

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

ELIEZER WILLIAMS, et al.,)
 Plaintiffs,)
 vs.) No. 312 236
 STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DELAINE) Pages 1 to 168
 EASTIN, State Superintendent) Volume I
 of Public Instruction, STATE)
 DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION,)
 STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION,)
 Defendants.)
 AND RELATED CROSS-ACTION)
)

DEPOSITION OF NATALIE PERKINS-ALI
 TAKEN ON
 TUESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2001

Reported by: PHILIP D. NORRIS
 CSR NO. 4980

1 Deposition of Natalie Perkins-Ali, taken on
 2 behalf of Defendant State of California, at 400 South
 3 Hope Street, Los Angeles, California, on Tuesday,
 4 December 4, 2001, at 9:50 a.m., before Philip D. Norris,
 5 CSR No. 4980, pursuant to Notice.
 6
 7 APPEARANCES:
 8
 9 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
 10 ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
 11 BY: BEN WIZNER, ESQ.
 12 CHRISTOPHER TAN
 13 1616 Beverly Boulevard
 14 Los Angeles, California 90026-5752
 15 (213) 977-9500
 16
 17 FOR THE DEFENDANT STATE OF CALIFORNIA:
 18 O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP
 19 BY: PETER L. CHOATE, ESQ.
 20 400 South Hope Street
 21 Los Angeles, California 90071-2899
 22 (213) 430-6000
 23
 24
 25

1
 2 APPEARANCES: (Continued)
 3
 4 FOR THE CROSS-DEFENDANT AND INTERVENOR LOS ANGELES
 5 UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT:
 6 STRUMWASSER & WOOCHEER LLP
 7 BY: JOHANNA R. SHARGEL, ESQ.
 8 100 Wilshire Boulevard
 9 Suite 1900
 10 Santa Monica, California 90401
 11 (310) 576-1233
 12
 13 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
 14 MORRISON & FOERSTER, LLP
 15 BY: AMY M. KOTT, ESQ.
 16 425 Market Street
 17 San Francisco, California 94105-2482
 18 (415) 268-7870
 19
 20 ALSO PRESENT:
 21 MR. PERKINS-ALI
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 INDEX

2

| | | |
|--|-------------|------|
| 3 WITNESS | EXAMINATION | PAGE |
| 4 NATALIE PERKINS-ALI | | |
| 5 (By Mr. Choate) | | 5 |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | | |
| 8 EXHIBITS | | PAGE |
| 9 1-Notice of Depositions, 12 pages | | 20 |
| 10 2-First Amended Complaint (retained by counsel) | | 22 |
| 11 3-Report Card, one page | | 51 |
| 12 4-Report Card, one page | | 51 |
| 13 | | |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

1 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA; TUESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2001
 2 9:50 A.M.
 3
 4
 5 NATALIE PERKINS-ALI,
 6 having been first duly sworn, was
 7 examined and testified as follows:
 8
 9 EXAMINATION
 10
 11 BY MR. CHOATE:
 12 Q. Good morning.
 13 A. Good morning.
 14 Q. Would you prefer that I call you Natalie today
 15 or Ms. Perkins-Ali?
 16 A. Ms. Perkins-Ali sounds better.
 17 Q. Okay. My name is Peter Choate. I'm an
 18 attorney. I work with the law firm of O'Melveny &
 19 Myers. I represent the State of California in a lawsuit
 20 entitled "Williams Versus State of California."
 21 Do you know why you're here today?
 22 A. Yes. I'm here on behalf of the students from
 23 Locke High. I'm representing them in this -- in my
 24 dissertation. And we're involved in a civil lawsuit, I
 25 know that, on Board of Education because -- due to the

1 conditions inside Locke High School.
 2 Q. Have you had your deposition taken before?
 3 A. Yes.
 4 Q. On how many occasions have you had your
 5 deposition taken before?
 6 A. Could you clarify that for me more?
 7 Q. Sure. Why don't we, before we move further,
 8 though, could we have everybody identify themselves here
 9 today?
 10 MS. KOTT: My name's Amy Kott, with Morrison &
 11 Foerster. I'm representing Natalie today.
 12 MR. PERKINS-ALI: My name is Nathaniel
 13 Perkins-Ali. I'm Natalie's father.
 14 MR. TAN: Christopher Tan with ACLU.
 15 MR. WIZNER: Ben Wizner with the ACLU.
 16 MS. SHARGEL: Johanna Shargel, Strumwasser &
 17 Woodcher, on behalf of LAUSD.
 18 BY MR. CHOATE:
 19 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, have you ever testified under
 20 oath before in a civil lawsuit?
 21 A. No.
 22 Q. Are you represented by counsel today?
 23 A. Can you clarify that more for me a little?
 24 Q. Are you represented by a lawyer today?
 25 A. Yes, I am.

1 Q. Who is your lawyer?
 2 A. Ms. Amy --
 3 I'm sorry, I didn't get your last name.
 4 MS. KOTT: It's okay. It's Kott, K O T T.
 5 BY MR. CHOATE:
 6 Q. Let me explain to you what we're going to do
 7 today so you feel more comfortable.
 8 I'm going to ask you a series of questions
 9 regarding your educational background and the conditions
 10 at your school, and your job today is just to answer my
 11 questions truthfully and completely. Okay?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. At the end of the deposition, my questions and
 14 your answers are going to be prepared in a booklet that
 15 you'll have a chance to read, and you can make any
 16 changes to your testimony at a later time if you feel
 17 that those changes are appropriate.
 18 Do you understand?
 19 A. Yes.
 20 Q. Any changes that you make, however, I can
 21 comment or any other lawyers can comment on those
 22 changes at trial or in any other proceedings in this
 23 case.
 24 Do you understand that?
 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. That means that it is very important for you to
 2 give your most truthful and complete testimony today.
 3 Okay?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. If at any time I ask you a question and you
 6 don't understand, just let me know, and I'll try to
 7 rephrase the question, if possible.
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. The court reporter here is taking down my
 10 questions and your answers with this funny-looking
 11 machine over here. And he can only take down spoken
 12 words. He can't take down nods of the head or uh-huhs
 13 and uh-uhs. So it's important for you to verbalize your
 14 answers.
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. It's also important for you to try to let me
 17 finish my questions first before you answer, and I'm
 18 going to do the same thing for you, I'll try to let you
 19 finish your answer before I ask you another question.
 20 Okay?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. Again, if you don't understand my question,
 23 just let me know, and I'll try to rephrase it. But if
 24 you don't let me know that you don't understand a
 25 question, I'm going to assume that you do understand it.

1 Okay?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. You don't need to guess today, and I don't want
 4 you to guess today when I ask you a question. But do
 5 your best to provide me with your best estimate, because
 6 I am entitled to your best estimate.
 7 Do you understand the difference between
 8 guessing and providing an estimate?
 9 A. Yes, I do.
 10 Q. Even though this is in an informal setting in
 11 which I'm asking you questions, you are under oath, and
 12 you are subject to all the penalties of perjury and that
 13 means you have to provide truthful testimony.
 14 Do you understand?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. If you need to take a break at any time today,
 17 just let me know and I'll do my best to accommodate you.
 18 The only thing I would ask you is that if I have asked
 19 you a question, just please provide me with your answer
 20 first, and once you've done that, then we can take a
 21 break. All right?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. Do you understand all the kind of ground rules
 24 we've gone over?
 25 A. Yes, I do.

1 Q. Do you have any questions?
 2 A. None at the moment.
 3 Q. Is there any reason why you cannot provide me
 4 your most accurate, truthful testimony today?
 5 A. There's no reason.
 6 Q. Have you taken any medication within the last
 7 or are you currently taking any medication that would
 8 interfere with your ability to provide your best
 9 testimony today?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. I know your dad's sitting here, and I don't
 12 necessarily like to ask you this question in front of
 13 your father, but have you taken any alcohol or other
 14 drugs within the last couple of days that would
 15 interfere with your ability to testify?
 16 A. No.
 17 Q. Do you suffer from any disability that would
 18 interfere with your ability to testify?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Are you ready to get started?
 21 A. I sure am, yes.
 22 Q. All right. Can you tell me what you did to
 23 prepare for this deposition today?
 24 A. Went over my dissertation and -- last night.
 25 Q. What was this last thing that you did?

1 A. Last night or --
 2 Q. When I asked you what you did to prepare for
 3 today's deposition, you indicated that you looked at
 4 your dissertation.
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. What do you mean by dissertation?
 7 A. My statement.
 8 Q. Is that a declaration that you provided to your
 9 lawyers?
 10 A. My declaration, yes. I'm sorry.
 11 Q. There's no need to be sorry.
 12 Did you do anything else to prepare for your
 13 deposition today other than look at your declaration?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. You indicated earlier that you are represented
 16 today by Ms. Kott.
 17 A. Yes.
 18 Q. When did Ms. Kott become your lawyer for
 19 purposes of this lawsuit?
 20 A. I would have to go back to the beginning month
 21 of November. I was informed by a member of the ACLU,
 22 Laura. I do not know her last name. But she informed
 23 me that there's going to be a lawyer involved and that
 24 she's going to represent me.
 25 MS. KOTT: Okay. I'm going to ask you to stop

1 right there because you might be revealing
 2 attorney/client privileged information. So you can --
 3 from the point of when the ACLU and my law firm -- we're
 4 working with ACLU -- started representing you, you
 5 cannot discuss the contents of the conversations that
 6 you had.
 7 THE WITNESS: Okay.
 8 MS. KOTT: You can talk about things that you
 9 spoke about before we started representing you, but once
 10 we started don't reveal any of that information. And
 11 you can say whether or not you spoke with us.
 12 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 13 BY MR. CHOATE:
 14 Q. Let me just make sure I understand.
 15 In November of 2000 a woman named Laura from
 16 the ACLU telephoned you?
 17 A. November 2001.
 18 Q. November 2001. Excuse me.
 19 Do you remember when, approximately, you had
 20 this telephone conversation with Laura in November 2001?
 21 A. No.
 22 Q. Was it at the beginning of November?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Was it in the first week of November?
 25 A. I really do not know.

1 Q. How long did you speak? Without telling me
 2 what you and Laura said to each other, for how long did
 3 you speak with Laura on this occasion in November of
 4 2001?
 5 A. I do not know.
 6 Q. Try to provide me with your best estimate.
 7 A. My best estimate? I'd say about 20 minutes.
 8 Q. Before you spoke with Laura in November of 2001
 9 for about 20 minutes over the telephone, is it your
 10 understanding that the ACLU were your lawyers for
 11 purposes of this lawsuit?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. So before 2001 you were not represented by the
 14 ACLU in connection with this lawsuit; is that correct?
 15 A. That's correct.
 16 Q. Prior to 2001, prior to November of 2001, when
 17 you spoke with Laura, were you represented by anybody
 18 else for purposes of this lawsuit?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Have you signed a written agreement with the
 21 ACLU to the effect that they are your lawyers for
 22 purposes of this lawsuit?
 23 THE WITNESS: Can I ask you?
 24 MS. KOTT: I can't testify today.
 25 ///

1 BY MR. CHOATE:

2 Q. You know what, let me withdraw that question
3 for a second and go over one other ground rule that I
4 didn't tell you about.

5 Throughout the course of this day Ms. Kott may
6 object to some of the questions I ask you, and that
7 could be for a number of reasons. Probably the most
8 common reason is the question I ask you is not very easy
9 to understand. If she objects, you are still required
10 to answer my question, if you can. If she instructs you
11 not to answer a question and you choose to follow her
12 advice, then you may not have to answer my question.
13 But unless she instructs you not to answer, you still
14 are required to answer the question, to the extent you
15 can. Okay?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. So the question I'd asked you previously was
18 whether you have signed any type of agreement to the
19 effect that the ACLU are your lawyers for purposes of
20 this lawsuit.

21 A. No. No, I don't think so. No.

22 Q. Without telling me the content of any of your
23 conversations with the ACLU, can you tell me on how many
24 different occasions you have communicated with someone
25 from the ACLU about your deposition today?

1 MS. KOTT: I'm sorry, just to clarify, you mean
2 with the ACLU or Morrison & Foerster or anyone on the
3 plaintiffs' attorneys' side?

4 MR. CHOATE: Anyone on the plaintiffs'
5 attorneys' side, yes.

6 THE WITNESS: I would say three or four times.

7 BY MR. CHOATE:

8 Q. You spoke with the lawyers representing the
9 plaintiffs in this action on about three or four
10 occasions regarding your deposition today?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. When was the most recent occasion?

13 A. I think -- my estimate -- about a week ago.

14 Q. Who did you speak with about a week ago?

15 A. I spoke to Laura.

16 Q. Do you know whether Laura is a lawyer?

17 A. No.

18 Q. Did you speak with Laura over the telephone?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. This is the same Laura from the ACLU that you
21 told me about earlier?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. About how long did you speak with Laura?

24 A. No more than 15 minutes.

25 Q. When was the next time just before this

1 conversation with Laura that you spoke with somebody
2 about this deposition, one of plaintiffs' attorneys?

3 A. I don't know. I can't recall.

4 Q. Can you recall the other two occasions on which
5 you spoke with plaintiffs' attorneys about your
6 deposition today?

7 A. No.

8 Q. I just want to make sure I understand.

9 The only conversation that you recall having
10 with plaintiffs' attorneys about your deposition today
11 was this one conversation with Laura that took place
12 about a week ago?

13 A. Yes.

14 MS. KOTT: Just to clarify, are you talking
15 about telephone conversation or any conversation at all?

16 MR. CHOATE: Any conversation.

17 Q. Did you understand my question?

18 A. Yes. But I thought you meant by phone.

19 Q. Other than this conversation with Laura that
20 took place about a week ago, do you recall any other
21 conversations, whether by telephone or in person, with
22 the attorneys who represent plaintiffs about your
23 deposition today?

24 A. Yesterday.

25 Q. Who did you speak with yesterday?

1 A. Amy Kott.

2 Q. Did you meet with Ms. Kott in person or did you
3 speak to her on the telephone?

4 A. In person.

5 Q. How long did you meet with her?

6 A. About an hour.

7 Q. Do you recall any other occasions on which you
8 spoke with or met with plaintiffs' attorneys in
9 preparation for your deposition, other than the
10 telephone conversation with Laura and your meeting with
11 Ms. Kott?

12 A. No.

13 MS. KOTT: I believe you are misstating her
14 testimony, however. She did say there were three or
15 four telephone conversations. She just couldn't recall
16 exactly when they were except for the one with Laura
17 about a week ago.

18 BY MR. CHOATE:

19 Q. Other than what you've told me about, your
20 conversation with Laura and your meeting with Ms. Kott,
21 can you recall the specifics of any other conversations
22 or meetings with plaintiffs' lawyers about your
23 deposition that may have taken place?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Other than with plaintiffs' attorneys, have you

1 spoken with anybody else about your deposition today?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. You told me earlier that you reviewed your
 4 declaration in preparation for your deposition today.
 5 A. Yes, I did.
 6 Q. How long did you spend reviewing the
 7 declaration?
 8 A. About 30 minutes.
 9 Q. Did you review any other documents in
 10 preparation for your deposition today?
 11 A. No. No.
 12 Q. Did you review declarations from any other
 13 students or parents or anybody else in connection with
 14 this lawsuit?
 15 A. I looked at a couple of them, but I didn't
 16 review them like I did mine, so I just looked at a
 17 couple of them.
 18 Q. What declarations did you look at?
 19 A. Some that also were also similar to mine.
 20 Q. Can you remember whose declarations they were?
 21 A. No, I cannot.
 22 Q. Were they students who attended Locke High
 23 School?
 24 A. No.
 25 Q. Were they students who attended other schools?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. Do you know what other schools those students
 3 attended?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Approximately how many declarations other than
 6 yours did you review in preparation for the deposition
 7 today?
 8 A. Two.
 9 Q. And you don't remember what schools those
 10 students attended?
 11 A. No. I just briefly looked over.
 12 Q. How did you obtain those declarations?
 13 A. Can you clarify that more for me?
 14 Q. Sure. These two other declarations, were they
 15 provided to you by your lawyers?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Who provided you with those declarations?
 18 A. Amy Kott.
 19 Q. These two declarations, however, were not
 20 declarations that related to Locke High School?
 21 A. No. They were similar to Locke's.
 22 Q. I'm sorry?
 23 A. They were similar to the one I wrote about
 24 Locke.
 25 Q. Other than your declaration and these two

1 additional declarations that you told me about, have you
 2 reviewed any other documents, any other documents
 3 whatsoever, in preparation for your deposition today?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Did you review any news articles in preparation
 6 for your deposition today?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. Are you nervous about today?
 9 A. A little.
 10 Q. You're doing a good job. You don't need to be
 11 nervous. If I were in your position, however, I'd
 12 probably be nervous because I haven't had to do what
 13 you're doing today.
 14 I'd like to mark as Exhibit 1 a document
 15 entitled "Defendant State of California's Notice of
 16 Depositions of Plaintiffs, Plaintiffs' Guardians Ad
 17 Litem, and Non-Party Declarants; Request for Production
 18 of Documents."
 19 (The document referred to was marked by the
 20 reporter as Exhibit 1 for identification and is attached
 21 hereto.)
 22 BY MR. CHOATE:
 23 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, have you seen this document
 24 before?
 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. When did you first see this document?
 2 A. Yesterday.
 3 Q. Was that when you met with Ms. Kott?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. Did you and Ms. Kott meet at your home?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. Where did you meet?
 8 A. At a restaurant.
 9 Q. What restaurant?
 10 A. Burger King.
 11 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, would you take just a minute
 12 and review the language on page 7 and 8 that comes just
 13 after the title "Request No. 1."
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. Did you look for documents that relate to this
 16 request?
 17 A. Yes, I did.
 18 Q. When did you look for these documents?
 19 A. I looked for them yesterday when I went home.
 20 Q. How long, approximately, did you spend looking
 21 for those documents?
 22 A. Approximately 15 minutes. I went to the main
 23 places that I thought it would be.
 24 Q. Did you bring any documents with you today that
 25 you felt were responsive to this request?

1 A. I could only find a couple of them, which I
2 think you have. Other than that, I didn't bring any
3 more because I couldn't find them.

