use the computer lab when they wanted 17
- 18 to?

15

20

- 19 A No, I don't believe so.
 - Q How about any complaint from parents?
- 21
- 22 Q Does Helms keep reports of student injuries?
- 23 A Yes.
- 24 Q Have you ever had a report of a student injured
 - because of water leaking, water in the gym or any other

Page 103

- Q Are there specific computer classes at Helms like a class on computers that would meet in the computer 2 3 classroom?
- 4 A No, we don't have one this year. We had them in 5 the past but not this year.
- 6 Q Do you know if that's something you're going to 7 add to your schedule again in the future, or is it 8 iust --
- 9 A I don't believe it's slated for the next coming 10
- 11 Q What does the tutoring program involve in the computer lab?
- 13 A It's a math tutorial.
- 14 O Is that for all of the math classes?
- 15 A It's for students who seek the additional help.
- 16 O Does it use special software?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q Do students have access to that software at 18
- 19 other times during school?
- 20 A That I don't know.
- 21 Q Like are there disks that they can take home to
- 22 use on computers or anything of that nature?
- 23 A If they had a computer at home, I believe they 24 can do it at home, yes.
- 25 Q Any other tutoring areas outside of math that

area?

- 2 A That -- there may well be, but I'm not the one
- who takes those reports. It's done by the counselors, so
- there's a possibility that that's true. I mean I sign
- 5 them, but I can't remember. I've seen a lot of them.
- 6 Q So the student injury reports aren't something that you specifically look at or? 7
- 8 A Well, I don't generate them, you know.
- 9 Q Okay.
- 10 A So I do sign them, but.
- 11 Q You mentioned that there have been some safety
- concerns about the rest rooms. Were those safety issues
- related to the facilities and conditions in the rest room
- or student activity in the rest room or neither and it's
- 15 something else?
- 16 MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague, compound. Go 17 ahead.
- 18 THE WITNESS: Probably both. You mentioned the
- issues of students and fighting and that sort of thing in
- 20 the rest room. And of course you're going to have safety
- 21 issues if the kid sets the rest room on fire or floods
- 22 the sink and there's water on the floor. So you're going
- 23 to have issues there.
- 24 BY MS. VANCE:
- 25 Q But are there any issues that you're aware of

Page 106 Page 108

- that were not somehow related to a student either doing
- 2 something to the rest room or student activity in the
- 3 rest room, whether it was student created, flooding or students fighting?
- 5
 - MR. KREEGER: Objection, sorry.
- 6 MS. VANCE: Go ahead.
- 7 MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague, go ahead.
- 8 THE WITNESS: I'm not sure if I understand your 9 question.
- 10 BY MS. VANCE:
- 11 Q Okay. Are you aware of any safety concerns from
- 12 the conditions in the rest room alone, just -- I don't
- 13 know, sharp object or something that's in the rest room
- 14 that --
- A You mean that wasn't -- a condition that wasn't 15 16 created by a student?
- Q Yes. 17
- 18 A You mean like the sinks falling off the wall or
- 19 something of that nature?
- 20 Q Right, exactly.
- 21 A Any safety, no, I don't believe so.
- 22 Q For the first exhibit that we used in here, the
- 23 mold study, do you have any recollection of what that
- 24 study found independent of that document?
- 25 A No.

blocks?

3

8

10

- 2 A Not that I'm aware of.
 - Q Does Helms have regular parent meetings?
- 4 A We have a parent meeting about once a month.
- 5 It's for parents that meet. And then on Tuesdays we have
- a coffee club that meets fairly regularly, as well as a
- 7 gardening club.
 - Q Any other meetings?
- A For parents? 9
 - Q Yes.
- 11 A I think that's all I can recall. Well,
- 12 there's -- that's not necessarily for parents. I think
- that's it. 13
- 14 Q For the parent meeting that meets once a month,
- 15 what types of issues are addressed?
- 16 A It varies. We talked last -- couple times ago
- 17 we talked about high school exit exam. We talked about
- 18 Star 9 testing.
- 19 On one of the last meetings we had I invited one
- 20 of the assistant principals at Richmond High to come over
- 21 since most of my eighth-graders are going to Richmond
- High, so they could have an overview of the school, 22
- 23 things of that nature.
- 24 Q Do you always attend these meetings, the
 - once-a-month meetings?

Page 107

Page 109

- 2 that document with anyone?
- 3 A If I did, it was only in passing and very
- 4 briefly. 5 Q Did anyone from the district discuss it with

Q Did you discuss the findings that are listed in

6 you?

1

7

- A Just briefly.
- 8 Q And what was that discussion just, in general,
- 9 if you can recall?
- 10 A I just mentioned it to Mr. Kilmartin I had a
- 11 teacher complaint.
- 12 Q The glass blocks that are at the school, have
- 13 you ever seen any sharp edges on the blocks?
- 14 A Yeah, there could be some.
- 15 Q Have you ever seen any?
- 16 A Yeah.
- Q And where were those? 17
- 18 A There's one down on the main hall. One of
- 19 the -- couple of glass blocks are cracked or broken.
- 20 Q And were they repaired?
- 21 A No.
- 22 Q Is there anything to prevent students from
- 23 getting injured on them?
- 24 A No.
- 25 Q Have there been any students injured on those

- A Most of the time.
- 2 Q If you don't attend, does someone from Helms
- 3 attend in your place?
- 4 A Yes.

7

- 5 Q Do parents ever make suggestions about the
- 6 school or how to improve it?
 - A Yes, sometimes.
- 8 Q What do you do when they make suggestions?
- A Well, I take them under consideration and then,
- 10 you know, depending on the suggestions, you know, I take
- 11 what steps I can to implement it.
- 12 Q Do you ever pass the suggestions on to the
- 13 district?
- 14 A Umm. Well, the parents may have complained
- 15 about the lack of textbooks. Well (indicating), the
- district is already well aware of that fact. I'm well
- 17 aware of that fact, you know, But in answer to the
- question, I would pass on to the district, you know, if I 18
- 19 thought they weren't, you know, aware of the situation.
- Q And the coffee club meetings, is this just for 20
- 21 parents or does someone from Helms also attend?
- 22 A No, someone from Helms attends.
- 23 Q Are these different types of meetings than the
- 24 once a month?
- 25 A Yes.

1 Q What's different about the coffee club meetings?

- A Well, the coffee club was originally designed to give parents helpful hints, you know, like about doing school and how to best help your son or daughter with
- 5 their homework or, you know, what do you see the
- 6 counselor for or, you know, these are the extra programs 7 we have available for your student to get help, things of
- 8 that nature.

2

3

4

- 9 Q Do you have -- do you know about how many 10 parents attend the coffee club meetings?
- 11 A Probably eight or ten.
- 12 Q How are parents -- well, are parents aware that 13 they occur, these coffee club meetings?
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q And how are they made aware?
- 16 A I believe it goes out in the monthly newsletter 17 that we send to all parents.
- Q About how many parents attend the once-a-month meetings?
- A It varies. Maybe on average 15 to 20.
- Q And are they made aware the same way that
- 22 they're made aware of the coffee club meetings?
- A I believe so, yes.
- Q And what is the gardening club?
- 25 A It's a group of parents -- we have a courtyard

- 1 might discuss?
- A Well, for example, at the last staff meeting we
- 3 talked about the close of school. You know, your
- 4 textbook has to be in by this date, all these issues
- 5 around closing the school. We informed the teachers
- 6 about how we're going to do it, what you have to do, you
- 7 know, the last day special schedule, all that kind of
- 8 thing. Mostly school-wide issues that generally impact9 the whole staff.
- 10 Q Have you ever discussed textbooks or the need 11 for more textbooks at these meetings?
- 12 A Textbooks are generally discussed, you know, in
- 13 the departments. So each math department, science
- 14 department, that's where the discussion would come about
- 15 textbooks. So these discussions are probably happening
- 16 on like the collaboration day.
 - Q During the once-a-month teacher meetings, do
- 18 teachers ever suggest ways to improve the curriculum or
- 19 the school?