4 Q. Is it possible that you have additional
5 documents, such as report cards and other documents
6 called for in this request, at home that you haven't
7 been able to find in the 15 minutes that you spent
8 looking?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. It is possible that those documents exist?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Would you do me a favor: After we're done
13 today, would you take a second look --

14 A. I sure will.

15 Q. -- in your home and try to find any additional
16 documents that may be responsive to this document
17 request?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Thank you. You can put this document aside.
20 Go ahead and mark as Exhibit 2 First Amended
21 Complaint.
22 (The document referred to was marked by the
23 reporter as Exhibit 2 for identification and retained by
24 counsel.)
25 MR. CHOATE: Can we stipulate that we don't

1 have to attach this as an exhibit though we will mark it
2 as an exhibit?

3 MS. KOTT: Absolutely.

4 BY MR. CHOATE:

5 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, have you seen this document
6 before that is entitled "First Amended Complaint for
7 Injunctive and Declaratory Relief"?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Do you recall when you first saw this document?

10 A. Yes, I do. It was yesterday also.

11 Q. This was during your meeting with Ms. Kott?

12 A. Yes, it was.

13 Q. Did you spend any time reviewing this document?

14 A. I briefly looked over it.

15 Q. About how long did you spend looking over it?

16 A. About five minutes.

17 Q. Other than the five minutes that you spent
18 looking at this document yesterday, have you had
19 occasion on any other occasion to look through this
20 document?

21 A. No.

22 Q. You can go ahead and set this aside.
23 Other than the First Amended Complaint, your
24 declaration, and the two additional declarations that
25 you told me about, did you review any other documents in

1 preparation for your deposition today?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Did you review any other documents with
4 Ms. Kott yesterday aside from the three declarations,
5 the First Amended Complaint and the document request
6 that you've already looked at?

7 A. No.

8 Q. You haven't looked at any other documents?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Do you understand that you've been called here
11 today to testify in connection with a lawsuit filed by a
12 number of students that attend or have attended public
13 schools in California?

14 A. Yes, I do.

15 Q. Do you have any understanding as to what the
16 nature of that lawsuit is?

17 MS. KOTT: Objection. Vague.

18 BY MR. CHOATE:

19 Q. See, that's an example where she objected to my
20 question, but you can still answer the question, if you
21 understand it.

22 A. I don't understand it.

23 Q. Do you have any understanding as to what this
24 lawsuit is about?

25 A. No, not really.

1 Q. Do you know what type of relief the plaintiffs
2 are seeking in this lawsuit?

3 A. Yes, I do.

4 Q. What kind of relief are the plaintiffs seeking?

5 A. Better conditions in their environment as they
6 attend school.

7 Q. Are the plaintiffs, to your knowledge, seeking
8 any other type of relief in this lawsuit other than
9 better conditions at their schools?

10 A. Better teaching. Excuse me. I'm, like, really
11 nervous. Other than the environment, the teachers, they
12 definitely seek relief for that. That's about it.

13 Q. Are you a plaintiff in this lawsuit?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Do you know when you became a plaintiff in this
16 lawsuit?

17 A. May of 2001.

18 Q. Why does that date stick out in your head?

19 A. Because that was the month before I graduated
20 when someone told me about it, and that was, like, a
21 really hectic month for us seniors, so that really just
22 sticks out in my -- makes me remember.

23 Q. Were you represented by counsel in May of 2001
24 in connection with this lawsuit?

25 A. Can you clarify that for me?

1 Q. Did you have a lawyer in May of 2001 who --
 2 A. No, I did not.
 3 Q. Let me finish the question first.
 4 Did you have a lawyer in May 2001 who
 5 represented you in connection with this lawsuit?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. Did you first learn about this lawsuit in May
 8 2001? Or when did you first learn about this lawsuit?
 9 A. The following month. Actually, there was prom
 10 (sic) in May, but I don't know for sure until June of
 11 2001.
 12 Q. Let's start again. I know it's been a long
 13 time, but try to think back and tell me when you first
 14 heard about this lawsuit. In what month was it in 2001?
 15 A. When I first heard about it, it was in May.
 16 Q. How did you hear about this lawsuit in May
 17 2001?
 18 A. Through a couple of students.
 19 Q. Do you remember their names?
 20 A. No, I do not.
 21 Q. Were they friends of yours?
 22 A. They were acquaintances. You know how you see
 23 people, say hi, goodbye.
 24 Q. Were there two students that told you about
 25 this lawsuit?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. Were they students at Locke High School at the
 3 time?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. But you don't remember their names?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. What did they tell you about this lawsuit?
 8 A. They just said that ACLU -- what did they say?
 9 Let me see a second here, see if I can recall. They
 10 said that these students were going to file a lawsuit.
 11 ACLU were going to get with the students on filing a
 12 lawsuit on the conditions at Locke, something to that
 13 understanding, that I can remember.
 14 Q. Did you say anything to the students about the
 15 lawsuit?
 16 A. No. No.
 17 Q. Did you contact the ACLU back in May 2000, when
 18 you heard that they were going to file a lawsuit, about
 19 conditions at Locke High School?
 20 A. No.
 21 Q. After that, that encounter with the two
 22 students in May 2001, do you remember when the next
 23 occasion was when you spoke with someone about this
 24 lawsuit?
 25 A. June of 2001. June.

1 Q. Tell me, with whom did you speak in June 2001
 2 about this lawsuit?
 3 A. With a teacher.
 4 Q. Just one teacher?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. And what was this teacher's name?
 7 A. What teacher was that? I cannot think of his
 8 name at the moment.
 9 Q. Was he one of your teachers at Locke High
 10 School?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. This was when you were in 12th grade; right?
 13 A. Yes, it was.
 14 Q. What subject did he teach that you had him as a
 15 teacher for?
 16 A. Geometry.
 17 Q. Was this teacher's name Mr. Cubias?
 18 A. Yes. There you go. Yes, his name was
 19 Mr. Cubias.
 20 Q. How long did you speak with Mr. Cubias on this
 21 occasion in June 2001 about this lawsuit?
 22 A. It was right after class, so it took no more
 23 than five minutes.
 24 Q. Who initiated the conversation?
 25 A. Let's see. I think a student that told me and

1 brought me to Mr. Cubias, and the student brought me to
 2 Mr. Cubias, the teacher, and he told me.
 3 Q. Do you remember the student's name?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. What did this student tell you about
 6 Mr. Cubias?
 7 A. I really can't recall because it was so long
 8 ago, so I couldn't really say because I do not remember.
 9 Q. Do you remember what you and Mr. Cubias said to
 10 each other during this occasion in June 2001?
 11 A. I can't remember, but I know it was something
 12 about a meeting. Was something about a meeting. That's
 13 all I can -- that's what I vaguely remember.
 14 Q. Mr. Cubias told you that there would be a
 15 meeting?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Did he tell you what kind of meeting there
 18 would be?
 19 A. No. Like, okay, it was nothing like -- it was
 20 a meeting about Locke's condition, if I wanted to do
 21 something to improve it, that I should come to this
 22 meeting.
 23 Q. Did you go to the meeting?
 24 A. Yes, I did.
 25 Q. Where was the meeting held?

1 A. Someplace off campus.
 2 Q. Do you remember where?
 3 A. No, I do not.
 4 Q. Do you know when the meeting took place?
 5 A. After school.
 6 Q. Do you know when after school?
 7 A. Four o'clock.
 8 Q. Do you know in what month the meeting took
 9 place?
 10 A. The same month, June.
 11 Q. How many people attended this meeting?
 12 A. More than 10. I don't know how many, but I
 13 know it was more than 10.
 14 Q. Was it more than 20?
 15 A. I don't think so, no.
 16 Q. Was it more than 15?
 17 A. About that. About that.
 18 Q. Who were the people that attended this meeting?
 19 A. Students from Locke and, I think, a few
 20 parents.
 21 Q. Was there anybody else other than students at
 22 Locke and the parents?
 23 A. And a teacher, Mr. Cubias.
 24 Q. Anybody else that you can remember?
 25 A. No.

1 Q. Was anybody from the ACLU there?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Do you recall who, who from the ACLU was there?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. How many people from the ACLU were there?
 6 A. Two or three.
 7 Q. Do you recall any of their names?
 8 A. No, I do not. I'm very bad with names.
 9 Q. I am too.
 10 Other than the two or three people from the
 11 ACLU and the approximately 10 students and parents, do
 12 you recall anybody else who was at this meeting?
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. How long, approximately, did the meeting take
 15 place?
 16 A. About an hour.
 17 Q. Do you recall where the meeting took place?
 18 A. No. I still can't remember.
 19 Q. What did the people from the ACLU tell you and
 20 the others at this meeting?
 21 A. I really can't recall.
 22 Q. Do you recall anything that they told you about
 23 at this meeting?
 24 A. Only about a lawsuit. That's about it. That's
 25 all that's in my mind right there, just right there.

1 That's all I can remember.
 2 Q. I want you to try to think back in your memory,
 3 and I know that June 2001 is a number of months ago.
 4 Can you recall generally anything that the people from
 5 the ACLU told you about the lawsuit?
 6 A. That there were other schools also filing a
 7 lawsuit about the conditions that they were in, and that
 8 I think -- my best estimate is that it was similar to
 9 Locke's in that they wanted to represent Locke also.
 10 That's my best estimate of it.
 11 Q. Can you remember anything else?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Were the other students at this meeting, were
 14 they also Locke students?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. Do you recall what you said at the meeting?
 17 A. I really didn't say -- I didn't say anything at
 18 all.
 19 Q. Did any of the two or three people from the
 20 ACLU ask you if you wanted to be a plaintiff in this
 21 lawsuit?
 22 A. Yes. Yes.
 23 Q. Do you recall who asked you that?
 24 A. Laura.
 25 Q. Laura was at the meeting?

1 A. Yes. Yes. Okay. She was there.
 2 Q. She was one of the two to three people from the
 3 ACLU?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. Do you remember who the others were?
 6 THE WITNESS: Were you there?
 7 MS. KOTT: You can't ask questions right now.
 8 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry.
 9 MR. CHOATE: It's okay.
 10 THE WITNESS: I can't remember, but I only know
 11 it was Laura there because she took my declaration.
 12 MS. KOTT: Did you want to take a break?
 13 THE WITNESS: Please.
 14 MR. CHOATE: Can I follow up on two things?
 15 And then we'll take a break in, like, a minute.
 16 MS. KOTT: Is that okay with you?
 17 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 18 BY MR. CHOATE:
 19 Q. Was the gentleman sitting at the end of the
 20 table at the meeting in June of 2001?
 21 A. I'm not sure, but I really can't recall.
 22 Q. Was the other gentleman sitting on my side of
 23 the table at the meeting?
 24 A. I don't remember seeing him.
 25 MR. CHOATE: You want to take a break?

1 MS. KOTT: If we could. Thanks.
 2 (Brief recess.)
 3 MR. CHOATE: Let's go back on the record.
 4 THE WITNESS: Before we start, there's a few
 5 things I'd like to -- okay. Calm down. There are a few
 6 things that I'd like to -- what's the word I'm looking
 7 for? There are a few things that I would like to
 8 reinstate. Okay? One, that Mr. Cubias, that was an
 9 entirely different issue, so that's null and void. One,
 10 the retainment -- the retainment in the beginning that
 11 we begun, the retainment, I did sign one. I was a
 12 little confused about that. And the declaration, I only
 13 read one. That was mine. I got confused with that big,
 14 thick book with the complaints. I thought that's what
 15 that was.
 16 MR. CHOATE: All right. So let me just go back
 17 and clarify, then.
 18 Q. In preparation for today's deposition, you
 19 reviewed the First Amended Complaint, which is marked as
 20 Exhibit 2?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. And you reviewed your declaration?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Did you review any other documents in
 25 preparation for today's deposition?

1 A. No. That was definitely it.
 2 Q. You did sign an agreement retaining plaintiffs'
 3 counsel as your lawyers for purposes of this lawsuit?
 4 A. Yes, I did.
 5 Q. When did you sign that agreement?
 6 A. I signed it yesterday.
 7 Q. Under the agreement, do the plaintiffs' lawyers
 8 represent you solely for purposes of this deposition
 9 today or for all purposes in this lawsuit?
 10 MS. KOTT: Objection. I instruct you not to
 11 answer on the grounds of attorney/client privilege.
 12 BY MR. CHOATE:
 13 Q. You mentioned that your meeting with Mr. Cubias
 14 related to a different issue entirely.
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. Are you referring to the meeting that took
 17 place in June of 2001?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. That was, like, right after your geometry
 20 class?
 21 A. Yes. My geometry class at that time was third
 22 period. That was right after school, yes.
 23 Q. You told me that you had attended a meeting in
 24 June 2001 after school of which there were about 10
 25 students and parents and a couple or two to three people

1 from the ACLU.
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Did that meeting relate to this lawsuit?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. That related to a different lawsuit?
 6 A. It related to a different issue.
 7 Q. A different issue?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. What issue did it relate to?
 10 MS. KOTT: Objection. Irrelevant.
 11 BY MR. CHOATE:
 12 Q. Did the meeting have anything to do with this
 13 lawsuit?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. Did the meeting have anything to do with the
 16 issues involved in this lawsuit?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. Did the meeting have anything to do with
 19 conditions at Locke High School?
 20 A. No.
 21 Q. You testified earlier that you first heard
 22 about this lawsuit in May 2001 from a couple students at
 23 Locke High School.
 24 A. That was also from a different issue.
 25 Q. Okay. That also applied to a different issue?

1 A. Issue, yes.
 2 Q. When was the first time that you heard about
 3 the Williams versus State of California lawsuit?
 4 A. That would be -- when do we have -- that would
 5 be the ending of June of 2001.
 6 Q. From whom did you hear about the Williams
 7 lawsuit at the end of June of 2001?
 8 A. From Laura.
 9 Q. From Laura?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. Laura from the ACLU?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. How did you hear about this lawsuit, the
 14 Williams lawsuit, from Laura in June 2001?
 15 A. Well, when Laura and I was talking, and I
 16 happened to tell her about some of the conditions that
 17 were at Locke. She also told me about a lawsuit dealing
 18 with the other conditions from other schools, and she --
 19 that's when she told me about the Williams case.
 20 Q. Did this conversation with Laura take place in
 21 person or on the telephone?
 22 A. In person.
 23 Q. Where did that take place?
 24 A. At WLC -- LC.
 25 Q. I'm sorry, what was that?

1 A. WLAC -- AC -- wait. I think it was WLACA. It
2 was a place that -- it was after-school program,
3 recreation center.

4 Q. Is this located at Locke High School?

5 A. No. It's located in Watts, down the street.

6 You can say down the street from Locke.

7 Q. And to the best of your recollection, this
8 place is called the WLACA?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. It's a recreation center where students can go
11 after school?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What kind of things do you do there?

14 A. They have programs. They have study hall.

15 It's like -- it's just like a -- it's pretty much a
16 hang-out.

17 Q. Who initiated this meeting between you and
18 Laura in the end of June 2001?

19 A. I really do not remember.

20 Q. Were there other people there who met with
21 Laura?

22 A. Yes. But I do not know their names.

23 Q. Can you recall how many people there were?

24 A. I'd say about eight people.

25 Q. Were these eight people all students who

1 A. I really don't know.

2 Q. Did she call you and ask you if you wanted to
3 meet with her?

4 A. No.

5 Q. Did you call her?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you just happen by chance to run into Laura
8 and the eight other people at the meeting in June 2001?

9 A. I think someone, someone said something about a
10 meeting that was taking place there, and my dad and I
11 went and I met Laura there.

12 Q. Who told you about the meeting that was taking
13 place?

14 A. I really don't remember.

15 Q. What did Laura tell you about the Williams
16 lawsuit when you met with her in June 2001?

17 A. She basically just said that, when I told her
18 about the conditions that were at Locke, she said that
19 there's a lawsuit by the name of Williams, there's a
20 case also dealing with the same situations I was telling
21 her, and that if I wanted to get in on it, I could, and
22 I did.

23 Q. Laura asked you or Laura told you that if you
24 wanted to get in on the lawsuit you could?

25 A. Yes.

1 attended Locke High School?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Were any of the eight people students who
4 attended Locke High School?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Who were the eight people?

7 A. They were people from the community. Laura, I
8 think another person from ACLU.

9 Q. Do you remember the other person's name from
10 the ACLU?

11 A. No.

12 Q. What people from the community were there?

13 A. Community reps from, like, churches. People
14 from -- I really don't know, but I know I did meet with
15 someone from a church from the community that went to be
16 there and discuss issues inside the community. That's
17 all I can remember.

18 Q. Was this meeting with Laura the first time you
19 met Laura?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Was it the first time that you spoke with Laura
22 in connection with this lawsuit?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. How did you come to meet with Laura on this
25 occasion at the end of June 2001?

1 Q. Do you know what she meant by that?

2 A. If I wanted to give a declaration from
3 representing Locke that I could.

4 Q. Did she ask you to give a declaration?

5 A. I really don't remember. Somehow I end up
6 giving one. I think it was more she asked. I didn't
7 really want to.

8 Q. Laura did ask you to give a declaration
9 relating to the conditions at Locke High School in
10 connection with this Williams lawsuit?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did she tell you, you should give a
13 declaration?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Did you give her a declaration?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. When did you give it to her?

18 A. In July of 2001. My best estimate, it was July
19 of 2001.

20 Q. Did any of the other people at this meeting in
21 June 2001 give a declaration to Laura relating to Locke
22 High School?

23 A. Not that I can recall.

24 Q. What did you tell Laura at this meeting about
25 the conditions at Locke High School?

1 A. About Locke, about how there were no books, no
2 teachers. We had subs. The school was dirty. That it
3 was very chaotic. I mean, there was chaos at the
4 school.

5 Q. Other than the books, the teachers and
6 substitutes and the apparent dirtiness of the school,
7 were there any other specific conditions that you talked
8 to Laura about, that you can recall?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Those were the three conditions that you talked
11 about: textbooks, teachers and cleanliness?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. When you said that everything was really
14 chaotic, what did you mean by that?

15 A. I meant by that, was that the school's out of
16 control, practically. The students were running the
17 school instead of the administration.

18 Q. When you say "the students were running the
19 school," what do you mean?

20 A. They run, I mean, substitutes off. They would
21 roam the halls, stop other students from trying to
22 learn, invading classrooms, being very disruptive. It
23 was to a point that I didn't really want to go to
24 school.

25 Q. Do you recall speaking with Laura about any

1 the date that I signed it?

2 Q. Well, we'll go back and talk about this in more
3 detail later.

4 How long did you speak with Laura by phone when
5 you were providing her your declaration?

6 A. About an hour and 20 minutes.

7 Q. And that conversation took place sometime in
8 July?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Did you speak with, meet with plaintiffs'
11 lawyers on another occasion after this telephone
12 conversation with Laura?