17

25

- A Sometimes.
- Q And do you try and implement those suggestions?
- A Yes, if they're possible.
- 23 Q If a teacher's suggestion is not possible, how
- 24 do you deal with that?
 - A Well, for example, like the leaking roofs, you

Page 111

- at Helms and they're planting that courtyard.
- Q Was this something the parents started or that Helms started?
- 4 A I believe it was sort of a mutual undertaking.
- 5 Q Are there staff meetings at Helms?
- 6 A Yes.

7

- Q And how often do those occur?
- 8 A Well, if you're talking about including the
- 9 whole staff of teachers --
- 10 Q Are there two separate types of staff meetings?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Okay. What are they?
- 13 A Well, the teacher one meets once a month, the
- 14 first Monday of the month, for about an hour -- for an
- 15 hour. And then we meet -- the counselors and myself and
- 16 the vice principal meet Thursday mornings for about an
- 17 hour.
- And then the teachers also meet on Wednesday mornings. They have collaboration time. So we have a
- 20 shortened day for the kids to give us about 69 minutes, I
- 21 think, for teachers to meet and collaborate.
- 22 Q For the teacher meeting that occurs once a
- 23 month, what is generally discussed in those meetings?
- A Oh, issues that impact the whole school.
- Q Can you give me any examples of some things you

- 1 know, my understanding, there was no fundings in the
- 2 district to deal with that, and I just convey that
- 3 information back to the teachers.
- 4 Q Is that generally sufficient, or do they have
- 5 additional complaints that they bring up at that time?
- 6 A I guess -- 7 MR. KRE
 - MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague, go ahead.
- 8 THE WITNESS: -- it depends on the issue.
- 9 BY MS. VANCE:
- 10 Q For the Wednesday morning teacher meetings, is 11 that by department?
- 12 A By department and by committee. There's
- 13 school-wide committees that usually meet one week, and
- 14 then the departments meet the next week. And then
- 15 occasionally thrown in the mix is what we call faculty
- 16 forum, which would be meetings where all of us would meet 17 again.
- ${\tt 18} \qquad {\tt Q} \quad {\tt And are these department and committee meetings}$
- 19 and the faculty forum, are they different than the
- 20 once-a-month teacher meetings?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q How are they different?
- A Well, by union contract we can only call a
- 24 faculty meeting once a month for an hour in length. So I
- 25 can only hold that meeting once a month. These meetings

Page 114 Page 116

- are built into the instructional day, so they're held
- 2 once a week.

5

- 3 Q Are different topics discussed at the Wednesday 4 morning meetings than at the general faculty?
 - A Sometimes.
- 6 Q And then on Thursdays you meet with the 7 counselors, vice principal and then yourself. What is 8 generally discussed at those meetings?
- 9 A Those would be issues concerning discipline of a 10 student, you know, programming, for next year, you know, what classes we're going to offer next year, things of 11
- 12 that nature. I also meet with the department chairmans once a week or at least five of the department chairmans. 13
- 14 MR. KREEGER: Off the record for a minute.
- 15 (Brief break.)
- 16 BY MS. VANCE:
- 17 Q At the teacher meetings is there -- do the 18 teachers ever share suggestions to each other about 19 instructional methods?
- 20 A They will do that on the collaboration day.
- 21 Q And how often does that occur?
- 22 A Well, it's every week, but the meeting in
- 23 departments, that would be like every other week. So
- 24 that's probably the time they would be most likely to
- 25 share instructional strategies.