13 A. No. Only yesterday, but that was a different
14 thing. I didn't have a lawyer at that time.

15 Q. Between the telephone conversation sometime in
16 July 2001 with Laura in which you gave her your
17 declaration and your meeting yesterday with Ms. Kott in
18 preparation for this deposition, do you recall meeting
19 on any other specific occasion with any of the
20 plaintiffs' lawyers in connection with this lawsuit?

21 A. No.

22 MS. KOTT: Wait. Just to clarify, do you mean
23 in person?

24 MR. CHOATE: Yes.

25 THE WITNESS: No. Only the time I signed my

1 other conditions at Locke on this occasion?

2 MS. KOTT: Other than the ones she's already
3 mentioned?

4 BY MR. CHOATE:

5 Q. Other than the ones you've already mentioned.

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you speak with anybody else at this meeting
8 about conditions at Locke, other than the conditions
9 you've already told me about?

10 A. No.

11 Q. Did you meet with anybody else? Or when was
12 the next time that you met with some of the plaintiffs'
13 lawyers in connection with the Williams litigation after
14 your meeting in June 2001?

15 A. Can you clarify that for me more?

16 Q. Yes. Did you speak with or meet with any of
17 the other plaintiffs' lawyers who represent plaintiffs
18 in Williams after your meeting with Laura in June 2001?

19 A. No.

20 Q. You provided Laura with a declaration, didn't
21 you?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And I think you said you recalled giving her
24 that declaration sometime in July.

25 A. Yes. It was by phone, though. Would you like

1 declaration. That was it.

2 BY MR. CHOATE:

3 Q. Which was by telephone? Oh, other than the
4 time you signed your declaration?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. When did you sign your declaration?

7 A. Two weeks after I gave it to her, so that would
8 take it into August. I think. No. That was some time
9 by the ending of June -- July. July.

10 Q. Did you meet with Laura in person when you
11 signed that declaration?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Where did you meet with her?

14 A. Locke High School.

15 Q. Was it just you and Laura during this meeting?

16 A. It wasn't really a meeting. I just signed the
17 papers and left.

18 Q. Was anyone else present?

19 A. Students. I don't know their names, but
20 students and my dad.

21 Q. Did these other students provide declarations?

22 A. I'm not sure.

23 Q. You met with Laura at Locke High School to sign
24 your declaration about two weeks after you spoke to her
25 over the telephone; correct?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. Between the time that you met with Laura to
 3 sign your declaration at Locke High School and
 4 yesterday, when you met with Ms. Kott in preparation for
 5 today's deposition, did you meet or speak with any other
 6 of plaintiffs' lawyers on any occasion, that you can
 7 recall--
 8 MS. KOTT: Objection. Asked and answered.
 9 BY MR. CHOATE:
 10 Q. -- in connection with this lawsuit?
 11 I didn't ask that question.
 12 MS. KOTT: Objection. Asked and answered.
 13 BY MR. CHOATE:
 14 Q. You can go ahead and answer.
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, how old are you?
 17 A. I'm 18.
 18 Q. When's your birthday?
 19 A. September the 26th, 1983.
 20 Q. You graduated from Locke?
 21 A. Yes, I did.
 22 Q. What month and year did you graduate?
 23 A. June 2001.
 24 Q. Are you currently attending college?
 25 A. Yes. I'm attending Compton Community College.

1 Q. I'm sorry, what was the name?
 2 A. Compton Community College.
 3 Q. When did you begin attending Compton Community
 4 College?
 5 A. In August. On August 15th, 2001.
 6 Q. When did you first begin attending Locke High
 7 School?
 8 A. September. September the 7th, I think it was,
 9 1999.
 10 Q. What grade were you in when you began attending
 11 Locke High School?
 12 A. The 11th grade.
 13 Q. September the 7th, 1999, was that the beginning
 14 of your junior year at Locke High School?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. Between September 7th, 1999, and the time you
 17 graduated in June of 2001, did you attend law school for
 18 all of your junior and senior years?
 19 A. Law school?
 20 Q. Excuse me. Did you attend Locke High School
 21 for all of your junior and senior years?
 22 A. Yes, I did.
 23 Q. Are you planning on going to law school?
 24 A. No. No.
 25 Q. Prior to coming to Locke as a junior, where did

1 you attend high school?
 2 A. I came from Gardena High School.
 3 Q. Where is Gardena High School located?
 4 A. In Gardena.
 5 Q. Did you attend Gardena High School for both 9th
 6 and 10th grades?
 7 A. Yes. I attended Taft High School in Woodland
 8 Hills for five weeks and then I transferred to Gardena
 9 High School in Gardena, California.
 10 Q. And you completed your 10th grade year at
 11 Gardena High School?
 12 A. I completed my 9th and 10th grade there.
 13 Q. What is your current address?
 14 MS. KOTT: Objection. Don't answer. That's
 15 personal and private information.
 16 MR. CHOATE: Will you agree to accept service
 17 on behalf of Ms. Perkins-Ali?
 18 MS. KOTT: She's a plaintiff in the suit.
 19 BY MR. CHOATE:
 20 Q. When did you become a plaintiff in this
 21 lawsuit?
 22 A. I really could not say when. I really could
 23 not say.
 24 Q. I want to go through with you and get a list of
 25 the classes that you took during your 12th grade year

1 and your 11th grade year, and I'll break it down by
 2 semester. Is Locke High School, at the time you
 3 attended it, was it on a semester system?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. You had a fall semester at the beginning of the
 6 year and then a spring semester?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. We'll go through your 12th grade year, starting
 9 from the spring semester and work our way backwards.
 10 Okay?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Do you recall what classes you took during your
 13 spring semester of your 12th grade year?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. What did you take?
 16 A. First period I took economics, AP economics;
 17 second period I took chemistry; third period I took
 18 geometry; fourth period I took choir or chorus; fifth
 19 period I took -- what English is that? -- AP English. I
 20 don't know what type of English was it. Sixth period I
 21 took Spanish.
 22 Q. I'll try to do this a little differently. Let
 23 me ask you first, though: In the spring semester of
 24 your 12th year, did you actually take AP government and
 25 politics or was it AP economics?

1 A. AP economics.
 2 Q. In the fall semester of your 12th grade year
 3 you took AP economics?
 4 A. AP U.S. history. I mean AP -- what is that
 5 before economics? I apologize. It was AP government.
 6 Q. And you also took chemistry?
 7 A. Also took chemistry.
 8 Q. You also took geometry and chorus?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. And you took AP English literature?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. And Spanish?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Let me run through your 11th grade classes with
 15 you. In the spring semester, the second semester of
 16 your 11th grade year --
 17 A. Yes.
 18 Q. -- did you take -- you took geometry?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Okay. What classes did you take during the
 21 spring semester of your 11th grade year?
 22 A. Let's see. I took AP history.
 23 Q. I'm going to introduce some exhibits. I think
 24 it will make it a little bit easier.
 25 Mark as Exhibit 3 a document that has two

1 report cards, dated March 2001 and November 2000.
 2 (The document referred to was marked by the
 3 reporter as Exhibit 3 for identification and is attached
 4 hereto.)
 5 MR. CHOATE: Why don't we mark as Exhibit 4 a
 6 document that has two report cards, dated June 2001 and
 7 November 1999.
 8 (The document referred to was marked by the
 9 reporter as Exhibit 4 for identification and is attached
 10 hereto.)
 11 BY MR. CHOATE:
 12 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, would you take a look at
 13 Exhibit 4?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. At the bottom of the page there's a report card
 16 dated November '99; do you see that?
 17 A. Yes. Yes, I do.
 18 Q. Are the classes that are listed in the subject
 19 column, are those classes that you took during your
 20 spring semester of your 11th grade year?
 21 A. My fall.
 22 Q. Those are your fall classes?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. You see the course that is in the second period
 25 row?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. What is that?
 3 A. That was child development. It was a child
 4 development class.
 5 Q. Infant study lab?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. What classes did you take during the spring
 8 semester of your 11th grade year?
 9 A. I took -- first period it was AP history.
 10 Period two was print shop. Three was U.S. history B.
 11 Fourth, fourth period, was chorus B. Fifth period
 12 was -- I changed it because algebra 1-A was four. I
 13 can't recall what I took fifth period.
 14 Q. Was it a math class?
 15 A. No, it wasn't. It was something else. And
 16 fifth period was American lit composition.
 17 Q. American lit comp was sixth period?
 18 A. Yes. Fifth period -- now I remember. It was
 19 science -- integrated science two. I had to take that
 20 class over.
 21 Q. Did you have the same teachers in both the fall
 22 semester and spring semester of your 11th grade year for
 23 AP history, U.S. history and chorus and American lit?
 24 MS. KOTT: Objection. Compound.
 25 THE WITNESS: I can answer that?

1 MS. KOTT: If you understand it and can follow
 2 it, yes.
 3 THE WITNESS: I had the same teacher, which was
 4 American art history, AP art history.
 5 BY MR. CHOATE:
 6 Q. That was Montevalli?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. Who was your print shop teacher?
 9 A. [REDACTED]
 10 Q. Could you spell that?
 11 A. [REDACTED]
 12 Q. And who was your history teacher during the
 13 spring semester of your 11th grade year?
 14 A. Ms. Shaw, the same teacher.
 15 Q. And who was your chorus teacher during the
 16 spring semester?
 17 A. Mr. Andrews.
 18 Q. What about your integrated science teacher?
 19 A. Ms. Williams.
 20 Q. And who was your American lit teacher?
 21 A. A substitute from my old school, Ms. Williams.
 22 Q. A different Ms. Williams than you had for
 23 integrated science?
 24 A. A different, yes.
 25 Q. This Ms. Williams for American lit, she was one

1 of your teachers at Gardena High School?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. You see the report card that's on the top of
 4 Exhibit 4?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. Were those classes -- when did you take these
 7 classes?
 8 A. These aren't my classes. These are my sister's
 9 classes.
 10 Q. Those are your sister's classes?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. I'm going to ask you some questions about the
 13 spring semester of your 12th grade year. Okay?
 14 A. Okay.
 15 Q. Did you have any classes during the spring
 16 semester of your 12th grade year in which the teacher
 17 did not use a textbook in the class?
 18 A. Yes. My second period, which was chemistry.
 19 We didn't receive our books until the second half -- the
 20 middle half of the second semester.
 21 Q. Let me ask you the question a little bit
 22 differently.
 23 Did you have any classes during the spring
 24 semester of your 12th grade year in which a teacher
 25 didn't use books at all for the entire semester?

1 MS. KOTT: I'm sorry, I object as vague. Do
 2 you mean they didn't have books or they chose not to use
 3 books?
 4 BY MR. CHOATE:
 5 Q. Did you have any teachers that chose not to use
 6 textbooks --
 7 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 8 MR. CHOATE: Let me finish my question first.
 9 Q. Did you have any teachers that chose not to use
 10 textbooks, to your knowledge, during your spring
 11 semester of your 12th grade year?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Did you have any classes during the spring
 14 semester of your 12th grade year in which you didn't
 15 have a textbook to use in class at any point in time?
 16 A. At any point in time?
 17 Q. Yes.
 18 A. Second period, chemistry. Let me see. Also my
 19 fifth period, AP American -- AP English.
 20 Q. Other than in your chemistry class and your AP
 21 English class, were there any other classes during the
 22 spring semester of your 12th grade year in which you
 23 didn't have a textbook to use in class at any point in
 24 time?
 25 A. No.

1 Q. Aside from AP chemistry -- let me withdraw
 2 that.
 3 Aside from chemistry and AP English, you had a
 4 textbook to use in class in all of your other classes in
 5 the spring semester of your 12th grade year; is that
 6 correct?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 MR. CHOATE: Could you read back the question
 9 that I asked her?
 10 (Record read.)
 11 BY MR. CHOATE:
 12 Q. Let's talk about your chemistry class during
 13 the second semester of your 12th grade year. Did the
 14 teacher use a book in that class, a textbook, to teach
 15 the class?
 16 A. The only copy he had, which was the teacher's
 17 edition. He tried his best way he could, tried to share
 18 information that was in his book.
 19 Q. Do you know what that book was called?
 20 A. It was called "Chemistry by Holt." It's a new
 21 edition.
 22 Q. Can you spell that, the Holt?
 23 A. H O L T.
 24 Q. Was there any point in time in your chemistry
 25 class when students had copies of this textbook to use

1 in class?
 2 A. When he -- I think he gave, best estimate I can
 3 give, was about -- he gave three stapled booklets that
 4 he had copied from his book. It was like a section out
 5 of a chapter. He gave us three of those.
 6 Q. Were you ever issued a book in your chemistry
 7 class at any point in time?
 8 A. Yes. It was during second semester, in the
 9 middle of it, right before school ended.
 10 Q. When you say it was right before school ended,
 11 what do you mean?
 12 A. So it was like -- second semester started in
 13 February. It was around April or May. Actually, it was
 14 April when we received our books, as a matter of fact.
 15 Q. Were you issued your own copy of the chemistry
 16 textbook sometime in April 2001?
 17 A. Yes, we were.
 18 Q. Were other students issued copies of the
 19 chemistry textbook?
 20 A. Yes, they were.
 21 Q. Were you allowed to take your copy of the
 22 chemistry textbook home at night after class?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Between the time the class started in February
 25 and sometime in April when you received your textbook,

- 1 what materials did the teacher use to teach chemistry?
 2 A. His book. And he would write -- he used a
 3 overhead projector to explain some of it, but it was
 4 kind of hard to explain when you really didn't have a
 5 book to see. So he used the overhead projector and his
 6 book. And he has an accent, so it's really hard to
 7 understand.
 8 Q. Did he use any hand-outs in chemistry during
 9 the time when students didn't have a textbook?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. What kind of hand-outs did he use?
 12 A. Hand-outs, the ones he photocopied from his
 13 book, those hand-outs.
 14 Q. I think you indicated that the teacher provided
 15 students with three different portions of the teacher's
 16 textbook.
 17 A. Yes. That's the hand-outs he gave us. It was
 18 a chapter we were studying in. It was hard to visualize
 19 what he was trying to teach, so he took his book and he
 20 photocopied it and gave us the part that we really
 21 needed to learn.
 22 Q. Did he copy three different chapters for the
 23 students?
 24 A. He copied three different sections.
 25 Q. And he provided copies of these three different

- 1 sections to all students in the class?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Did your teacher use any other materials during
 4 the first half of this class to teach the students,
 5 other than the photocopies you've told me about and the
 6 overhead projector, before you had textbooks?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. He didn't provide students with any other
 9 hand-outs?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Any other worksheets?
 12 A. Not till the second semester when we received
 13 our books.
 14 Q. I'm actually only asking you questions about
 15 the second semester, the spring semester of your 12th
 16 grade year.
 17 A. Spring semester, that's when he handed some
 18 hand-outs.
 19 Q. Let me clarify what I'm asking. In the spring
 20 semester all of the students in the class received
 21 textbooks sometime in April of 2001?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. So there were about two and a half months at
 24 the beginning of that spring semester in which students
 25 didn't have textbooks?

- 1 A. Correct.
 2 Q. During that period of time, I want to get a
 3 sense of what materials the teacher used to teach
 4 chemistry in class, and you told me that the teacher
 5 used the overhead projector and he provided students
 6 with some photocopies of his textbook.
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. Did he use any other type of materials to teach
 9 chemistry during that time?
 10 A. Yes. Some hand-outs he got from a work book
 11 that wasn't from the same book that we were -- that we
 12 received that April.
 13 Q. Did he provide students -- and did he provide
 14 students, all of the students, in the class with
 15 hand-outs from that work book?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Did your chemistry teacher provide students
 18 with any other types of materials during that period of
 19 time?
 20 A. No.
 21 Q. How often did your chemistry teacher provide
 22 students with hand-outs during the period of time --
 23 A. Every two weeks.
 24 Q. Every two weeks?
 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Did he provide usually the hand-outs on a
 2 Monday or a certain day?
 3 A. Monday.
 4 Q. When the teacher provided students with
 5 hand-outs every two weeks, approximately how many
 6 hand-outs would each student receive?
 7 A. Sometimes we would receive, like, one or two.
 8 Two at the most.
 9 Q. And were the hand-outs, to your knowledge,
 10 intended to cover the material that you would learn
 11 during the subsequent two weeks?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. After the students received their textbooks in
 14 April 2001, did your teacher continue to provide
 15 students with hand-outs?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. Did he continue to provide students with
 18 hand-outs approximately every two weeks?
 19 A. This time it was -- he split up the process by
 20 giving it to us every week.
 21 Q. Prior to the time when the students received
 22 their books, how did the teacher in your chemistry class
 23 assign homework to students?
 24 MS. KOTT: Are we still talking about the
 25 second semester?

1 MR. CHOATE: Yes, we're only talking about the
2 second semester.

3 THE WITNESS: He would write questions on the
4 board that we have to copy, and we would have to go --
5 he wrote them on the board, we copied them, pertaining
6 to, like, some of the hand-outs he had given us. And
7 whatever we couldn't find, we had to go on the Internet.
8 He said we'd have to go on the Internet to see if we
9 could find them. And if we couldn't, he said come to
10 class and we'll try to discuss it or try to answer the
11 question.

12 BY MR. CHOATE:

13 Q. He told students to try to go on the Internet
14 to try to find the answer to the questions that were
15 assigned for homework?

16 A. Yeah. Some of the questions, if we couldn't
17 find them in the worksheet.

18 Q. Did he ask students to do any other types of
19 research in order to complete homework assignments,
20 other than using the Internet?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Do you feel that your ability to obtain a
23 quality education was impaired because you didn't have a
24 textbook to use during the first two months of your
25 chemistry class in the second semester of your 12th

1 you learn chemistry?

2 A. Because the chapter we were on was, like,
3 towards the ending of the book. Then you have to go
4 back to the beginning of the book to understand the
5 ending, so I really couldn't understand it. I really
6 could not understand it.

7 Q. Did your class change at all when students
8 received the textbooks sometime in April of 2001?

9 MS. KOTT: Objection. Vague.

10 THE WITNESS: Change? Yes, it did.

11 BY MR. CHOATE:

12 Q. How did it change?

13 A. Well, people that received the book really were
14 trying to -- how can I put this? Before we received the
15 book it was more of, like, everybody didn't understand
16 what we was supposed to do, or it was -- we didn't
17 have -- we used to study -- we didn't study in groups or
18 anything like that to try and understand. But when we
19 did get the books, what little time, we did get into
20 groups to try to teach each other the understanding of
21 the book. And it really didn't help at all, but it was
22 worth a try.