- 1 A I don't know.
- 2 Q Do you know if there are other materials used in 3 classrooms at Helms besides textbooks?
- 4 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. What do you mean 5 by materials?
- BY MS. VANCE: 6

7

8

12

- Q Okay. Do you understand the question, or would you like me to clarify?
- A I think you need to clarify that for me. 9
- 10 Q Okay. I'm assuming that most classrooms at 11 Helms use textbooks?
 - A Yes, most of them do.
- 13 Q Do you know of any other supplemental materials that a teacher might use in the classroom? 14
- 15 A They could use the computer lab. They could use 16 a video. There are some other supplemental materials 17 besides textbooks that are available.
- 18 Q What are those other supplemental materials?
- 19 A We've ordered other, you know, books that are
- not necessarily textbooks that could be used in the
- 21 classroom. I would imagine maps, you know, things of
- 22 that nature are all supplemental materials.
- 23 Q Are these generally materials that the teachers
- 24 decide they want, or is this something that's part of a
 - bigger program and curriculum?

Page 115

- 1 Q Do you attend those?
- 2 A Sometimes. Not very often.
- Q You mentioned earlier an MRAD. Was that a local 3 4 bond?
- 5 A I believe so.
- 6 Q Do you know how -- was that granted to Helms or 7 was that granted to the district?
- 8 A The district, I believe it was the district.
- 9 Q Were you involved in the proposal for that?
- 10
- 11 Q Do you know how the district may have allocated the money that was given?
- 13 A No.
- 14 Q For Measure M I think you stated that there was 15 no direct impact that you thought it would have on Helms?
- A I mean -- my recollection of the Measure M isn't
- 17 very good, so if I'm recalling that measure correctly, I
- 18 don't think it will have any impact on Helms.
- 19 Q I'm just wondering if you thought there might be
- 20 an indirect impact as a result of the measure. If you
- 21 don't know, it's perfectly fine to state as well. 22 A I don't know. Those various bonds are starting
- 23 to run together in my mind.
- 24 Q So have there been other bonds related to the 25 school district?

A Generally, I think it would be decided by the 1 2 teachers in that department.

8

9

10

11

15

- 3 Q Do you know if most students at Helms receive
- 4 homework in their classes on a regular basis? 5 A Some teachers assign homework and some do not.
- I'm not sure exactly what percentage do and what 7 percentage do not.
 - Q For the teachers that do assign homework, is that something that the department actually -- let me think about that question and I'll come back.
 - A Okay.
- 12 Q When you were talking about alignment to State 13 standards, and you said I think that the books or 14 textbooks that you had were not aligned?
 - A Yes.
- 16 Q What did you mean by that?
- 17 A Well, there are -- certain standards dictate
- 18 what you're supposed to teach at a particular grade
- level. And most of the textbooks that we have for that 19
- 20 grade level are not addressing those standards that are 21
 - outlined.
- 22 Q Do you know if this is just at Helms or if it's 23 at other schools in West Contra Costa School District?
- 24 A I really can't speak for the other schools.
- 25 Q That's fine.

Page 118 Page 120

1 The district has a collective bargaining 2 agreement, right?

A Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

23

24

25

12

13

14

15

O Does that cover substitute teachers?

MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. The district actually has four collective bargaining agreements or three -- no. four.

BY MS. VANCE:

Q Okay. So how many collective bargaining agreements are you aware of that apply to Helms?

A I believe, three.

Q And in any of those agreements are there 13 provisions that cover substitute teachers at Helms?

A I don't understand what you mean by provisions that cover substitute teachers.

Q Are you familiar with the collective bargaining agreements?

A Somewhat.

19 Q Are you familiar with any portions of the agreements that deal with either the ability to 21 substitute or requiring teachers to substitute within the 22 school?

A Well, there is a section stating that teachers are required to substitute if no other substitute is available. I believe that's how it's stated, something 1 Q Is Helms involved in a district internship 2

program?

3 A Yes. Some of our teachers are involved in 4 internship programs.

5 Q Is that both district and university internship programs? 6

A I think it's just university.

Q Do you happen to know what university that's affiliated with, if it's one or several?

10 A No.

7

8

9

13

Q Do you think that's been an effective program, 11 12 the internship program?

A Yes.

14 O And how so?

15 A Well, it provides teachers with, you know, the 16 proper training they need to get certified. And also it provides them with additional support. 17

18 Q Since you've been at Helms, either as a vice 19 principal or as principal, has the school ever

participated in an accreditation process?

21 A Well, I don't believe middle schools are 22 accredited in the same way high schools are. They go 23 through what they call a PQR, program quality review.

24 Q And has Helms gone through a PQR since you have

been at the school?

Page 119

1 to that effect.

2 Q Any other provisions that speak to substitutes? 3 MS. SACKS: That you can recall off the top of 4 your head. 5

MS. VANCE: Yes.

6 THE WITNESS: That's the only one that I really 7 recall.

8 BY MS. VANCE:

9 Q You stated that you think it's better to have 10 full credentialled teachers. Is that always the case, in your experience? 11

MR. KREEGER: Objection, vague. Go ahead. THE WITNESS: Generally, yes, I think that a fully credentialled teacher is better than someone who has not had the appropriate training.

16 BY MS. VANCE:

17 Q Do you think there are some non-fully credentialled teachers who could still be effective 18 19 teachers?

20 A I don't know.

21 Q Maybe I can ask it this way: Have you ever had experience working with a teacher at Helms who did not 22 have a full credential but who you considered to be an 24 effective and/or a good teacher?

A Yes. 25

9

16

22

2 Q Do you know if Helms has been -- go ahead, I'm 3 sorry.

4 A I don't remember. I mean they might have gone

5 through it when my old boss was in charge, but certainly 6 not since I've been principal.

Q So you don't know if you went through it as a 7 8 vice principal?

A I don't believe so. I don't believe so.

10 Q Okay. How about a CCR review?

11 A We started the process this year.

MS. SACKS: For the record, could you explain 12 13 what CCR stands for.

14 MS. VANCE: Sure. The Coordinated Compliance 15 Review, correct?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 BY MR. KREEGER:

Q Any other reviews or evaluations that you're 18 19 aware of that Helms has gone through since you've been at

20 the school? 21

A We're an II, slash, USP -- IIUSP. I don't think there's a back slash in there.

23 O And when did that review begin?

24 A We had the planning grant -- first year of

25 implementation this year and the planning grant the year

- before, so I guess what, it's the second year now, or
- actually it will be starting its third year this 2
- 3 September.
- 4 Q What have you had to do for that review?
- 5 A Well, basically, we had to look at our whole
- school program, describe what was working, what was not,
- and then, you know, make modifications to that program to
- 8 improve student achievement.
- Q Did you write any reports as to your findings? 9
- 10 A Yes.
- Q Did you -- where did you send those reports? 11
- A It went to the school board, then on to the 12
- 13 State of California.
- Q Have you made any modifications as a result of 14 15 the IIUSP process?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q What have you modified or changed?
- 18 A We changed a lot of things. It was like a
- 19 150-page document. We have instituted home rooms this
- year. We gave certain department leaders a period off.
- 21 We instituted a student incentive program. We instituted
- a math and reading lab for students who were performing
- 23 below grade level. There's a whole list of things that
- 24 we've undertaken as a result of that process.
- 25 Q Have you had to follow up with reports or other

- issue from -- the one from the architects. There have 2 been --
 - Q Any others that you're aware of?
 - A Not that I can recall offhand.
 - MS. VANCE: Okay. I'm going to take a quick

Page 124

Page 125

- break so that I can review the notes from this afternoon. 6 7
 - (Brief break.)
 - BY MS. VANCE:

3

4

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

- Q When we were speaking earlier about the allegations pertaining to Helms in the First Amended Complaint -- and maybe I can just point your attention again to the page 30, paragraph 98.
 - A Yes.
- 14 Q The third line down talks about one algebra class has no books at all, not even books for students to 15 use in class. Was that allegation a surprise to you? 16
- A Yes. I believe the class they're referring to 17 18 the teacher has textbooks but does not use them very 19 often. She tends to do a lot of her instruction from the 20 overhead.
- 21 Q Do you know why she does that or did that?
- 22 A No.
- 23 Q For the class, algebra class you're referring
- 24 to, the teacher did have access to use textbooks in the
- 25 classroom?