23 Q. Having the book didn't help you because
24 chemistry is a confusing subject?

25 A. I mean, if I would have -- I know if I would

1 grade year?

2 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for expert
3 testimony. Go ahead and answer.

4 THE WITNESS: Could you clarify that a little
5 bit?

6 MR. CHOATE: Sure.

7 Q. Do you feel you received a bad education
8 because you didn't have a textbook in the first couple
9 of months of your chemistry class in the second semester
10 of 12th grade?

11 A. Yes, I really do. Because it's now I really --
12 if I would have -- I would have probably had a better
13 understanding, but I don't now. Chemistry is still
14 confusing to me. It really is. Those last two months
15 really didn't -- it helped a little bit. It didn't help
16 as good as it should have been.

17 Q. The last two months after you received the
18 textbook?

19 A. After I received the textbook.

20 Q. Having the textbook in the last two months
21 didn't really help you get a grasp of chemistry?

22 A. Yes, it really didn't.

23 Q. I'm sorry, it did not?

24 A. It did not.

25 Q. And why do you think the textbook didn't help

1 have received that book in the beginning of the school
2 year, I probably would have had a better understanding,
3 much more better than I didn't know or don't know. But
4 by -- when it came to the last half of the semester,
5 second semester, it was, like, really no use.

6 Q. And why was the book of no use?

7 A. Because I was graduating pretty -- within two
8 months, and the chemistry book -- we, like I said, we
9 started the last chapter, the last few chapters, and you
10 couldn't really understand it because you're missing all
11 the information from the beginning.

12 Q. When you received your textbook, did you go
13 back to the beginning portions of the textbook to try
14 to --

15 A. To try understand? Yes, I did.

16 Q. And that didn't help you?

17 A. It didn't help because I didn't know where to
18 begin to understand that part.

19 Q. Did you seek help from your teacher after class
20 ever?

21 A. Yes, I did. It was many times I would take
22 from my nutrition break or my lunch break and go and try
23 to understand, but it was like I can't understand. How
24 can he teach me in such little time? The nutrition
25 break was 20 minutes and the lunch break was like 35.

1 Although he tried to explain, it helped a little bit, it
 2 didn't help as much.
 3 Q. You received a [redacted] in your chemistry class in
 4 second semester 12th grade; is that right?
 5 A. Yes, I did.
 6 Q. Why do you think you got the [redacted] in that class?
 7 A. My test scores were low. I'm not going to sit
 8 here and lie. My test scores were low because some of
 9 the things that was on the test I didn't understand.
 10 Q. And do you attribute your lack of understanding
 11 in chemistry only to the fact that you didn't have a
 12 textbook for some portion of the class?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Are there any other reasons?
 15 A. No. Because if I didn't do my homework and try
 16 to understand, I would have had a fail. By me doing my
 17 homework really helped me. It was just some of the
 18 information on the test I didn't have in my homework.
 19 It was, like, the tests were like reviewing of the whole
 20 beginning of the chapters. It was just like a review.
 21 And the questions on the test from the chapters I didn't
 22 know because it was, like, only knew basically the last
 23 few chapters of the book.
 24 Q. Prior to the time when students received a
 25 textbook in chemistry, how often did the teacher assign

1 homework every night? How often did the teacher assign
 2 homework?
 3 A. Whenever we received a hand-out, which was,
 4 like, before we received the textbooks. It was due at
 5 the end of every week. Because we would get, like,
 6 assigned every two weeks, so one would be -- one would
 7 be due at the end of one week, the other one would be
 8 due at the end of the second week or so. It was like
 9 that.
 10 Q. Other than those -- I'm sorry. Go ahead.
 11 A. It was more of like a package, two different
 12 packages for each week.
 13 Q. And once students received their textbooks, did
 14 the teacher assign homework in the same manner?
 15 A. No. It was more like a every other day.
 16 Q. Every other day?
 17 A. Every other day.
 18 Q. And how would the teacher assign homework in
 19 chemistry once students received the textbook?
 20 A. We would receive a section in the chapter and
 21 answer the questions at the end of the section.
 22 Q. And you would do that every other day?
 23 A. Every other day.
 24 Q. How often did you spend, prior to the time when
 25 you received a textbook in chemistry, how much time did

1 you spend at night doing homework in chemistry?
 2 A. In chemistry, like, really not easy, but a
 3 little difficult, my understanding of it. I spent,
 4 like, 30, 40 minutes on it, just on it alone.
 5 Q. Per night?
 6 A. Per night every other night that he assigned it
 7 to us. Sometimes I get a jump start and do it in class
 8 when I had free time, or I'd go to the library sometimes
 9 at lunch, or when I'm just sitting at lunch with my
 10 sister, get bored, and try to do it, try to figure it
 11 out.
 12 Q. Prior to the time you got the textbook in
 13 chemistry, did you do homework in chemistry every night?
 14 A. We received packages. So it was, like, I would
 15 work on it a little every day.
 16 Q. Okay.
 17 A. A little every day until it was due.
 18 Q. And you would work about 30 to 40 minutes a day
 19 every day on your assignments?
 20 A. On the packages. They were like -- they were a
 21 little bit much easier than the book because the
 22 package, it came from a different -- it came from a work
 23 book. It came from a work book.
 24 MR. CHOATE: Let's go off the record.
 25 (Telephone interruption.)

1 MR. CHOATE: Let's go back on.
 2 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, my question is just this:
 3 Prior to the time you received your textbook in
 4 chemistry class, about how often per night did you spend
 5 studying chemistry?
 6 A. Can you repeat that? I'm sorry. I apologize.
 7 Q. Prior to the time you received your textbook in
 8 chemistry class, approximately how much time per night
 9 did you spend studying chemistry or working on your
 10 homework assignments?
 11 A. About 30.
 12 Q. About 30 minutes per night?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. And after you received your textbook in
 15 chemistry, about how often per night did you spend
 16 studying chemistry?
 17 A. A little over 40. Because it took more to
 18 understand it.
 19 Q. Was the book that you received, that students
 20 received, in April 2001, was that a new book?
 21 A. Yes, it was a new edition.
 22 Q. Do you have any understanding as to why
 23 students in your chemistry class did not have textbooks
 24 prior to April of 2001?
 25 A. No.

1 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 2 I'm sorry.
 3 MR. CHOATE: I asked her if she had any
 4 understanding why. It just calls for what she knows.
 5 MS. KOTT: She can answer.
 6 THE WITNESS: No.
 7 BY MR. CHOATE:
 8 Q. Did you ask anybody why students in your class
 9 didn't have textbooks during that period of time?
 10 A. I asked my teacher, and he really -- he really
 11 couldn't answer. He couldn't answer that. As a matter
 12 of fact, I asked him a couple of times, and he told me,
 13 "I don't know. I don't know." That's what he said to
 14 me.
 15 Q. After you received your textbook in April 2001,
 16 did the teacher in your chemistry class ever give
 17 homework assignments that didn't require you to use the
 18 textbook?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. The only homework assignments the teacher ever
 21 assigned were directly from the textbook?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. Do you have any complaints about the textbook
 24 that you received in April 2001?
 25 A. Only that the fact that we received them late.

1 Other than that, no.
 2 Q. You also indicated that you didn't have -- more
 3 students didn't have textbooks for some period of time
 4 in your AP English class during your second semester of
 5 your 12th grade year.
 6 A. We didn't receive books at all. Only thing we
 7 received was for report. That was the only books we
 8 received that we could check out.
 9 Q. What materials did your teacher use in your AP
 10 English class to teach the class?
 11 A. She used -- that teacher, she was pretty
 12 much -- she worked there for a certain amount of years,
 13 so she -- what she had from over the years she used on
 14 us. We didn't have books, so she used some worksheets
 15 that she put together.
 16 Q. Some what that she put together?
 17 A. Some worksheets that she put together and gave
 18 to us. For example, like the definitions that we had,
 19 those were words that she had got from -- words they
 20 used in college that she made us look up and define.
 21 She would make us write them into sentences, use them in
 22 paragraphs and essays. That's basically how she taught
 23 us. And she taught us, like, the review of the basics
 24 with the nouns and pronouns. Then she told us about --
 25 she give us, like, little short stories that she copied

1 from -- photocopied from a book that she made questions
 2 to that we had to answer. And like at the end, towards
 3 the middle, a little after the second semester had
 4 begun, she had issued us books from the library that we
 5 have to do the report on, and that's the only books we
 6 received.
 7 Q. And what books were those?
 8 A. Literature books. I mean, like, novels. I'm
 9 sorry. Novels such as Shakespeare, Othello. I can give
 10 you examples. Othello, Macbeth, A Midsummer's Night.
 11 Those are the types of books we received.
 12 Q. Did all students receive a copy of these books?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Did the teacher provide students with copies of
 15 Pride and Prejudice?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. What about anything else? Do you recall any
 18 other novels that the teacher provided you with?
 19 A. Throughout the whole school year those were the
 20 only two books we received.
 21 Q. I'm talking -- all right. "Throughout the
 22 school year," are you referring to both the fall and
 23 spring semester?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. And how often did -- well, these books that the

1 teacher provided students, she provided all of the
 2 students these books in the middle semester, in the
 3 middle of the second semester?
 4 A. A little before the middle of the second
 5 semester.
 6 Q. After she provided students these books, did
 7 she continue to provide students with hand-outs or
 8 worksheets?
 9 A. Yes, she did.
 10 Q. How often, approximately, did your teacher
 11 provide you with hand-outs and worksheets?
 12 A. Every week.
 13 Q. And were your homework assignments based on
 14 those hand-outs and worksheets that you received?
 15 A. Yes, they were.
 16 Q. Did all students receive copies of hand-outs
 17 and worksheets?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. On a weekly basis?
 20 A. On a weekly basis.
 21 Q. You mentioned these plays by Shakespeare. Were
 22 they all in one volume or were they in different
 23 volumes?
 24 A. They were different volumes.
 25 Q. And all students received copies of these

1 plays?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Were you allowed to take these books you
 4 received home?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. Every night?
 7 A. Those books were issued for us to read and the
 8 report would be due back on a certain day. They were
 9 due back on the day of our reports when they were due.
 10 Q. And how long were you given, approximately, how
 11 long were students given to read, let's say, one of the
 12 plays by Shakespeare and to write a report on that play?
 13 A. A month.
 14 Q. How many of these types of reports did students
 15 have to write?
 16 A. One for Shakespeare.
 17 Q. What about for Pride and Prejudice?
 18 A. Pride and Prejudice, we just read that as a
 19 class.
 20 Q. You only did one book report during the second
 21 semester of your 12th grade year in AP English?
 22 A. Yes, one book report.
 23 Q. How often per night did you do homework in your
 24 AP English class in the second semester of your 12th
 25 grade year?

1 MS. KOTT: I'm sorry, I object. That's vague.
 2 Do you mean how long per night or just how often?
 3 MR. CHOATE: I'll ask it again.
 4 Q. How long per night did you study in your
 5 English class in the second semester of your 12th grade
 6 year?
 7 A. About 15 minutes per night.
 8 Q. 15?
 9 A. 15.
 10 Q. Can you describe for me the condition of the
 11 books that you received in your English class?
 12 A. Of the Shakespearean plays, they were condition
 13 D, in bad shape.
 14 Q. I'm sorry, when you say "condition D," what
 15 does that refer to?
 16 A. I guess it's the -- I mean, I'm assuming it's
 17 the lowest. Pages were ripping. When I received my
 18 books, the cover -- okay -- the pages were ripping off,
 19 pages from the books were -- like you would turn it and
 20 it would rip. They were pretty old books.
 21 Q. Let me back up for a second and ask you: Is
 22 there a procedure or practice in place at Locke High
 23 School that is used when students are issued textbooks?
 24 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 25 THE WITNESS: Can you be more specific about

1 that?
 2 MR. CHOATE: Sure.
 3 Q. When you're issued textbooks at a class, do you
 4 have to fill out any sort of documentation?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. What do you have to fill out?
 7 A. A white and blue card.
 8 Q. What kind of information do you have to put on
 9 that card?
 10 A. Just my home room number, my address, phone
 11 number, and the class that it's been issued number and
 12 the title of the book.
 13 Q. Is the textbook that a student receives, is it
 14 referred to by letter grade on these white and blue
 15 cards that designates the --
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. What does the grade stand for?
 18 A. The grade? Grade A stands for brand new, B
 19 used but still in good condition, and C is used and
 20 pretty bad shape, and D is like totally demolished. I
 21 mean, still in good use, but not as good as it should be
 22 or used to be.
 23 Q. And when a student turns back in a book at the
 24 end of the school year, does the teacher, to your
 25 knowledge, check to see what the condition of the book

1 is in?
 2 A. Yes. She looks at them before she issues them
 3 and lets you know what grade to put on them. I'm
 4 assuming that the way you receive is the way she want it
 5 back. So for mine I had to put tape on my book just to
 6 tape back the pages.
 7 Q. What book are you referring to?
 8 A. My Othello book.
 9 Q. When you were issued a copy of the Shakespeare
 10 book in your English class, what grade was the book
 11 assigned?
 12 A. D.
 13 Q. And when you turned it back in, do you know
 14 what grade the book was?
 15 A. It was still considered D.
 16 Q. Other than the fact that there were some pages
 17 that, I think you said, were ripping, were there any
 18 other problems with that textbook?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. About how many pages were -- were any of the
 21 pages missing from the textbook?
 22 A. No.
 23 Q. They were kind of torn or falling out?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. Were you still able to read the textbook?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. Did the fact that some of the pages were -- had
 3 rips in them, did that prevent you from understanding
 4 the material that you read?
 5 A. No.
 6 Q. Do you have any other complaints about the
 7 Shakespeare book that you received?
 8 A. No.
 9 Q. And what Shakespeare book was it, again, that
 10 you received?
 11 A. Othello.
 12 Q. And did you receive any other Shakespeare
 13 books?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. You also received a copy of Pride and
 16 Prejudice?
 17 A. Yes.
 18 Q. And when you were issued that book, what was
 19 the condition of that book?
 20 A. A.
 21 Q. And when you turned it back in what condition?
 22 A. A.
 23 Q. Do you have any complaints about the Pride and
 24 Prejudice book you received?
 25 A. None at all.

1 MS. KOTT: Could we go off the record for a
 2 moment?
 3 MR. CHOATE: Yes.
 4 (Discussion held off the record.)
 5 MR. CHOATE: Let's go back on the record.
 6 Q. Do you have any idea why your AP English
 7 teacher didn't use a textbook in your English class in
 8 the second semester of your 12th grade year?
 9 A. No.
 10 Q. Did you ever ask?
 11 A. No. Because the one she gave was good enough.
 12 It really was. It was more than enough. I never did
 13 ask. I felt like I was learning -- actually, I felt I
 14 was learning more from her than the textbook. I didn't
 15 have any problem.
 16 Q. You thought you were learning more from your
 17 English teacher than you could learn from a textbook?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Why do you say that?
 20 A. Because the years that she can back up with
 21 teaching. I mean, she's had quite a history of
 22 teaching, and all that I heard about her was very good.
 23 Believe me, when I got to her class, she was. We had a
 24 lot of homework, but it was worth it. It was really
 25 worth it.

1 Q. Do you think that -- I mean, it sounds like you
 2 had a good teacher in your English class, you were
 3 pretty lucky.
 4 A. Was one of the best that I had.
 5 Q. And what made -- was it a she?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. What made Ms. --
 8 A. Ms. Moroney.
 9 Q. -- what made Ms. Maloney a good teacher?
 10 A. You feel like when people talk to you, you can
 11 tell if they really care. She made me feel that way.
 12 She made me very safe and secure in that class, and she
 13 taught with care, a lot of care and understanding, so
 14 that was one of the best things about her. That's why I
 15 enjoyed her class a lot.
 16 Q. Do you think other students felt that way about
 17 Ms. Moroney?
 18 A. I can speak for the majority of them. Yes, I
 19 can.
 20 Q. Do you think that -- would you consider that
 21 you received a good education in your English class?
 22 A. Oh, yes, I do. I really do, yes.
 23 Q. Do you think that you needed a textbook in that
 24 class to -- or do you think you would have learned
 25 something more in that class with a textbook?

1 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 2 THE WITNESS: Can you clarify that for me?
 3 BY MR. CHOATE:
 4 Q. Well, I mean, do you think you needed a
 5 textbook in that class to learn English?
 6 MS. KOTT: Same objection.
 7 THE WITNESS: It probably would have enhanced
 8 it a little more, but, to my knowledge, I really was
 9 doing fine without the textbook in that class. I really
 10 was.
 11 BY MR. CHOATE:
 12 Q. How do you think that having a textbook would
 13 have enhanced the class a little bit more?
 14 A. Well, I probably would have learned -- let me
 15 see. The textbook -- because they discussed, like, some
 16 of the stories that she was telling us that she
 17 photocopied from a book, it probably would have been
 18 more in depth than the photocopies would have because
 19 sometimes the photocopies wouldn't come out right and we
 20 couldn't see clearly and all that we couldn't see she
 21 would tell us. And I don't know. I really am stuck on
 22 this one. But more than -- probably, sure, it would
 23 have enhanced a little, but I think we did fine without
 24 a textbook in there.
 25 Q. Other than in your -- and I'm still talking

1 about the first semester -- I'm sorry, the second
 2 semester of your 12th grade year -- other than in your
 3 chemistry class and your English class, did you have a
 4 textbook to use in all of your other classes?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. And in those other classes were you able to
 7 take your textbook home at night as well?
 8 A. No.
 9 Q. In what class --
 10 A. Okay.
 11 Q. Just tell me in what other classes in the
 12 second semester of your 12th grade year did you have a
 13 textbook but you couldn't take the textbook home.
 14 A. My geometry class and my Spanish class.
 15 Q. Those are the only ones?
 16 A. Those were the only ones.
 17 Q. Okay.
 18 If you want to take a break here, we can go
 19 ahead and take a lunch break.
 20 MS. KOTT: That's up to you.
 21 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 22 (Lunch recess.)
 23
 24
 25

1 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA; TUESDAY, DECEMBER 4, 2001
 2 1:10 P.M.
 3
 4
 5 FURTHER EXAMINATION
 6
 7 BY MR. CHOATE:
 8 Q. Back on the record.
 9 Good afternoon, Ms. Perkins-Ali. Do you
 10 realize you're still under oath?
 11 A. Yes, sir.
 12 Q. Is there any reason why you can't provide your
 13 best testimony this afternoon?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. I'm going to go back and ask you a few more
 16 questions about your AP English class and your chemistry
 17 class.
 18 You indicated that the copy of Pride and
 19 Prejudice that you received in your second semester was
 20 in the A condition.
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. Do you know the condition of -- did other
 23 students in your class receive copies of Pride and
 24 Prejudice?
 25 A. Yes, they did.