Page 123

things of that nature? 1

2 3

4

5

6

7

10

11

- A Umm, we're in the process now of sort of evaluating what we did this year. And then my understanding is next year will be the full-blown evaluation.
- O Will that be a self-evaluation, or will there be other persons coming into the school?
- 8 A No, there would be an outside evaluator brought 9 in.
 - Q Do you know who that outside evaluator will be?
 - A No, I do not.
- O Are you aware of any studies that have been 12
- undertaken to observe or study facilities in the West 13
- 14 Contra Costa School District?
- 15 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. Studies by whom, 16 what?
- 17 BY MS. VANCE:
- 18 Q That's what I'm just asking, I guess, whether or 19 not you're aware of any.
- 20 A I would only be aware of the ones that were --
- 21 I would only feel comfortable speaking to the ones that 22 were done on my site.
- 23 O So I take it there have been some facilities 24 studied, is that what you're saying?
- 25 A Well, yeah, you got one this issue on mold, the

- A Yes, I believe so.
- 2 Q And pointing your attention to paragraph 99 where it talks about the leaks caused dangerous puddles
- on the gym floor --
- 5 A Yes.

21

22

- 6 Q -- do you agree with that categorization of dangerous puddles? 7
- A There have been -- there aren't anymore. There 8
- were puddles on the gym floor. They have been -- I
- 10 remember one time they had tarps down, you know, to catch 11 the water to save the gym floor.
- 12 Q But do you agree with how it's been categorized
- 13 as dangerous? 14 A Well, I would imagine anytime a floor is wet
- 15 that could lead to some safety hazards.
- 16 Q Again, for that paragraph 99, it states that 17 students worry that they'll be hit with falling tiles
- when they enter the library and other areas of the 18
- school. Were you aware of student complaints about being 19 20 hit with falling tiles?
 - A No, I was not aware of any student who was hit by a falling tile, not that I can recall, no.
- 23 O Were you ever aware that students were worried 24 about being hit by falling tiles? I mean did they ever
- complain, "I think I'm going to be hit," or "the tiles

Page 126 Page 128

- look loose" or something of that nature?
 - A Not that I remember.

2

3

5

6

7

12

17

18

- Q For the windows that you've mentioned have been covered with the boards at Helms, do you know if -- I'm assuming the district is aware of that problem?
- A As far as I know, they are aware of that problem, ves.
- 8 Q Do you know of anything the district is doing to 9 remedy that problem?
- 10 A It was my understanding they were going to be 11 fixed this summer.
- Q I think you mentioned also that there have been 13 student complaints that they had to hold it in when they used the rest room because they didn't want to use the 14 rest rooms at Helms. When -- can you recall a student 15 16 complaining about that particular thing?
 - A I can't remember exactly, although I have had students, you know, make comments like that to me.
- 19 Q When a student would make a comment of that 20 nature, did they say what they did instead, do they just 21 hold it until they got home?
- 22 A Yeah. Most kids said they just waited until 23 they got home.
- 24 Q About how many kids do you think have said 25 something like that to you in your time at Helms?

1 A Yes.

6

7

- 2 Q About how much money does Helms receive for 3 textbooks in a, like per year?
- 4 A I think last year we got about \$27,000, if I'm 5 not mistaken, somewhere in that vicinity.
 - MS. SACKS: For replacement books?
 - THE WITNESS: For site's discretion textbook
- money, which we used for replacement or buying new books 9 or however the site want to spend it.
- 10 BY MS. VANCE:
- Q But that does not include like the cyclical 11 12 adoption for textbooks?
- 13 A No. no.
- 14 Q Do you know how the district divides up the 15 funds it receives for different uses it could have, i.e.,
- use for textbooks versus facilities versus teacher 16
- salaries? 17
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q Are you aware of any categorical or special
- funds that the district reserves specifically for
- 21 textbooks?
- 22 A No.
- 23 Q Are you aware of any money that the district
- reserves for a fund called the instructional material 24
- 25 fund?

Page 127

- A A few. 1
- 2 Q Would you respond and say anything back to the 3 student when they tell you that?
- 4 A It's hard for me to remember what the 5 conversation was.
- 6 O Right.

7

8

9

- A I would probably -- I probably asked them why and then, you know, depending on their answer, I would work from there.
- 10 Q Did you ever do anything to kind of remedy a 11 problem or something that came up as a result of the comment from the student --12
- 13 A Sure.
- 14 O -- that they had to hold it in?
- 15 A Well, if they said there's no toilet paper in 16 the rest room, I would call the custodian and say the 17 downstairs rest room is out of toilet paper, and I would 18 have the custodian go put the toilet paper in there and then send the kid back in. 19
- 20 Problems that are reported to me that I would 21 have control over I would try to remedy as soon as 22 possible.
- 23 Q I think we talked earlier about how Helms gets 24 textbook money, and you said that there's a district-wide adoption and then also specific money for Helms?

A No. 1

2

7

- O How about Shift Bustamonte funds?
- 3 A I'm aware of the Shift Bustamonte funds. I'm 4
- not sure how the district receives that funding.
- 5 Q Do you know -- do you know if the district does have Shift Bustamonte funds?
 - A Yes.
- 8 Q Do you know if they used all of their funds?
- 9 A That I do not know.
- 10 Q Do you know how the district allocates the money 11 it receives to the different schools in the district?
- 12 A That I do not know. I think it's on a
- 13 per-pupil basis, but I'm not sure.
- 14 Q Do you know of any additional money the district receives other than from the State or from local 15 bond measures? I'm assuming there's sometimes private grants for use in schools. Are you aware of any of those 17
- 18 that the district has received?
- 19 MS. SACKS: Objection, vague. Are you talking about money for textbooks, money for specific things, 20 21 money that they can use for whatever they want?
- 22 MS. VANCE: I can break that up. Maybe that
- 23 would be a little bit more clear.
- 24 BY MS. VANCE:
- 25 Q Do you know of any -- other than what we've

Page 130 Page 132

- 1 talked about, the money you receive from the district, or
- 2 specific like Bustamonte, do you know of any other money
- 3 the district has received for textbooks?
- 4 A No.
- 5 Q How about any money outside of what we've talked 6 about for facilities, repair or renovation?
- 7 A No, I don't know of any others.
- 8 Q The critical hardship grant that we've talked
- 9 about, do you know when, the first time the district
- 10 applied for a critical hardship grant?
- 11 A No.
- O Are you aware of any critical hardship grants
- 13 that were implemented at your schools that you were at in
- 14 the district?
- 15 A I'm not aware of any.
- 16 Q Do you know what the application process is
- 17 like for the critical hardship grant?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q Did you participate in developing the grant for
- 20 this recent critical hardship grant for the district?
- 21 A No.
- Q Going to teacher credentialling, other than what
- 23 we've talked about earlier, do you know of anything else
- 24 the district does to recruit fully credentialled teachers
- 25 to come to the school district?

- 1 Q What does it depend on?
- 2 A Like, for example, I think all new teachers, if
- they're new to teaching, new to the district, are
- 4 required to go in August. If they're not hired by then,
- 5 of course they cannot go. I believe the ones that are
- 6 held, you know, when the school year starts are
- 7 voluntary.

8

12

13

- MS. VANCE: I think that's it for me.
- 9 MR. KREEGER: Did you want to ask any questions?
- 10 MS. SACKS: I just have a couple of follow-up
- 11 questions.