1 Q. Were their textbooks also in the A condition?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. What about the copies of the Shakespeare
 4 textbook that other students received, do you know what
 5 condition they were in?
 6 A. Midsummer's Night, that was a B, it was
 7 hardback. The books Othello and Macbeth, Macbeth was
 8 also hardback, and that was A.
 9 Q. But your copy of --
 10 A. -- Othello was paperback.
 11 Q. And your copy was a D?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. Did other students have copies of Othello that
 14 were in a condition other than D, to your knowledge?
 15 A. I think the whole collection of -- the whole
 16 series of Othello were D condition.
 17 Q. And I think you indicated that during the
 18 second semester of your 12th grade year your teacher
 19 also provided, in AP English, your teacher also provided
 20 hand-outs and worksheets that were photocopied from
 21 other books.
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. Do you know how many other books the hand-outs
 24 and worksheets were photocopied from?
 25 A. No.

1 Q. Was it more than five, to your knowledge?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Was it more than 10?
 4 A. Possibly, yes.
 5 Q. Could it have been more than 20?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. Somewhere between 10 and 20?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. Do you know why your teacher decided to provide
 10 students in her class with hand-outs and worksheets that
 11 were copied from between 10 to 20 different books?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Did you ever ask her?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. Did she ever tell you?
 16 A. No.
 17 Q. You had the same teacher for AP English during
 18 your first semester?
 19 A. Yes.
 20 Q. During your first semester of AP English in
 21 12th grade, did your teacher also provide all of the
 22 students in her class with hand-outs and worksheets on a
 23 weekly basis?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. And were those hand-outs and worksheets for use

- 1 by students in doing their homework on a nightly basis?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Was your AP English teacher as good of a
 4 teacher in the first semester as she was in the second
 5 semester?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. You feel that you learned as much from her
 8 during the first semester as you did during the second
 9 semester?
 10 A. Can you clarify that more?
 11 Q. Do you have any complaints about her
 12 classroom --
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. -- in terms of the availability of
 15 instructional materials in the first semester?
 16 A. No.
 17 Q. Do you have any complaints about the
 18 availability of instructional materials in her class in
 19 the second semester?
 20 A. No.
 21 Q. Let me ask you another question. In the first
 22 semester of your AP English class in 12th grade, did you
 23 receive any novels or books that you read, you know, to
 24 do book reports, things like that?
 25 A. Yes. That was my Othello book I received in

- 1 the first semester and it continued till the second
 2 semester.
 3 Q. You read Othello both in the first semester and
 4 the second semester?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. And did you prepare a report on Othello?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. And you prepared that both in the first and
 9 second semester?
 10 A. Yes. It was the same. It was the same book.
 11 It was the ending of the second half -- it was the
 12 ending of the first semester and it continued into the
 13 second semester.
 14 Q. What about Pride and Prejudice, did that
 15 overlap?
 16 A. That was towards the ending of the second
 17 semester.
 18 Q. Did you use the same copy of Othello in both
 19 the first semester and the second semester?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. Other than the Othello and the Pride and
 22 Prejudice, did you receive any other books or use any
 23 other books in that class?
 24 A. Macbeth.
 25 Q. Did you receive your own copy of Macbeth to

- 1 read?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. What condition was that in?
 4 A. A.
 5 Q. Did every other student in the class receive a
 6 copy of Macbeth?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. Were they also in A condition?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Were students allowed to take those copies of
 11 Macbeth home to read at night?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. Did you receive any other books in your AP
 14 English class?
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. Sorry if you already told me this, but the copy
 17 of Macbeth, did you receive that in your first semester
 18 or second semester?
 19 A. Second.
 20 Q. Let me ask you a few questions about your
 21 chemistry class.
 22 I think you indicated that you received -- all
 23 the students in the class received new textbooks that
 24 they could use in class and take home --
 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. -- sometime in April 2001.
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. And prior to April 2001 -- in other words,
 4 during the beginning of the second semester -- your
 5 teacher provided all of the students with hand-outs and
 6 worksheets approximately once every two weeks?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. Did your teacher provide -- did you have the
 9 same chemistry teacher in your first semester?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. Did your chemistry teacher provide worksheets
 12 and hand-outs to students once every two weeks in the
 13 first semester as well?
 14 A. He didn't really start that until middle of the
 15 first semester. That's when he started handing out
 16 worksheets. But the first semester he didn't really
 17 come. He came, like, twice every week.
 18 Q. When did your first semester begin?
 19 A. September the -- I think it was the 14th. It
 20 was the 14th.
 21 Q. Of 2000?
 22 A. Of 2000.
 23 Q. And when did your first semester end?
 24 A. February, beginning of February 2001.
 25 Q. During what month, approximately, during the

1 first semester did your chemistry teacher begin handing
 2 out worksheets and hand-outs once every two weeks?
 3 A. The ending of October and beginning of
 4 November.
 5 Q. And from that time until the end of the first
 6 semester, you received all -- all the students in the
 7 class received these hand-outs on a roughly bi-weekly
 8 basis?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. And those hand-outs were intended to assist
 11 students in doing their homework assignments each night
 12 over that two-week period?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. During the second semester -- I'm sorry -- the
 15 first semester, did your chemistry teacher use any other
 16 materials to teach the class chemistry?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. You indicated that he used the overhead
 19 projector.
 20 A. That was when he was handing out the hand-outs.
 21 Q. Your teacher only used the overhead on the days
 22 when the hand-outs were provided to students?
 23 A. Yes. And sometimes when we already had the
 24 hand-outs he will bring out the overhead projector to
 25 try to give another understanding of the

1 worksheets/hand-outs.
 2 Q. And he did that whenever the class would go
 3 over the work that they had done relative to a given
 4 hand-out?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. Did he do that during the first semester also?
 7 A. When he started giving out the hand-outs.
 8 Q. Prior to the time in October of 2000, roughly,
 9 when your teacher started giving students hand-outs,
 10 what materials did he provide students in the class
 11 with?
 12 A. Can you clarify that for me?
 13 Q. Yes. Prior to the time when your chemistry
 14 teacher started providing students with worksheets and
 15 hand-outs, which was sometime in October 2000, did your
 16 teacher provide students with any instruction materials
 17 prior to that time?
 18 A. I'm sorry, can you repeat that?
 19 Q. I think you testified that beginning sometime
 20 in October your chemistry teacher started providing
 21 students in your class with hand-outs and worksheets on
 22 a bi-weekly basis.
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Prior to that time, which would be between
 25 September and October --

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. -- during those two months did your teacher use
 3 any instructional materials to teach chemistry to his
 4 students?
 5 A. No, because he only -- he basically showed up
 6 twice a week.
 7 Q. Do you know why he only showed twice a week?
 8 A. No, I do not know.
 9 Q. Did you ask him?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Did you speak with anybody in administration
 12 about that?
 13 A. Yes. I went to the main office. When he
 14 didn't come, we would be standing out there for minutes
 15 until me and a classmate went up to the main office and
 16 told them we had no teacher and then, okay, we're
 17 sending a sub down, get back to class. By the time the
 18 sub got there, the period would be over.
 19 Q. Did you ever learn why your assigned teacher
 20 was absent periodically during those first few months?
 21 A. No.
 22 Q. How many substitutes did you have teach
 23 chemistry to the class during those first two months
 24 when your teacher was absent at times?
 25 A. Five.

1 Q. Do you know their names?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. Are you sure that there were five?
 4 A. I'm positive. I have their faces in my head
 5 right as we speak.
 6 Q. Did the substitutes use any instruction
 7 materials to teach chemistry?
 8 A. No. Because the teacher didn't leave any.
 9 Q. That's not my question. My question was just:
 10 Did the substitutes use any instruction materials to
 11 teach chemistry?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. How did the substitutes teach the class?
 14 A. They didn't teach at all. They just sat there.
 15 Q. Just sat there silent for 50 minutes?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 Q. And you never --
 18 A. While everyone was talking. They would just
 19 sit there.
 20 Q. Were you --
 21 A. Just take roll and just sit there.
 22 Q. Were you ever assigned homework during the
 23 first two months of your chemistry class?
 24 A. No.
 25 Q. Not on one occasion?

1 A. Not on one occasion.
 2 Q. Even on the occasions when your assigned
 3 teacher was present?
 4 A. Not even on those days. We didn't start
 5 receiving hand-outs until the end of October, beginning
 6 of November.
 7 Q. Did you take any examinations, any tests during
 8 the first two months of your chemistry class?
 9 A. No. No.
 10 Q. Do you know why your chemistry teacher started
 11 providing worksheets and hand-outs to students in
 12 October 2000 but not before?
 13 A. No. Might have had something to do with the
 14 students complaining to their parents.
 15 Q. Do you know whether that's true or not?
 16 A. I'm only going by what I heard. Some students
 17 told me that they told their parents that they wasn't
 18 getting any work inside the class, mainly seniors, and I
 19 guess their parents came up there, brought it to
 20 principal's attention and the principal got on his case.
 21 Q. On the teacher's case?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 MS. KOTT: You just said "I guess." Are you
 24 guessing?
 25 THE WITNESS: I'm assuming that's what they

1 did. They told me that they told the teacher. I'm
 2 assuming that is true. I mean the parents.
 3 BY MR. CHOATE:
 4 Q. During the first semester of your chemistry
 5 class, did students have access to textbooks in the
 6 class?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. They didn't have access to any textbooks in the
 9 class?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Not even to old textbooks?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. In your second semester of chemistry --
 14 A. Second semester of chemistry, no.
 15 Q. Let me finish my question first.
 16 A. I'm sorry.
 17 Q. It's okay.
 18 In your second semester of chemistry, between
 19 the beginning of the semester and April 2001 when you
 20 received new textbooks, did students have access to any
 21 textbooks in that class?
 22 A. Okay, yes. There was some old books that was
 23 sent from the book room that they gave us.
 24 Q. When was the class provided with these books
 25 from the book room?

1 A. Right before we got our new ones.
 2 Q. The books from the textbook room, did the class
 3 receive those books in February when the semester began?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Did the class receive them in March?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. When exactly did the class receive them?
 8 A. The first week of April.
 9 Q. The first week of April?
 10 A. (Witness nods head.)
 11 Q. And you used those books, the class used those
 12 books for approximately how long of a period of time?
 13 A. Actually, we didn't really use them. We were
 14 still working on the worksheets, and I -- I'm assuming
 15 that he had got -- he was told, my best estimate is that
 16 he was told that the new books were coming in, and he
 17 just kept us working on the worksheets.
 18 Q. Do you know -- how do you know your teacher was
 19 told the new books were coming in?
 20 A. I don't know. Because the books that were sent
 21 from the book room were just sitting there in the class,
 22 and it wasn't till, like, the middle of April we got our
 23 new books. It was just, like, two weeks after we
 24 received the old books.
 25 Q. How many students were in your chemistry class,

1 approximately?
 2 A. 30.
 3 Q. And how many books were sent from the textbook
 4 room to the class in the beginning of April 2001?
 5 A. Best estimate would be 20. Because there
 6 wasn't enough counting the people and the books
 7 combined.
 8 Q. Did you ever count the books?
 9 A. When we took them back we did.
 10 Q. Did you count the books?
 11 A. Yes, me and a classmate of mine.
 12 Q. And do you remember how many books there were?
 13 A. Uh-huh, yes, I do.
 14 Q. About how many?
 15 A. About 20.
 16 Q. Were those books used in class at all during
 17 April prior to the time that the class received the new
 18 books?
 19 A. No. We were working on hand-outs.
 20 Q. Do you know whether the hand-outs, were they
 21 photocopied from those old books?
 22 A. I didn't pay attention to it.
 23 Q. Did you ever read through one of the old books?
 24 A. No.
 25 Q. Students never actually opened the books in

1 class?
 2 A. No.
 3 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation
 4 BY MR. CHOATE:
 5 Q. Students never used those old books in class?
 6 MS. KOTT: Same objection.
 7 THE WITNESS: No.
 8 BY MR. CHOATE:
 9 Q. Did you ever use one of the old books in class?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Did you ever see any of the other students
 12 using those books in class?
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. Do you know why the books that were sent from
 15 the textbook room were not used in class?
 16 A. No.
 17 Q. I think you mentioned before we took the break
 18 that students had textbooks in geometry and Spanish in
 19 your 12th grade year but they didn't take them home; is
 20 that correct?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. Your geometry class, was that a year-long
 23 class?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. You had the same teacher for the first semester

1 and the second semester?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Did students use the same geometry textbook in
 4 the first semester as the second semester?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. How many students were in your geometry class
 7 in the first semester, approximately?
 8 A. Approximately about 35. It was a very crowded
 9 class.
 10 Q. How many students would you -- how many
 11 students, approximately, were in your geometry class in
 12 the second semester?
 13 A. Approximately 25 to 30.
 14 Q. Why were there fewer students the second
 15 semester? If you know.
 16 A. Some of the students in there, in the beginning
 17 it was a little bit over 35 in the beginning of the
 18 semester, second half semester, but some didn't belong
 19 in there, so he transferred the ones that didn't belong
 20 in there out.
 21 Q. And when you say "he," you're referring to your
 22 teacher?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. How many textbooks were in the class set of
 25 textbooks that you and your classmates used? If you

1 know.
 2 A. I really don't know, but I do know that each
 3 student had their own book.
 4 Q. In both the first semester and the second
 5 semester?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. Do you know what condition the books were in?
 8 I mean, in terms of A, B, C.
 9 A. They were B.
 10 Q. Which means that -- what does that mean again?
 11 They were in pretty good shape?
 12 A. They were in pretty good shape, but they were
 13 used.
 14 Q. Did students in your geometry class use the
 15 textbooks every day in class?
 16 A. Yes, we did.
 17 Q. And how would your geometry teacher assign
 18 homework in your geometry class? And I'm not asking for
 19 first, second semester, I'm just asking throughout the
 20 year.
 21 A. He would write a couple of page numbers on the
 22 board. He would ask us to write the questions down on a
 23 piece of paper and go home, and he'd tell us to do it
 24 for homework. We just write questions after we do our
 25 warm-up.

1 Q. Students would write questions from the book?
 2 A. From the textbook.
 3 Q. And then they would do the questions at home at
 4 night?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. Did your geometry teacher ever provide students
 7 in your class with hand-outs or worksheets?
 8 A. Yes. There were previews for the tests, for
 9 the tests that -- like, we get our previews Thursday,
 10 and was just a preview of the test, pretest. We get our
 11 pretest on that Thursday and we get our test that
 12 Friday, and they were both hand-outs.
 13 Q. So the students in your geometry class received
 14 hand-outs every Thursday in your class?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. And those hand-outs were intended to help
 17 students prepare for the exams which occurred on every
 18 Friday?
 19 A. Yes.
 20 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 21 Go ahead.
 22 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 23 BY MR. CHOATE:
 24 Q. Did your geometry teacher use any other types
 25 of instructional materials in your geometry class?

1 A. No.
 2 Q. Were students allowed to take copies of the
 3 class textbooks home to do homework?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Did you ever ask if you could take one of the
 6 textbooks from the class home?
 7 A. No. Because I would copy my work out of the
 8 book.
 9 Q. But my question is: Did you ever ask your
 10 teacher whether you could take one of the class books
 11 home?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Does Locke High School have a library?
 14 A. Yes, they do.
 15 Q. Do you know whether the library had copies of
 16 your geometry textbook?
 17 A. Yes, I do know, and they did not have them.
 18 Q. Did not. How do you know that the library did
 19 not have copies of your geometry textbook?
 20 A. Because I went to the library every day around
 21 nutrition or lunch. Either way I went.
 22 Q. Did you ask the librarian if copies of your
 23 textbook were in the library?
 24 A. No.
 25 Q. Did you ever attempt to search for a copy of

1 Q. "No" they're not or "no" you don't know?
 2 A. No, they're not.
 3 Q. Have you ever asked?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. How do you know students aren't allowed to
 6 check textbooks out of the textbook room?
 7 A. Because teachers are the only ones that can
 8 check books out for the entire class.
 9 Q. How do you know that?
 10 A. Because I was sent down in my 11th grade year
 11 to get some books for my class and my teacher sent the
 12 note down.
 13 Q. To take books out of the textbook room you were
 14 required to have a teacher's note?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. Did you ever ask your geometry teacher for a
 17 note to check a geometry textbook out of the textbook
 18 room?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Do you feel that your education in geometry was
 21 impaired because students used a class set of textbooks?
 22 A. Can you clarify that?
 23 Q. Do you think that your education in geometry
 24 was impaired in some way because you didn't have a
 25 textbook to take home at night?

1 your geometry textbook in the library?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. How do you know there were no copies of your
 4 geometry textbook in the library?
 5 A. Because when I was in the library I pick up
 6 things and read, and I'm, like, every day all over that
 7 library.
 8 Q. But you never looked for a copy of your
 9 geometry textbook, did you?
 10 A. No. There's no textbooks in there for class --
 11 no, there are no classroom textbooks in there.
 12 Q. How do you know?
 13 A. Because they're not on surface.
 14 Q. I'm sorry, they're not on?
 15 A. They're not on surface.
 16 Q. What does that mean?
 17 A. They're not out where we can check the books
 18 out. There are no textbooks out that -- the ones inside
 19 the classroom.
 20 Q. Does Locke High School have a textbook room?
 21 A. Yes, they do.
 22 Q. Are students, to your knowledge, allowed to
 23 check textbooks out of the textbook room to take home at
 24 night?
 25 A. No.

1 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for expert
 2 testimony, but you can answer.
 3 MR. CHOATE: Actually, I'm just really asking
 4 for what she thinks. I'm not asking for any expert
 5 information.
 6 MS. KOTT: That's fine. The objection still
 7 stands, but you can answer.
 8 THE WITNESS: Would just make me work hard. It
 9 made me work hard. But it was, like, for the ones that
 10 didn't have, missed that day, I know it was hard on them
 11 because they would have to copy that assignment down
 12 along with a new assignment the day they come back the
 13 next day.
 14 BY MR. CHOATE:
 15 Q. For you, however, do you feel that -- do you
 16 feel that you learned geometry in your geometry class?
 17 A. Excuse me?
 18 Q. Do you think you learned geometry in your
 19 class? Did you learn something in that class?
 20 A. Yes. Because I had a good teacher.
 21 Q. And because you worked hard?
 22 A. And because I worked hard.
 23 Q. How much time per night did you spend studying
 24 geometry?
 25 A. Geometry was pretty easy, so it took me about

1 10 minutes just to finish the homework.
 2 Q. Was the homework easy for you?
 3 A. Yes, it was.
 4 Q. And why was it easy for you?
 5 A. Because my teacher explained it in a way that I
 6 know I could do it. He made it very comfortable for me
 7 to do math, made it easy to understand. And it made me
 8 eager to do it, so it was exciting.
 9 Q. Do you have any complaints about the textbook
 10 that you used in your geometry class?
 11 A. No.
 12 Q. I think you also indicated that students used a
 13 class set of textbooks in the Spanish class.
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. Did you have the same Spanish teacher in both
 16 the first semester and the second semester of your 12th
 17 grade year?
 18 A. Yes, I did.
 19 Q. And did students in your Spanish class use
 20 class sets of textbooks during both the first semester
 21 and the second semester?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. What was the name of the textbook that you used
 24 in Spanish class?
 25 A. It was in Spanish and my language is kind of

1 weird in Spanish. I don't speak that well of Spanish
 2 and sometimes I have a hard time pronouncing the way it
 3 is. I honestly can't tell you.
 4 Q. What did the book look like?
 5 A. It was orange. It was Spanish 1.
 6 Q. How many students were in your Spanish class,
 7 approximately, during your first semester?
 8 A. Close to 40. Approximately 40 students.
 9 Q. Approximately how many students were in your
 10 Spanish class in the second semester?
 11 A. 20.
 12 Q. Do you know why there were fewer students in
 13 your Spanish class in the second semester?
 14 A. Yes. Because majority of them failed the first
 15 semester, and they were 9th and 10th graders and they
 16 didn't care.
 17 Q. Was this your first year of Spanish?
 18 A. Yes, it was.
 19 Q. Were there enough copies of the textbook in the
 20 class set for all the students to use in the first
 21 semester?
 22 A. No, there wasn't.
 23 Q. Okay. How many copies of the textbook were
 24 there in the class set?
 25 A. I'm estimating about 25.

1 Q. Did you count the number of textbooks at any
 2 point?
 3 A. No, I didn't.
 4 Q. Is it fair to say, then, during the second
 5 semester of your Spanish class there were enough
 6 textbooks in the class set for each student to have
 7 their own copy to use in class?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. In the first semester there were more students
 10 than there were copies of the Spanish textbook?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Approximately how many more students were there
 13 than available copies of the Spanish textbook in your
 14 first semester?
 15 A. I can't really say because I really don't know,
 16 but there were many people that had to pair up to do the
 17 assignments.
 18 Q. Was the textbook used on a daily basis in your
 19 Spanish class?
 20 A. Yes, they were.
 21 Q. Approximately how many students had to pair up
 22 in the first semester of your Spanish class?
 23 A. About five. Five. Five or six. Sometimes
 24 threes. If anyone decided to come that day, it was a
 25 lot -- some people didn't want to share, so sometimes

1 would pair up in threes or twos.
 2 Q. Sometimes three students would share one book?
 3 A. Because some students wouldn't want to share.
 4 Q. On those days when all of the students showed
 5 up to your Spanish class --
 6 A. That is when we had three people working out of
 7 one book and two people working out of one book.
 8 Q. That was on the days when all the students
 9 showed up?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. So you had one group of three students and one
 12 group of two students?
 13 A. Yes. And then you had some single, like I
 14 said, that didn't want to share their book.
 15 Q. I'm just trying to get a sense of how many
 16 students actually shared the book on those days when
 17 everybody showed up. And tell me if my understanding of
 18 your testimony is correct.
 19 On the days in the first semester of your
 20 Spanish class when everybody showed up, you would have a
 21 group of three students sharing a book and you would
 22 have a group of two students sharing a book?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. Okay. But other than those two groups of
 25 students, there were no other students who had to share

1 books; is that correct?
 2 A. That's correct.
 3 Q. So you had about three students or so that
 4 didn't have their own copy of the book --
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. -- on the days when all of the students in the
 7 Spanish class showed up?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. Did you ever have to share a textbook in your
 10 Spanish class?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Approximately how many occasions in the first
 13 semester did you have to share a textbook?
 14 A. I'm estimating about seven times.
 15 Q. And do you feel that sharing a textbook on
 16 those occasions, did that interfere with your ability to
 17 learn Spanish?
 18 A. Yes, it did.
 19 Q. How did that interfere with your ability to
 20 learn Spanish?
 21 A. Well, I'm a fast writer and sometimes I get
 22 paired up with someone that doesn't write that quickly,
 23 so when I'd be ready to turn a page they would still be
 24 on the page I just came from, and it's, like, kind of
 25 hard because you're trying to do one side of the work

1 and they have to flip back to do their work. It was
 2 very difficult.
 3 Q. Were there any other ways in which it was
 4 difficult for you to, on those occasions, on those seven
 5 occasions on which you had to share a textbook?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. I don't know if I already asked you this. What
 8 was the condition of your Spanish textbook?
 9 A. The condition on the books were C's. All of
 10 them were C's.
 11 Q. Let me make sure I understand your testimony
 12 right. During your first semester of Spanish there were
 13 about three students in the class -- well, let me
 14 withdraw that.
 15 In the first semester of your Spanish class,
 16 there were three students more than available copies of
 17 the Spanish book in class; is that accurate?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Can you describe for me generally the condition
 20 of the textbooks in your Spanish class?
 21 A. Yes. They had writing in them, some students
 22 had taken markers and marked out words so you couldn't
 23 see them, pages were ripped out, books were bent,
 24 graffiti all through the books, page numbers blocked off
 25 by ink pen or marker. That's basically it.

1 Q. Do you know why students in your Spanish class
 2 used a class set of textbooks?
 3 A. Can you --
 4 Q. Do you know why you didn't have a textbook to
 5 take home in your Spanish class?
 6 A. No.
 7 Q. Did you ever ask your teacher?
 8 A. No.
 9 Q. Did you ever ask anyone in the administration?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Did anyone in the administration or your
 12 teacher ever tell you?
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. Did you ever complain about your Spanish
 15 textbook to anybody?
 16 A. Only to my parents.
 17 Q. About how many times did you complain to your
 18 parents about your Spanish textbook?
 19 A. I think I told them once.
 20 Q. Do you know whether your parents, after you
 21 told them, did they contact anybody at the school?
 22 A. I think they did, yes.
 23 Q. Do you know, was it your father or your mother?
 24 If you know.
 25 A. No, I don't know. I don't know.

1 Q. How do you know that one of your parents
 2 contacted somebody at Locke High School after you
 3 complained to your parents about the Spanish textbook?
 4 A. I don't know. I just told my parents and my
 5 parents assured me they would take care of it.
 6 Q. Did the Spanish textbooks in the second
 7 semester, did they also have some of these same
 8 conditions, such as writing in the textbooks and pages
 9 being ripped?
 10 A. They were the same books.
 11 Q. Do you recall any occasions on which you were
 12 using a Spanish textbook and you found that one of the
 13 pages was missing?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. About how many times did you encounter that?
 16 A. About three times. Different books.
 17 Q. You noticed the pages were missing on three
 18 occasions and on each occasion it was a different book?
 19 A. Yes.
 20 Q. How do you know it was a different book?
 21 A. Because when I went to get one and she said
 22 turn to page 50, page 50 wasn't there. I got a
 23 different book, page 50 wasn't there. And I got another
 24 book, page 50 wasn't there. So when I got to my fourth
 25 book, I got to a book that had page 50.

- 1 Q. On these three occasions you found a page
2 missing, it was on the same day?
3 A. It was the same day.
4 Q. Other than that, that one day, were there any
5 other days in your Spanish class in your 12th grade year
6 that you discovered a page was missing in your textbook?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. About how many other occasions?
9 A. About one more. Because I looked at the back
10 of the book for a translation and it wasn't there, and I
11 found another book that had it.
12 Q. Other than those two occasions, were there any
13 other occasions on which you noticed there was a page
14 missing from your Spanish textbook in your 12th grade
15 year?
16 A. No.
17 Q. What about other students? Did other students
18 discover that pages were missing from their textbooks,
19 to your knowledge?
20 A. Not to my knowledge.
21 Q. Other than having a page -- finding a page was
22 missing on these two different occasions that you told
23 me about, did you ever discover that pages in your
24 Spanish textbook were ripped?
25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. About how many different occasions did you
2 discover that?
3 A. Once. Half the page was ripped.
4 Q. And did you find a new book with the complete
5 page?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. That same day?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. How often, approximately, would you notice that
10 your Spanish textbook had writing in the text or on the
11 pages of the textbook?
12 A. Every book I received or every book I got.
13 Q. Does that mean that every day in your Spanish
14 class you saw that there was writing in your textbook?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. And where was the writing, generally?
17 A. In the back of the book, in the front of the
18 book, on the book.
19 Q. Was it on the actual pages of the book?
20 A. On the pages, on the hardback of the book.
21 Q. Were you still able to read the text of the
22 book?
23 A. Some. Some I was able to read, other ones I
24 couldn't. I would get another book that didn't have it.
25 Q. Do you ever recall an occasion on which you

- 1 discovered that some of the text in your Spanish
2 textbook had writing on it and you were unable to find
3 another book that didn't have writing on that portion of
4 the text?
5 A. No.
6 Q. That never happened?
7 A. No.
8 Q. What about other students, do you know if that
9 happened to other students?
10 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
11 THE WITNESS: I don't know.
12 BY MR. CHOATE:
13 Q. You indicated that some of the books were bent.
14 How do you mean that they were bent?
15 A. They were actually bent. The hardbacks were
16 bent. I mean, actually bent.
17 Q. The actual --
18 A. It was like someone took the book, put it on a
19 curb and just smashed the book into half like this but
20 it didn't rip.
21 Q. The actual cover of the book?
22 A. The actual hardback.
23 Q. How many occasions did you notice that
24 condition?
25 A. I only noticed one.

- 1 Q. On one of the books --
2 A. On one of the books.
3 Q. -- the cover was bent?
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. But not on the other books?
6 A. No.
7 Q. Did your teacher in your Spanish class, did --
8 was it a she?
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. Did she provide students with worksheets and
11 hand-outs in the class in addition to the textbook?
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. Did she provide hand-outs and worksheets to all
14 the students in the class?
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. Did she do that on a regular basis?
17 A. Yes, once a week.
18 Q. Once a week. Approximately how many hand-outs
19 and worksheets would she provide to all the students
20 each week?
21 A. Two or three a week.
22 Q. And were those hand-outs intended to help you
23 do your homework at night during that week?
24 A. Yes.
25 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.

1 BY MR. CHOATE:

2 Q. Do you have an idea as to what those hand-outs
3 were for and worksheets were for?

4 A. Yes. When she handed out the hand-outs, it was
5 what we were covering that day or week; like we were
6 covering our vowels, she would do a hand-out dealing
7 with the vowels.

8 Q. Is it your understanding that those worksheets
9 and hand-outs were to be used by you for the purposes of
10 doing homework at night?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. How often per night did you do homework in your
13 Spanish class?

14 A. Every other night.

15 Q. Approximately how much time did you spend every
16 other night doing homework on Spanish?

17 A. Considering my sister had the same class that I
18 had, we would do it together, or sometimes we would do
19 it at school, so we would spend, like, 20 minutes on it.

20 Q. 20 minutes every other night?

21 A. Every other night.

22 Q. Other than the hand-outs, the worksheets and
23 the textbooks that you used in Spanish, did your teacher
24 use any other types of instruction materials?

25 A. Not that I can recall.

1 Spanish?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Let's talk about the classes you took during
4 your junior year, your 11th grade year.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Did you have any classes in your 11th grade
7 year -- let me withdraw that.

8 Did you have any classes during your 11th grade
9 year in which students didn't have textbooks to use in
10 class?

11 A. Let's see. Yes. AP art history and algebra.

12 Q. Other than in your AP art history and algebra
13 class, do you recall any other classes during your 12th
14 grade year in which students didn't have --

15 A. My 11th grade year?

16 Q. Yes, I'm only talking about your 11th grade
17 year.

18 A. Can you repeat that?

19 Q. Sure. I think you indicated that in your AP
20 art history class and algebra class students didn't have
21 textbooks to use in class; is that accurate?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. Were there any other classes during your 11th
24 grade year in which students didn't have textbooks to
25 use in class?

1 Q. Do you recall ever watching any videos relating
2 to Spanish?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Did you like Spanish?

5 A. Yes. My teacher was very cool. She was very
6 helpful.

7 Q. Do you feel that you got a good education in
8 Spanish during your 12th grade year?

9 A. Yes, I really do. I mean, I learned words
10 that -- I didn't know any Spanish at all but hola and
11 buenos dias, and that's all I know. Now I know my
12 vowels. Now I know how to say certain words that I
13 didn't know how.

14 Q. Are you going to take Spanish in college?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Are you taking it right now?

17 A. I'm taking it next semester.

18 Q. Do you have any complaints about the Spanish
19 textbook that you used during the 12th grade year?

20 A. Only that they were in bad condition.

21 Q. You mean in terms of what you've already told
22 me?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Other than what we've already discussed today,
25 do you have any complaints about your textbook in

1 A. No.

2 Q. In all of your other classes, students had
3 textbooks to use in class, in your 11th grade year?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Let's talk about your algebra class. You took
6 algebra during the first semester of your 11th grade
7 year?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Was there any point in time in your algebra
10 class in which students didn't have textbooks to use in
11 class?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Students never had textbooks during the entire
14 first semester?

15 A. Not the entire school year.

16 Q. Did you take algebra for an entire year?

17 A. No. First semester. After the second semester
18 I went to go -- I went to that classroom to see if I
19 could get in for the second half semester and the
20 students -- one of my friends was in that class, and
21 they still didn't have a book, and it was too crowded
22 for me to get in.

23 Q. Let's talk about your first semester. Did your
24 algebra teacher use any instruction materials to teach
25 algebra in your first semester class?

1 A. My algebra teacher was my chemistry teacher in
2 my 12th grade year, but in my algebra class he came for
3 the first two weeks, and I didn't see him again until
4 two weeks ending of the first semester.

5 Q. Is this [REDACTED]

6 A. [REDACTED] yes.

7 Q. Are you saying that [REDACTED] taught your
8 algebra class for only the first two weeks and the last
9 two weeks of that first semester?

10 A. Yes, he did.

11 Q. And he never showed up in between those two
12 blocks of time?

13 A. No, he did not.

14 Q. Do you know why not?
15 [REDACTED]
16 [REDACTED]
17 [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED]
20 [REDACTED]
21 [REDACTED]
22 [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED]
25 [REDACTED]

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Did these substitutes use any instructional
3 materials in your algebra class?

4 A. They gave hand-outs with no instructions on how
5 to do -- if it wasn't for my brother and my dad helping
6 me, I wouldn't have learned anything in that class.

7 Q. My question was just whether they used
8 instructional materials.

9 A. Oh, yes, they used it, but they didn't teach
10 it.

11 Q. How often were hand-outs provided to students
12 in your algebra class by the substitute teachers?

13 A. Every other day.

14 Q. Approximately how many hand-outs would students
15 receive every other day?

16 A. One.

17 Q. One page?

18 A. One page.

19 Q. And were all students in the class provided
20 with that page of hand-outs every other day?

21 A. All that came.

22 Q. Were there any occasions on which students were
23 provided with more than one page of hand-outs?

24 A. No.

25 Q. What were the hand-outs intended for, to your

1 [REDACTED]
2 [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED]

4 Q. Was your algebra class taught by substitute
5 teachers during the period of time that [REDACTED]
6 wasn't there?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Approximately how many substitute teachers
9 taught the class?

10 A. About three different substitutes.

11 Q. How many months, approximately, in a semester?

12 A. In a semester there's about five months.

13 Q. So during approximately four of those months in
14 the first semester your class received instruction from
15 three different substitutes?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Did each of the substitutes stay for a roughly
18 equal amount of time?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. So each substitute taught your class for
21 approximately five, five and a half weeks?

22 A. They didn't teach, but they were there.

23 Q. Each of the three substitutes was assigned to
24 your algebra class for approximately five, five and a
25 half weeks?

1 knowledge?

2 A. Can you clarify that?

3 Q. Were the hand-outs used for the purpose of
4 doing homework at night?

5 A. To do work in class, not homework.

6 Q. Students used the hand-outs to do work in
7 class?

8 A. Not all.

9 Q. Did you?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. How were you assigned homework in your algebra
12 class?

13 A. We didn't have any homework.

14 Q. You never had homework in your algebra class?

15 A. No. The parts I didn't get on my worksheet, I
16 would take it home, and my brothers -- my brother and my
17 dad would help.