EXAMINATION

- 14 BY MS. SACKS:
- 15 Q Approximately how much does the average new 16 textbook cost?
- 17 A I would say somewhere right around \$45.
- Q And with that -- with the new textbooks are
- 19 there supplementary materials, for example, like the
- 20 teacher's version of the book?
- A Yes, there are supplemental materials usually
- 22 associated with most textbook purchases.
- 23 Q Although there may not be sufficient textbooks
- 24 for each student to be able to take home, do students
 - 5 have the option of checking out textbooks to take home

Page 131

Page 133

- A I think they've recruited some teachers from the Philippines, Spain. They actively recruit at the colleges and the universities. I believe they run newspaper ads. They have held job fairs.
- Q And how is it that you're aware of these efforts? Was it something that they informed the principals of or something that you just became aware of through other means?
- 9 A Umm, in most instances I think the principals 10 were informed.
- Q Does the district have any programs, teacher training programs, not the internship but any special seminars or programs they have put on to help the teachers?
- 15 A They sponsor a new teacher orientation at the 16 beginning of the school year. It's a week long. There's 17 also mentor teachers that -- one at my site that received 18 a state mentorship to work with new teachers. The 19 district does have -- at the district level, they do have 20 some support for new teachers. I think they also sponsor 21 some workshops after school for new teachers in terms of 22 staff development is also available.
- Q Are these programs that the teachers can elect to go to or are they required to go to by the district?
- A It depends.

- 1 with them?
- 2 A Yes, provided we have additional textbooks on
- 3 the shelf. Some parents have come and requested, you
- know, a textbook for their son and daughter in whatever class for them to take home, and we've checked them out
- 5 class for them to take home, and we've checked them out 6 to them.
 - MS. SACKS: I don't have any further questions.

FURTHER EXAMINATION

- BY MR. KREEGER:Q You mentioned the dry field --
- 11 Q You 12 A Yes.

7

8

9

- 13 Q -- that you have now.
- 14 A Yes.
- 15 Q Does that mean it has no grass on it?
- A It has grass, but at that time of the year the
- 17 grass is starting to die.
- 18 Q So the irrigation would be to turn it into a 19 grass field?
- A Right.
- 21 MS. SACKS: Objection, he said the grass is
- 22 dry, not that it's nonexistent.
- 23 BY MR. KREEGER:
- 24 Q The PQR process that you described, you say it
- 25 hasn't taken place since you've been at Helms. What

	Page 134	Page 136
1 triggers a PQR process? 2 A I believe it's triggered by the State. 3 Q The State lets you know that the school 4 go through that process? 5 A I believe it's done yes. 6 Q Do you know what criteria the State use select which schools undergo the PQR process A I believe all schools go through it event 9 It's on a cycle. 10 Q And the CCR process that you began the what triggered that? 11 A State. 12 A State. 13 Q Is that also on a cyclical? 14 A I believe so. 15 Q The IIUSP review that you mentioned, triggered that? 16 triggered that? 17 A Low test scores. 18 Q And what when were the low test score that start again. 20 When did Helms display low enough test that the IIUSP was triggered? 21 A We started the process two years ago, so Q So it was the tests that took place A The year prior, I would presume. 22 MR. KREEGER: Okay. That's all I have	es to ?? ually. uis year, what ores t scores o.	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 I, STEVEN V. MUZINICH, do hereby declare under 10 penalty of perjury that I have read the foregoing 11 transcript; that I have made any corrections as appear 12 noted, in ink, initialed by me; that my testimony as 13 contained herein, as corrected, is true and correct. 14 EXECUTED this day of
1 MS. VANCE: Okay. 2 MS. SACKS: Okay. 3 MR. KREEGER: Thank you very much. 4 MS. VANCE: Thank you. 5 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 6 // 7 // 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25		I, the undersigned, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, do hereby certify: That the foregoing proceedings were taken before me at the time and place herein set forth; that any witnesses in the foregoing proceedings, prior to testifying, were placed under oath; that a verbatim record of the proceedings was made by me using machine shorthand which was thereafter transcribed under my direction; further, that the foregoing is an accurate transcription thereof. I further certify that I am neither financially interested in the action nor a relative or employee of any attorney of any of the parties. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date subscribed my name. Dated: PATRICIA C. STEPHENS CSR No. 10058