18 Q. I'm sorry. I didn't understand your answer.
19 The parts on your worksheet?

20 A. A question I didn't get on the worksheet, I
21 would have -- I would ask my brother or my dad how to do
22 it.

23 Q. And they would help you?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Approximately how much time per night did you

- 1 spend studying in algebra for your algebra class?
 2 A. Approximately 20 minutes.
 3 Q. Did you receive or did students in your class
 4 receive homework on any occasions?
 5 A. No.
 6 Q. Not one occasion in the entire semester?
 7 A. No.
 8 Q. Did you complain to your substitute teachers
 9 about this?
 10 A. No. I told my parents because the substitute
 11 teachers that we had for the -- the substitute teacher
 12 that we have for the longest would sleep inside the
 13 classroom, and I got tired of it, so I told my parents
 14 within that first week. And that's, like -- my parents
 15 bring it to [REDACTED] -- that's the principal at the
 16 time -- attention that you have a teacher sleeping
 17 inside the classroom. And a friend, a classmate of
 18 mine, had the same teacher for a different subject, and
 19 she went and told my mom about it, so my mom brought it
 20 to [REDACTED] attention. And [REDACTED] was saying,
 21 telling my parents, oh, we're going to get someone else
 22 in there. We're going to get somebody there. And they
 23 never did. I think, actually, that was the last sub we
 24 had.
 25 Q. And that was one of the substitutes that taught

- 1 to the point I would have my parents -- ask my parents
 2 to pick me up right after lunch because I did not want
 3 to go to that class.
 4 Q. Did you complain to anybody in the
 5 administration?
 6 A. Yes, I went to [REDACTED] with it.
 7 Q. On how many occasions did you speak with
 8 [REDACTED]?
 9 A. I spoke with [REDACTED] three different times.
 10 Q. You spoke to Principal [REDACTED] on three different
 11 occasions about [REDACTED] sleeping in class?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. What did [REDACTED] tell you on these three
 14 different occasions?
 15 A. She was like, okay, we're going to fix it. Go
 16 to class.
 17 Q. And how many times did you complain to your
 18 parents about [REDACTED]?
 19 A. I told them, I think, approximately, about -- I
 20 talked to them twice about it.
 21 Q. Were there any other problems with the other
 22 substitutes that taught your class?
 23 A. No.
 24 Q. Were the other substitutes good teachers?
 25 A. They were good teachers. They basically kept

- 1 your class for about five and a half weeks?
 2 A. Yes.
 3 Q. Do you know what that substitute's name was?
 4 A. Yes. Mr. Kwami.
 5 Q. How do you spell that?
 6 A. K W A M I.
 7 Q. On how many occasions did you notice that
 8 Mr. Kwami was asleep during class?
 9 A. Being that there was -- after lunch, I would
 10 say about 10 times he slept inside the class right after
 11 lunch.
 12 Q. On 10 different occasions --
 13 A. 10 different occasions.
 14 Q. -- you saw Mr. Kwami asleep in the class?
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. How long was he asleep for on those occasions?
 17 A. Like half the period, would be, like, 30
 18 minutes or so.
 19 Q. He was asleep for 30 minutes on each of those
 20 10 occasions?
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. What did the students do while he was asleep?
 23 A. Hang out the windows, throw papers out.
 24 Actually threw a pencil sharpener out the window one
 25 time. Invite other people into the classroom. It was

- 1 the class calm, and they were like -- they were there
 2 for like -- they were there each for like four or five
 3 weeks. That was, like, the shortest time they'd been
 4 there. And [REDACTED] was the last substitute we got, we
 5 received. When he got the class, it was just, like,
 6 everybody started coming in. Although there were people
 7 coming in on the other substitutes, but when it started
 8 getting loud and outrageous, they would have them leave
 9 or call campus security.
 10 Q. The first two substitutes you had, were they
 11 good teachers, in your opinion?
 12 A. Yes. In the sense of they kept the class calm.
 13 Q. Did they teach algebra to the class?
 14 A. No.
 15 Q. They never went over any algebra material in
 16 the class?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. And each of those substitutes was assigned to
 19 your class for about five weeks; is that right?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. And during each substitute's five-week rotation
 22 they never taught algebra in your class?
 23 A. No.
 24 Q. You never once had a lesson in class?
 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. Did your class cover any algebra material?
 2 A. No. They just gave us hand-outs.
 3 Q. And what did the class do with the hand-outs?
 4 A. Some did them, including myself, and some just
 5 threw it out the window.
 6 Q. Did the substitute correct your hand-outs?
 7 A. No. He told us to keep them till our teacher
 8 came back.
 9 MS. KOTT: Do you want to take a break?
 10 BY MR. CHOATE:
 11 Q. Do you want to take a quick break?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 MR. CHOATE: Off the record.
 14 (Brief recess.)
 15 MR. CHOATE: Let's go back on the record.
 16 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, you indicated that in algebra
 17 you had three substitutes.
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Did you have any other substitutes or just
 20 those three?
 21 A. Just those three.
 22 Q. Other than [REDACTED] did the other two
 23 substitutes fall asleep on any occasions, to your
 24 knowledge?
 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. Was there ever occasion in your algebra class
 2 in which you didn't have any substitute, that you can
 3 recall?
 4 A. I don't recall. No.
 5 Q. There was always a teacher at the helm of your
 6 algebra class?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. And you just took algebra during your first
 9 semester of your junior year and not your second
 10 semester; is that correct?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. I think you indicated that sometimes you would
 13 call your father and ask him to come pick you up after
 14 lunch.
 15 A. Yes.
 16 Q. How often did you call your father and ask him
 17 to pick you up after lunch and before your algebra
 18 class?
 19 A. Three times every week.
 20 Q. Each week during the semester you called your
 21 father three times and asked him to pick you up?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. And was that always because you didn't want to
 24 go to your algebra class?
 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Were there any other reasons?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. So you missed your algebra class three full
 4 days each week during the first semester?
 5 A. No. Sometimes he was able to pick us up and
 6 sometimes he wasn't.
 7 Q. How often did your father pick you up after
 8 lunch during your first semester of your 11th grade
 9 year? On how many different occasions would you
 10 estimate?
 11 A. I don't know.
 12 Q. Try to give me your best estimate as to on how
 13 many occasions during your first semester of your 11th
 14 grade year your father picked you up after lunch.
 15 A. About, I'm estimating, about -- I really can't
 16 say. I don't know.
 17 Q. Was it less than 10 times?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. Was it less than five times?
 20 A. No.
 21 Q. So your father picked you up somewhere between
 22 five and 10 times after lunch during the first semester
 23 of your 11th grade year?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. Was it around seven times?

- 1 A. Possibly. I'm not sure.
 2 Q. You missed the entire day on those five to 10
 3 occasions when your father picked you up after lunch?
 4 A. It wasn't the entire day, it was after lunch.
 5 Q. You missed the entire algebra period on those
 6 five to 10 occasions when your father picked you up; is
 7 that accurate?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. Did you miss your algebra class on any other
 10 occasions, that you recall, during that semester?
 11 A. No.
 12 Q. You attended the class on every other occasion?
 13 A. Yes, I did.
 14 Q. I think you testified that you complained to
 15 your parents on one occasion about the teaching
 16 situation in your algebra class; is that right?
 17 A. Yes.
 18 Q. Did you complain to your mom or your father?
 19 Do you recall?
 20 A. I complained to both. I told them at one time.
 21 Q. Is it your understanding that your parents or
 22 one of your parents called the principal after you told
 23 them?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. Do you know on how many occasions one of your

1 parents called?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. How do you know that one of your parents called
 4 the principal?
 5 A. Because my parents are very active in our
 6 school lives. In our life, period.
 7 Q. Did your mother ever tell you that she called
 8 [REDACTED] about your concerns with the algebra class?
 9 A. No.
 10 Q. Did your father --
 11 A. I didn't ask them.
 12 Q. Did your father ever tell you that he called
 13 [REDACTED] or anybody else in administration about your
 14 concerns with the algebra class?
 15 A. Not that I can remember.
 16 Q. Other than your understanding of your parents
 17 and their being active in your education, are you
 18 aware -- you don't have any knowledge as to whether they
 19 actually called [REDACTED] or anybody else in
 20 administration; is that correct?
 21 A. Can you repeat that?
 22 Q. Other than your knowledge of your parents and
 23 their participation in your education, is it accurate to
 24 say that you don't know whether one of your parents
 25 actually called [REDACTED] or anybody else in

1 Q. I'm going to ask the question again because I
 2 think that I'm maybe not asking it clearly enough.
 3 Is it true that you don't know on how many
 4 occasions, if any, your parents called the
 5 administration at Locke High School regarding your
 6 concerns with the algebra class?
 7 A. Oh, yes, it's true I don't know.
 8 Q. Let's talk about your AP art history class.
 9 Did you have the same teacher for AP art history in the
 10 first semester and in the second semester of your 11th
 11 grade year?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. Was there any point in time in which students
 14 in your art history class were provided with textbooks?
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. You never had textbooks at any point in time in
 17 either the first or second semester?
 18 A. The second semester -- was approximately around
 19 the middle of the second semester when we received our
 20 art history books.
 21 Q. Would that be sometime in April 2001? No, I'm
 22 sorry.
 23 A. April 2000.
 24 Q. April 2000?
 25 A. Yes.

1 administration concerning your algebra class?
 2 A. No.
 3 Q. Okay. How do you know that one of your parents
 4 called Ms. Webb?
 5 A. Because I know my parents. Whenever there's a
 6 problem in our school, they're definitely going to call.
 7 Either call or write it up.
 8 Q. Did you see one of your parents call [REDACTED]
 9 or somebody else in administration about your concerns
 10 with the algebra class?
 11 A. No.
 12 Q. Did you hear one of your parents speaking with
 13 anybody in administration about your concerns regarding
 14 the algebra class?
 15 A. No.
 16 Q. And you don't know on how many occasions, if
 17 any, your parents actually called [REDACTED] or anybody
 18 else in administration?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. I mean, is that correct? Is it correct that
 21 you do not know on how many occasions, if any, one of
 22 your parents called Ms. Webb or anybody else in
 23 administration about your concerns with the algebra
 24 class?
 25 A. No, I don't know.

1 Q. At some point in April 2000, all of the
 2 students in your AP art history class received books?
 3 A. I would say as far as March we received our
 4 books.
 5 Q. Students in your AP art history class --
 6 A. Art history class.
 7 Q. Students in your art history class received
 8 textbooks sometime in March of 2000?
 9 A. Yes.
 10 Q. Was each student, to your knowledge, issued a
 11 textbook?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. Was each student allowed to take that textbook
 14 home at night?
 15 A. Yes. We were issued a book for class and we
 16 were issued a book for home.
 17 Q. Different books?
 18 A. Two different books.
 19 Q. What was the name of the in-class book? If you
 20 remember.
 21 A. Art History Past and Present. Art History Past
 22 and Present.
 23 Q. Were students expected to bring that book to
 24 class every day?
 25 A. No.

1 Q. There was a class set of textbooks?
 2 A. There were, actually, two different sets of two
 3 different types of books, but they pretty much had the
 4 same information. The books that we took home were,
 5 like, a brief description of what was in the books at
 6 school. The book we had at home was, like, the one we
 7 did our homework on. The brief information from that
 8 book was inside the class set of books at school. Had,
 9 like, brief information. The book at school had the
 10 full information of the art.
 11 Q. So is it correct that there was a class set of
 12 art history textbooks that all of the students used in
 13 class?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. How many students were there in your art
 16 history class in the second semester?
 17 A. In my second semester, we had 10 students.
 18 Q. I'm sorry, how many?
 19 A. In my second semester we had 10 students.
 20 Q. And how many textbooks were there in the class
 21 set of textbooks?
 22 A. 25 to 30.
 23 Q. So each student in your art history class in
 24 the second semester had a textbook to use in class from
 25 sometime in March 2000 to the end of the semester?

1 A. Yes.
 2 Q. What was the condition of those textbooks?
 3 A. A.
 4 Q. And each student in art history was issued a
 5 textbook to use at home?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. And what was the condition of those textbooks?
 8 A. A.
 9 Q. Let's go back to the beginning of your art
 10 history class in the first semester of your 11th grade
 11 year. Did your teacher use any instruction materials to
 12 teach the class?
 13 A. Only our notes.
 14 Q. Did your teacher ever provide hand-outs in
 15 class, or worksheets?
 16 A. On three occasions.
 17 Q. On how many occasions?
 18 A. Three.
 19 Q. When were those occasions?
 20 A. During the first semester.
 21 Q. All three occasions were during the first
 22 semester?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. What did your teacher provide you on the first
 25 occasion?

1 A. Samples of different structures of buildings.
 2 Q. Were those samples contained in a packet of
 3 material?
 4 A. Yes. Of different types of -- yes, they were.
 5 Different structures of buildings and art, different
 6 structures of architect. That was one packet.
 7 Q. How thick was that packet, approximately?
 8 A. About six pages.
 9 Q. Six pages?
 10 A. (Witness nods head.)
 11 Q. And did each student receive a copy of that?
 12 A. Yes.
 13 Q. How many students were there in the first
 14 semester of your art history class?
 15 A. About 25. That was the most. And then some
 16 dropped out because they couldn't handle it.
 17 Q. And your art history teacher provided students
 18 with a second packet of information on a different
 19 occasion?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. What was the nature of that second packet of
 22 information?
 23 A. That was artifacts, different artifacts. That
 24 was about four pages.
 25 Q. And what about the third occasion?

1 A. That was one single sheet. It was how to
 2 build -- how to -- it was how to make something. I
 3 don't quite remember. I know it was only a single page.
 4 Q. Do you know what the purpose of those three
 5 different packets of information was?
 6 A. At that time it was during -- it was during --
 7 some information she had given us with the notes she had
 8 wrote on the board, showing examples of what she -- what
 9 she had give us, the information she had gave us from
 10 the board, the notes that she wrote for us out of her
 11 book.
 12 Q. Did the class refer back to information in
 13 these packets of material throughout the first semester?
 14 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 15 THE WITNESS: Can you clarify that?
 16 BY MR. CHOATE:
 17 Q. During class time in the first semester, did
 18 the teacher refer to information in these three
 19 different packets of material throughout the semester?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. Were you provided with these packets of
 22 information in the beginning of the semester?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. You were provided with each of the three
 25 packets in the beginning of the semester?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And the teacher referred to information in the
3 packets throughout the rest of the semester?

4 A. No. Throughout the time we were studying those
5 different -- different types of art.

6 Q. Did you study information in the first packet
7 during one portion of the semester and information in
8 the second packet during another portion?

9 A. Yes. Each package, except the last one, were
10 about two weeks where we studied --

11 Q. I'm sorry?

12 A. Each package, like the architect packages, the
13 six pages, we studied that about two weeks.

14 Q. What about the package dealing with artifacts?

15 A. Artifacts? That was also two weeks.

16 Q. And what about the third package?

17 A. That was one week.

18 Q. Other than these packets of information, did
19 your art history teacher use any other types of
20 instruction materials to teach art history in the first
21 semester?

22 A. Yes, videotapes.

23 Q. Did you watch these videotapes in class?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. How often did your class watch videotapes?

1 A. Yes. And we copied them. I'm sorry I didn't
2 clarify that, but, yes, she wrote the notes on the board
3 and we copied them.

4 Q. And did the class go through that exercise on a
5 daily basis?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. So each day students copied notes off the
8 board, and then what did you do with those notes at
9 home?

10 A. Like we received tests, like, every three
11 weeks, so we would go back and read the notes over, and
12 that's how she would base our test, on the notes she had
13 given us.

14 Q. Did your art history teacher ever have the
15 class write essays or any types of reports?

16 A. Yes. Every Monday -- every Friday she gave us
17 a topic to research, and every Monday we turned in a
18 one-page essay summary about that topic.

19 Q. You turned in a one-page essay every Monday of
20 the class?

21 A. Yes. And along with art review, with 10
22 definitions out of the art review.

23 Q. And what was this art review? Was this
24 something that was given to you, given to students?

25 A. It was -- actually came out of a newspaper, the

1 A. Twice a semester.

2 Q. On just two different occasions?

3 A. Two different occasions.

4 Q. Do you recall what the substance of the
5 videotapes was, what you learned in them?

6 A. One period where we were studying ancient
7 civilization art, and that was one video I know we seen.
8 I can't recall the second one we seen.

9 Q. Other than the videotapes and the packets of
10 information that you received, did your teacher use any
11 other instruction materials to teach the class?

12 A. Notes from her book.

13 Q. How did she use notes from her book to teach
14 the class?

15 A. She told us that when she go home at night that
16 she would look over what she wanted us to learn for that
17 day, read it, summarize it into notes for us to use for
18 our test when we got them.

19 MR. CHOATE: Could you read that back?

20 (Record read.)

21 BY MR. CHOATE:

22 Q. I'm not sure I understand. Did your teacher
23 provide you with photocopies of her notes?

24 A. No. She wrote it on the board.

25 Q. She wrote notes on the board?

1 Sunday or Friday or Saturday newspaper, inside the
2 newspaper under -- I think it was -- it was inside the
3 Calendar, and our review would be in back of Calendar.
4 We would clip it out, we would read it, take 10 words
5 from it, write the definitions of it, and turn it in
6 along with the essay.

7 Q. You're referring to the Los Angeles Times?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So you turned in your sheet of definitions and
10 your one-page report each Monday?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What resources did you use to prepare your
13 reports each week?

14 A. I used the Internet.

15 Q. Was that helpful for you?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. How was it helpful?

18 A. It took me to web sites based upon the
19 questions that she had given, and it would give you
20 information that you needed. We had to read and
21 summarize it in our own words, put it into our own
22 words. And it was much quicker.

23 Q. It was quicker to use the web site?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Than what?

- 1 A. Going to the library and researching.
 2 Q. Did your teacher also tell you that you could
 3 go to the library and research the subject there in
 4 addition to using the Internet?
 5 A. Yes.
 6 Q. Did you ever go to the library and research the
 7 subject?
 8 A. I went once.
 9 Q. To the library at Locke High School?
 10 A. No. Downtown library.
 11 Q. Why did you only go to the downtown library
 12 once?
 13 A. Well, the questions that she had asked came
 14 from an artist she wanted us to find out, and I had a
 15 little trouble on the Internet trying to retrieve that
 16 information, so I came down to the downtown library,
 17 which they had the book. I reviewed it -- I read, I
 18 think it was, the autobiography of that person, and I
 19 summarized it in my own words about what I read.
 20 Q. Do you remember what the artist's name was, by
 21 any chance?
 22 A. No, I do not.
 23 Q. Did you find the information you were looking
 24 for at the library?
 25 A. Yes, I did.

- 1 Q. Did you ever have a difficult time finding
 2 either information on the Internet, you know, on the web
 3 site other than this one occasion?
 4 A. No.
 5 Q. Other than this one occasion you told me about
 6 when you went to the library?
 7 A. Yes.
 8 Q. Were you able to find the information needed by
 9 using the Internet on every other occasion?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. Do you like using the Internet?
 12 A. I love it.
 13 Q. Do you find it is helpful for your education?
 14 A. Yes.
 15 Q. Are there any things that you don't like about
 16 using the Internet?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. Do you feel that the information that you
 19 receive over the Internet is reliable?
 20 A. Yes.
 21 Q. What did other students in your class do in
 22 terms of preparing these research reports? Did they
 23 also use the Internet and go to the library?
 24 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 25 ///

- 1 BY MR. CHOATE:
 2 Q. If you know.
 3 A. No, I do not know. One person, an associate in
 4 the class, she used the Internet because she has one --
 5 she has Internet at home, and she told me she used it
 6 but she didn't know how to use it. So I taught her a
 7 couple of web sites that she can go on for, like, the
 8 work. Every time we receive it on Friday, I will call
 9 her, let her know that you can go this such web site,
 10 they should have it. And she learned from me, really.
 11 Q. Do you recall what her name was?
 12 A. No, I do not. I think it was [REDACTED]
 13 Q. [REDACTED]
 14 A. Yes. But I don't know her last name. As a
 15 matter of fact, her first name was [REDACTED] but I do not
 16 know her last name.
 17 Q. Did you speak to any other students in your art
 18 history class who had difficulties using the Internet?
 19 A. Majority of them -- well, I can't speak on
 20 behalf of everyone, but the few people that I did know
 21 in there didn't have it, and they would have to go to
 22 the library that was nearest to them or downtown library
 23 to find the information they needed.
 24 Q. Does Locke High School have computers for
 25 students to use?

- 1 A. Yes, but you need permission from your teacher
 2 to go there.
 3 Q. Do you know how many computers Locke High
 4 School has?
 5 A. Inside the computer lab, no, I do not.
 6 Q. Is there just one computer lab or are there
 7 many?
 8 A. One computer lab.
 9 Q. Have you ever been inside of it?
 10 A. Yes.
 11 Q. Can you give me an estimate as to about how
 12 many computers are in that lab?
 13 A. I would say about, estimating, about 15 to 20
 14 computers.
 15 Q. Do you know whether those computers have access
 16 to the Internet?
 17 A. Those computers, all of those computers, does
 18 have access to Internet.
 19 Q. What does a student have to do in order to get
 20 permission to use the computers in the computer lab at
 21 Locke High School?
 22 A. Ask their teacher can they have a written pass
 23 to go to the computer lab with a reasonable -- with a
 24 good reason to go there, and some teachers give it and
 25 some teachers don't.

- 1 Q. Did your art history teacher provide permission
2 to students to use the computer lab at Locke High
3 School?
4 A. I don't know.
5 Q. Did you ever ask permission to use the computer
6 lab at Locke High School for the purposes of doing your
7 art history assignments?
8 A. No. Because I have Internet and a computer at
9 home.
10 Q. Do you know whether other students ever asked
11 your art history teacher permission to use the computer
12 lab to do their art history assignments?
13 A. No.
14 Q. Do you have any reason to believe that your art
15 history teacher would not have granted permission to use
16 the computer lab at Locke High School?
17 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
18 BY MR. CHOATE:
19 Q. Do you have any reason to know?
20 A. No. You know, I know she would have because
21 she knows it's very difficult for people to get access
22 to Internet, so she would have granted them the
23 permission.
24 Q. Did you have friends in your AP history class
25 that would go to the downtown library or some other

- 1 all went down to the library to see if we can find -- we
2 had to choose an artist that we could write a 10-page
3 report about. And the book -- the artist I had chose,
4 they had a book on it, but along with other artists.
5 And his part was about a page and a half. That's all
6 they had on him.
7 Q. So what did you do?
8 A. I went down to the downtown library and checked
9 out a book, read about it and summarized it in a long
10 10-page report.
11 Q. Do you know how many students in your AP art
12 history class didn't have access to the Internet at
13 home?
14 A. No, I don't know.
15 Q. Do you know of any students who didn't have
16 access to the Internet at home?
17 A. No.
18 Q. Have you ever had any difficulties using the
19 Internet?
20 A. No. Only the one time I was looking for an
21 assignment that I had to go to the library and get.
22 Q. Did you go to the library downtown for any of
23 your other classes?
24 A. On two occasions. I think once in my 10th
25 grade year. I was at a different school, though. And

- 1 library to, you know, to get the information to do their
2 AP history reports?
3 A. Yes, I had associates done it.
4 Q. What does the term "associate" mean?
5 A. Someone that you know, you associate with, but
6 you don't consider them as your friend because you don't
7 know them that well.
8 Q. Do you know of any students in your AP history
9 class who were unable to either use the Internet or go
10 to a library to get the information to complete their
11 assignments in your AP history class?
12 A. No, I don't know.
13 Q. Does the library at Locke High School contain
14 any books or materials that students could use to
15 complete their art history assignments, to your
16 knowledge?
17 A. The library at Locke is -- they could have, but
18 it wouldn't have been as much good a resource it should
19 have been for them, but it's there. It's not as good.
20 Q. Did you ever go to the library at Locke High
21 School to, you know, look for information for, you know,
22 for the purpose of completing assignments in your AP
23 history class?
24 A. Yes. Was a report that was due within -- it
25 was due two months before the semester had ended, and we

- 1 the one for -- make that three. Twice for my AP art
2 history class and once in my 10th grade year. Other
3 than that, me and my dad or my little sister just go to
4 the library.
5 Q. Did you like your AP art history teacher?
6 A. Very much so.
7 Q. Was it a he or a she?
8 A. It was a she.
9 Q. Do you think she did a good job teaching your
10 class, art history?
11 A. I think she did a wonderful job.
12 Q. Do you think you learned a lot in that class?
13 A. Yes. Yes. I do have a difficult time of
14 remembering artifacts. If she found that out, she'd be
15 very angry. I think I learned a lot in that class.
16 Q. Do you think one of the reasons why you learnt
17 so much is because you spent some of your time searching
18 on the Internet for different issues?
19 A. Oh, yes, I think so. Had to do with a lot of
20 those essays that were due that Monday. That 10-page
21 report would never go away. That and another 10-page
22 report was on one word, what does the word means. It
23 was very -- I learned a lot.
24 Q. When your teacher would write notes on the
25 board for the class to copy down, how did that work?

1 Did your teacher kind of write the notes in the
 2 beginning of class and the students would write them
 3 down at the beginning of class?
 4 A. Well, when we got into the classroom, she would
 5 immediately start writing on the board. And sometimes
 6 it would be difficult to read, but we had to get those
 7 notes down and as quickly as possible. Because she
 8 would write so much on one side of the board, she would
 9 have to go to the next one, and as soon as she finishes
 10 that one she has to write the next set of notes. So
 11 some of the times we couldn't read the words and we
 12 didn't have enough time to stop and, like, what does
 13 that word say because we were so busy trying to copy it
 14 down.
 15 Q. Did you ever, you know, when you saw a word on
 16 the board you couldn't read, did you ask the teacher, I
 17 can't read that word, what is it?
 18 A. I would ask someone else who did understand it
 19 and they would tell me. Because I knew if I would have
 20 stopped her, it would have cut a lot of time out.
 21 Q. For other students?
 22 A. For other students. And we have to have that
 23 done before the period ended.
 24 Q. Were there any occasions that you can recall on
 25 which, you know, you couldn't understand what a word was

1 A. No.
 2 Q. How long did it take you, generally, to write
 3 down what the teacher had written on the board?
 4 A. She had written so much, so it would take
 5 practically, like, the whole class period, because she
 6 writes a lot. She wrote a lot. And we had to copy it.
 7 So she wouldn't have enough time to explain it to us.
 8 But when she did have enough time, she would explain it
 9 to us.
 10 Q. Did your teacher spend any of her class time
 11 lecturing the class on the issues that you were
 12 studying?
 13 A. Yes.
 14 Q. Did she do that every day?
 15 A. I would say every other day. Actually, she
 16 would really do it, like, when it was time for finals,
 17 around finals. That's when she would do a lot of
 18 lecturing, review and lecturing to us.
 19 Q. Aside from getting prepared for finals when
 20 there was more intense activity, did your teacher spend
 21 more time lecturing to the class every day?
 22 A. Yes.
 23 Q. How much time did she spend doing that? Do you
 24 recall?
 25 A. It would take her about 10 minutes because she

1 that your teacher had written down and you couldn't get
 2 the information from one of your associates?
 3 A. Was, like, once, one occasion I can remember.
 4 I think it was, yeah, about once that I couldn't -- I
 5 didn't understand, and I left it at that because I had
 6 to go to my next class, which was on the other side of
 7 the school, and I couldn't come after class because my
 8 parents picked me up.
 9 Q. What was it that you missed on that one
 10 occasion?
 11 A. It was beginning of a paragraph. I didn't
 12 understand it.
 13 Q. What didn't you understand?
 14 A. A word that she wrote.
 15 Q. A word that she wrote?
 16 A. I thought it was something else when it was
 17 something else.
 18 Q. Did you get clarification of that, you know, on
 19 the next day?
 20 A. Yes. Right before class began I came and
 21 looked a little early, and she explained to me what it
 22 was.
 23 Q. Other than that one occasion, can you recall
 24 any other occasions on which you didn't understand what
 25 was written on the board?

1 speaks very fast. I understand her when she speaks
 2 because she said it clearly and understandable.
 3 Q. What made her such a good teacher?
 4 A. Her attitude about teaching, especially at
 5 Locke. I mean, she didn't let anything -- you could
 6 tell she was there for the children, for the students.
 7 She was there to teach and she wanted to leave an
 8 impression on them, which I know she left on everybody
 9 inside that classroom, especially me, that I'm here to
 10 help you, I'm not here to hurt you. And made it very
 11 comfortable in our class.
 12 Q. Do you wish all your teachers were like your
 13 art history teacher?
 14 A. Actually, I was kind of lucky to have --
 15 majority of my teachers were like that, were pretty good
 16 teachers. I would say darn good teachers. They were
 17 actually good teachers.
 18 Q. Let me ask you a question.
 19 When your class received the textbooks in, I
 20 think it was, March 2000 --
 21 A. Yes.
 22 Q. -- did the students still prepare these reports
 23 every Monday?
 24 A. Yes.
 25 Q. And did the students still use the Internet?

1 Let me withdraw that.
 2 Did you still use the Internet and the public
 3 library to complete your reports?
 4 A. I used the Internet and my book.
 5 Q. And your book?
 6 A. Yes.
 7 Q. Did you ever go to the library after you
 8 received your book?
 9 A. No.
 10 Q. But you still --
 11 A. Only for my report, the artist report.
 12 Q. But after you received your book, you still
 13 used the Internet?
 14 A. Along with my book.
 15 Q. Do you know if other students used the Internet
 16 after students received the textbook?
 17 A. No.
 18 Q. "No" you don't know?
 19 A. I don't know.
 20 Q. Did the class change in any way, that you
 21 recall, after students received the art history
 22 textbooks?
 23 A. Yes.
 24 Q. How did it change?
 25 A. It changed. A lot of people -- we were in

1 gives you a better understanding, and she was waiting on
 2 them. She had talked to [REDACTED] the principal, about
 3 ordering the books, and she didn't put them in until the
 4 end of the second semester.
 5 Q. This is what your teacher told the class?
 6 A. Yes. That she kept writing [REDACTED] to get the
 7 books, and [REDACTED] didn't get them until the end of the
 8 first semester, going into the second.
 9 Q. Did your teacher tell you why she didn't get
 10 the books your art history teacher wanted until the
 11 second semester?
 12 A. No.
 13 Q. Do you have any understanding as to why those
 14 books weren't obtained for the school until the second
 15 semester?
 16 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.
 17 Answer only if you know.
 18 THE WITNESS: No, I don't know.
 19 BY MR. CHOATE:
 20 Q. Do you know whether there are other art history
 21 textbooks available at Locke that your teacher could
 22 have used?
 23 A. No.
 24 Q. "No" you don't know?
 25 A. I don't know.

1 groups more. We understood -- that really didn't change
 2 because she was still explaining to us. I would just
 3 say that we were in groups more. We got a lot
 4 accomplished and done within a week's time than when she
 5 would write on the board, because instead of her taking
 6 the time out and spending all that time writing and not
 7 lecturing, she would tell us turn to a page and we'd
 8 read together and then she would lecture on it, so we
 9 got a lot done.
 10 Q. But you still learned a lot, though, even
 11 before you got the books, didn't you?
 12 A. Oh, yes.
 13 Q. Do you know why students in your art history
 14 class didn't have textbooks for the first semester and
 15 for that beginning portion of the second semester?
 16 A. No.
 17 Q. Did you ever ask your art history teacher why
 18 students didn't have books?
 19 A. No.
 20 Q. Did your art history teacher ever tell you why
 21 students in your class didn't have books?
 22 A. I think she said, one occasion I think I can
 23 remember, she said something about the books that she
 24 wanted for the class were -- what did she say? The
 25 books, the ones she wanted, were the best books and

1 Q. I think you'd indicated that your art history
 2 teacher told the class that she had asked [REDACTED] for
 3 the textbooks that she wanted to use.
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. Do you know whether there were other textbooks
 6 that your teacher ever talked about using?
 7 A. No, I don't know.
 8 Q. Do you have any complaints about your art
 9 history class?
 10 A. No.
 11 Q. Did you take the AP exam? If you recall.
 12 A. I can't remember if I took it. I remember
 13 paying for it, but I don't remember taking it because I
 14 paid for my English one and I forgot to take it.
 15 Q. You forgot to take your English test?
 16 A. My AP English test.
 17 Q. We talked about, in terms of your 11th grade
 18 year, your algebra class and your AP art history class.
 19 Aside from those two classes, were there any other
 20 classes during your 11th grade year in which students
 21 didn't have textbooks to use in class?
 22 A. No. Except my U.S. history class. That class
 23 they issued us a book, but -- there was no problem with
 24 that, but -- the only book we had was the one we took
 25 home, so we had to bring it every day, bring the books

1 to school and take it home.
 2 Q. I'm confused. The students in your U.S.
 3 history class were each issued a textbook?
 4 A. Yes.
 5 Q. And that was a textbook that you were supposed
 6 to use in class and then take home and bring back the
 7 next day?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. Were you issued a textbook in your U.S. history
 10 class in the beginning of the year?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 Q. Do you have any complaints about that textbook?
 13 A. No.
 14 Q. All the students in your U.S. history class,
 15 though, had a textbook to use in class; right?
 16 A. Yes. Except like in the middle of the
 17 semester, when everyone was starting to finish checking
 18 in, some didn't have books, so she had to get more from
 19 the book room. And they were basically for the people
 20 that was checking out, waiting for them to give their
 21 books in. They were, like, majority of 11th graders
 22 checking out of Locke. So she had to wait approximately
 23 three weeks to get a book for the students that had just
 24 checked into her class.
 25 Q. This is the first semester of your 11th grade

1 year?
 2 A. My first semester of my 11th grade year.
 3 Q. Was it at the beginning of the semester?
 4 A. Beginning of the semester.
 5 Q. At the beginning of the semester there were
 6 some additional students that joined the U.S. history
 7 class and those students didn't have books initially?
 8 A. Yes.
 9 Q. How many students were there?
 10 A. In my U.S. history class all together or
 11 checked in?
 12 Q. How many additional students checked into your
 13 U.S. history class after it started?
 14 A. About five.
 15 Q. And your teacher had to order additional
 16 textbooks from the textbook room for those five
 17 students?
 18 A. Yes.
 19 Q. And how long did that take, approximately?
 20 A. About three weeks.
 21 Q. Do you have any idea why it took three weeks?
 22 A. No.
 23 Q. During those three weeks what did those five
 24 students do for textbooks?
 25 MS. KOTT: Objection. Calls for speculation.

1 BY MR. CHOATE:
 2 Q. If you know.
 3 A. Shared books with the students that bring their
 4 book that day.
 5 Q. So each of those five students were able to
 6 share books in class?
 7 A. As far as homework, they were -- I don't know
 8 what they did for homework.
 9 Q. Do you know whether your U.S. history teacher
 10 provided photocopies of the textbook to those students?
 11 A. No, I do not know.
 12 MS. KOTT: Did you want to take another break?
 13 THE WITNESS: Yes.
 14 BY MR. CHOATE:
 15 Q. Do you want to take a little break?
 16 A. Yes.
 17 (Brief recess.)
 18 MR. CHOATE: Back on the record.
 19 During the break I conferred with
 20 Ms. Perkins-Ali and Ms. Kott, and Ms. Perkins-Ali has
 21 requested that we end today's session because she has an
 22 exam tomorrow for which she has to prepare. I am
 23 amenable to ending the deposition today.
 24 Ms. Perkins-Ali indicated she would find a few
 25 alternative dates in the second half of December on

1 which she was available. Ms. Perkins-Ali will provide
 2 those dates to Ms. Kott and Ms. Kott will let me know,
 3 and we will find an agreeable date in the latter half of
 4 December to conclude this deposition.
 5 I also asked earlier in the deposition
 6 Ms. Perkins-Ali to conduct another search for documents
 7 responsive to the request for documents, and she agreed
 8 to do so.
 9 Q. Ms. Perkins-Ali, will you able to do that
 10 before our next session of deposition?
 11 A. Yes.
 12 MR. CHOATE: The deposition is not closed at
 13 this time. Let's get a stipulation on the record,
 14 though, for the preparation of this transcript.
 15 MS. KOTT: Sure.
 16 MR. CHOATE: Can we stipulate that copies of
 17 documents attached to this deposition may be used as
 18 originals and that the original of this deposition be
 19 signed under penalty of perjury; that the reporter is
 20 relieved of his responsibilities under the applicable
 21 statutes for maintaining the original deposition
 22 transcript; that the original will be delivered to my
 23 office; that the witness will have 30 days from the date
 24 of the court reporter's transmittal letter to correct
 25 and sign the deposition?

1 MS. KOTT: Yes.
 2 MR. CHOATE: And that Ms. Kott will notify all
 3 parties in writing of any changes in the deposition; and
 4 that if there are no such changes communicated within
 5 that time, that any unsigned, uncorrected copy may be
 6 used for all purposes in this litigation or any
 7 proceeding related thereto.
 8 MS. KOTT: Yes.
 9 MR. CHOATE: So stipulated.
 10 MS. SHARGEL: We would like copies of the
 11 deposition transcript as well.
 12 THE REPORTER: So stipulated?
 13 MS. SHARGEL: So stipulated.
 14 MS. KOTT: And can I get a rough e-mailed to
 15 me? And I'd like a copy and a disk.
 16 (Whereupon at the hour of 3:30 p.m. the
 17 deposition was adjourned.)
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1
 2 I, Philip D. Norris, a Certified Shorthand Reporter
 3 for the State of California, do hereby certify:
 4 That prior to being examined, Natalie Perkins-Ali,
 5 the witness named in the foregoing deposition, was by me
 6 duly sworn to testify the truth;
 7 That said deposition was taken before me pursuant
 8 to notice, at the time and place therein set forth, and
 9 was taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced
 10 to typewriting via computer-aided transcription under my
 11 direction;
 12 I further certify that I am neither counsel for,
 13 nor related to, any party to said action, nor in anywise
 14 interested in the outcome thereof.
 15 In witness whereof, I have hereunto subscribed my
 16 name this day of , 2001.
 17
 18
 19 Philip D. Norris
 20 CSR NO. 4980
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

1 Declaration
 2
 3
 4
 5 I hereby declare I am the deponent in the within
 6 matter; that I have read the foregoing deposition and
 7 know the contents thereof, and I declare that the same
 8 is true of my knowledge, except as to the matters which
 9 are therein stated upon my information or belief, and as
 10 to those matters, I believe it to be true.
 11 I declare under the penalties of perjury of the
 12 State of California that the foregoing is true and
 13 correct.
 14 Executed on the day of , 2001
 15 at , California.
 16
 17
 18

Witness

19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25